

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

+ + + + +

THE PRESIDENT'S INITIATIVE ON RACE

+ + + + +

COMMUNITY FORUM

+ + + + +

WEDNESDAY

JANUARY 14, 1998

+ + + + +

The Advisory Board met in the Academy Auditorium, at the Phoenix Preparatory Academy, 735 East Fillmore Street, Phoenix, Arizona at 4:00 p.m., Dr. John Hope Franklin, Chair, presiding.

PRESENT

JOHN HOPE FRANKLIN, Ph.D.	Chair
ROBERT THOMAS	Board Member
LINDA CHAVEZ-THOMPSON	Board Member
ANGELA OH	Board Member
GOVERNOR WILLIAM WINTER	Board Member
JUDITH A. WINSTON	Executive Director

ALSO PRESENT:

GRANT WOODS, State of Arizona Attorney General
MARY ROSE WILCOX, Maricopa County Supervisor
FRANK CAMACHO, Moderator

C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S

<u>SPEAKER</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
SUPERVISOR MARY WILCOX	5
ATTORNEY GENERAL GRANT WOODS	10
MR. STEPHEN MONTOYA	21
REV. OSCAR TILLMAN	23
<u>AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION</u>	25

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

(4:00 p.m.)

MS. WINSTON: Good afternoon.

My name is Judith Winston, I'm the Executive Director of the One America, the President's Initiative on Race. We had planned to start this session at 4:00 p.m. However, we know that several of the local news stations indicated that this meeting was to start at 4:15 and in fairness to those who believe we were starting at 4:15 we wanted to wait just another few minutes to give everyone a chance to get in and get seated, but we will start the program no later than 4:15.

So if you would like to take seats, we will start in approximately five minutes.

(Off the record.)

CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Good afternoon. I want to welcome you to this final portion of our Advisory Board meeting in Phoenix. As I said before, we are very delighted to be here in the Southwest. During our visit to Phoenix, we've had an opportunity to visit some sites in the community and talk with some of the people of Phoenix.

This has been a rare, wonderful accelerating experience. The Advisory Board included this community forum in its formal Board meeting so that we can hear from you, the citizens of Phoenix,

1 about the race related issues that concern you but
2 before we hear from you, I would like first to
3 introduce Maricopa County's Supervisor, Mary Rose
4 Wilcox, who will make some remarks. Supervisor
5 Wilcox.

6 (Applause)

7 The Supervisor was elected to the Maricopa
8 County Board of Supervisors in November 1992. She has
9 devoted her career to public service and has
10 experience with housing relocation, job placement, job
11 training, small business development and has been
12 active in numerous community activities. She
13 currently serves as Vice Chair for the National
14 Association of Counties, Community and Economic
15 Development Policy Committee and is a member of the
16 Mexican-American Legal Defense and Education Fund.

17 Since 1988 she's been on the Board of both
18 the National Council of Loras (ph) and the National
19 Association of Latino Elected and Appointed Officials.
20 Thank you for joining me in welcoming Supervisor
21 Wilcox.

22 (Applause)

23 STATEMENT OF SUPERVISOR MARY ROSE WILCOX

24 SUPERVISOR WILCOX: Thank you very much.
25 I would like to start my presentation and small
26 presentation by first of all thanking the President
27 for empaneling you all and thanking you for being here

1 today. I also would like to thank each and every one
2 of you in attendance today. This is an extremely
3 important issue and I'm very glad that all of you
4 showed up to express your views.

5 Let me start my remarks by saying the
6 issues related to race in America and in Arizona are
7 very broad. They effect all segments of our society.
8 Race in Arizona effects our judicial system. For
9 example, out of 65 Superior Court judges only five are
10 of Hispanic background. Race in Arizona effects our
11 educational system very very strongly.

12 For example, after this year on the Board
13 of Regents, a board that oversees all of our state run
14 universities, we will have no person of color on that
15 board. The point is, as a minority in Arizona, race
16 comes into play in virtually all institutions of
17 government and the private sector.

18 For my presentation today I feel very
19 saddened but I feel that I must share with you
20 minorities' growing concern in Arizona about the
21 negative relationship between enforcement officials at
22 the national level and local level as they relate to
23 minorities.

24 (Applause)

25 I want to do so by illustrating a few real
26 life examples where we feel race was a factor in how
27 enforcement officials dealt with our minority

1 community and specifically a lot of our minority
2 youth. Let me talk about these incidents and I'll try
3 to be very brief.

4 We had an African American gentleman,
5 Edward Mallet. He was a double amputee who just
6 happened to have a very nice car and was driving in an
7 area that was predominantly white. For no
8 transgression because they never did cite him for
9 anything, he was stopped. There was an altercation
10 and consequently Mr. Mallet was killed in a choke
11 hold. It was never explained what exactly happened by
12 we firmly believe that race was a factor.

13 Rudy Buchanan, a Hispanic and African
14 American youth was shot at 98 times in the middle of
15 a housing project and we know all our kids aren't
16 excellent kids, but Rudy Buchanan was shot at by 13
17 officers, 98 times and 33 bullets entered his body and
18 he was killed.

19 Julio Varillo, a very young, young person,
20 15 years old whose mother called law enforcement to
21 calm Julio down. He was having an argument with her.
22 When police arrived, law enforcement arrived, Julio
23 was running from the house, had a kitchen knife with
24 him and was surrounded and was shot, was shot 40
25 times. Julio is now dead and his family is suffering.

26 The Scottsdale Police, law enforcement
27 officials, we had an incident here and I'm not sure if

1 you've heard about it but I'm sure you will today. We
2 had a Hispanic officer who had finally had enough and
3 surfaced police practices against minorities. When he
4 surfaced this, he was ostracized, he was fired and he
5 had the courage to go before the courts of our land.
6 A jury award of \$100,000.00 was issued to him and
7 practices of the Scottsdale Police became public.

8 The Chandler Police Department, and I'm
9 sure many of you, because this made international and
10 national news, teamed up with federal enforcement and
11 rounded up American citizens, American citizens based
12 on skin color and through the efforts of a very good
13 investigation by Attorney General Grant Woods, we find
14 out that not only skin color but body odor and
15 anything that they could think of as long as you
16 weren't the right color. They were rounded up, many
17 deported and many treated not as American citizens
18 should be treated.

19 Racism is evident in Arizona in all
20 segments and most predominantly this has spread to
21 some of our enforcement officials. We must do
22 something about this. Many people will say that this
23 is just a political ploy by the President, the panel
24 that sits before us today. I don't believe that to be
25 the case. I stand strongly and firmly in admiration
26 that our President has the courage to bring the issues
27 of race relations in America to the forefront. By

1 this panel being here today, you cast light on the
2 issue of racism.

3 Our President has dared to talk about this
4 most emotional issue. If it does anything, the
5 President's initiative brings a debate to light and
6 brings our nation closer together by talking about it,
7 admitting it and going beyond racism. I encourage
8 members of our community to talk openly about your
9 personal experiences. Your input is valuable and
10 should be thoughtful.

11 The ultimate goal of all of us should be
12 to stop prejudice and speak out loudly against anyone
13 who practices discrimination or seeks to hurt groups
14 of people of a different race --

15 (Applause)

16 -- or seeks to hurt people, whether they
17 be of different race, different religion, different
18 ethnic group or sexual orientation. I sincerely
19 believe that we're all committed to help build one
20 America in the 21st century. That's our hope. My
21 husband and I have four grandchildren. We will not
22 tolerate for our grandsons racism or racial attacks
23 against them and I don't believe any parents or
24 grandparents will. America needs to confront this
25 problem. We need to bring it out in the open. I
26 commend your panel for listening to America and hope
27 that the results you take back to the President will

1 bring about policies that bring an end to this, but
2 more importantly the awareness and America being aware
3 of this, having it come out into the open will stop
4 this once and for all and have us all recognize that
5 we are a great country and that we all deserve
6 everything that America has always promised. Thank
7 you very much.

8 (Applause)

9 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Thank you, Supervisor
10 Wilcox. We are very grateful to you for your remarks
11 and we are encouraged and heartened really by
12 encouragement. We have next the chief law
13 enforcement officer of the state of Arizona, Attorney
14 General Grant Woods. As you know he has been in the
15 forefront of many of these actions, particularly
16 investing and writing a report on the incident which
17 Supervisor Wilcox referred, the incident in Chandler.

18 He also was prominent as one of the
19 attendants of the Hate Crimes Conference that the
20 President held in Washington several weeks ago. We
21 are very, very delighted, honored and pleased,
22 Attorney General Woods, that you have taken the time
23 to come and be with us this afternoon. I want to
24 welcome you on behalf of the Board. Thank you.

25 (Applause)

26 STATEMENT OF ATTORNEY GENERAL GRANT WOODS

27 ATTORNEY GENERAL WOODS: Thank you very

1 much. I appreciate the invitation to be part of this
2 and I hope that what you found so far in Arizona has
3 been productive and that it will add to the national
4 dialogue. I trust that it will. I think -- I'm not
5 exactly sure why Arizona was picked and from what I
6 gather I don't know that you all know exactly sure why
7 it was picked, but it was picked and here we are. So
8 now that we're here I think we can recognize that it
9 was a good choice.

10 And it's a good choice, I believe, because
11 Arizona, I think, is a good microcosm of the United
12 States when it comes to these issues. Arizona is a
13 very diverse state. It's a diverse state racially.
14 It's ethnicity is many varied. We have a diverse
15 state religiously. We are -- to be an Arizonian is to
16 be Hispanic, is to be Native American, is to be Anglo,
17 is to be African American, it's to be Mormon or
18 Catholic or Protestant or Jew.

19 We have a wide range of different cultures
20 and different people that live here and have always
21 lived here in this state. We have racial problems in
22 Arizona. What I believe is that Arizona does a good
23 job at least in its recent history of trying to take
24 the very difficult step of having people solve
25 problems rather than cause problems or ignore
26 problems.

27 It's the duty, I believe of government,

1 the duty and responsibility of government to try to
2 solve these problems as best they can. We understand
3 that many --

4 (Applause)

5 We understand that many of these problems
6 have to do with human beings and human nature and
7 there's only so much we can do but we do live in a
8 country and in a state that revolves around its
9 constitution and its basic guarantees and its basic
10 rights and it's the obligation of government to
11 enforce those rights. I'd like to point out to you a
12 few areas where Arizona, which is politically at least
13 as reflected by its state legislature and its recent
14 governors a conservative state.

15 Even in this conservative state we've been
16 able to make great gains in many areas. We had a real
17 problem and a real struggle on the Martin Luther King
18 holiday, but I would point out we're the only state in
19 the union that passed a Martin Luther King holiday by
20 a vote of the people and it was a tough job, but we
21 did it.

22 (Applause)

23 We're one of the few states that allows
24 the state government itself, the attorney general's
25 office, to actively, pro-actively enforce housing laws
26 and that's not just in a general small way, that's in
27 a big way. That's if we're talking about housing

1 discrimination be it rental or buying or mortgage
2 lending or advertising, we've been active in all of
3 those areas and the reality is most states aren't, but
4 Arizona is even with a conservative government.

5 And the authority for that came about in
6 the '90's with these same conservative leaders in
7 charge. They gave the authority to us. We have the
8 authority in employment which you have been looking at
9 over the past two days. We've focused on lending
10 which is a very big issue in this country and I hope
11 that you'll look at that as well as part of your
12 efforts. We've found recently here in the last 60
13 days in Arizona, that one lending institution,
14 actually one of the largest in the West, was
15 discriminating against Hispanics who lived in Arizona
16 when they applied for mortgage loans.

17 They were trying to refinance homes. They
18 were trying to live the American dream and buy their
19 first home and they were being discriminated against
20 for one reason and one reason only, because they were
21 Hispanic. And what happened there is that the
22 government in Arizona didn't turn away. They didn't
23 say, "Well, we don't care about these people, they
24 don't even speak English and this is a big giant
25 company and an important company".

26 The government of Arizona joined and the
27 legal arm of Arizona joined with these poor Hispanic

1 citizens who had no real power and they brought back
2 -- in working with the Federal Government, we brought
3 back a resolution which was unprecedented so that
4 these people got money and now we're going to have \$3
5 million set aside to be loaned specifically to
6 Hispanic residents of this county and they're going to
7 have to pay no money down. The lending institution is
8 going to pay three percent out of their own pocket for
9 all of the loans that are made with that \$3 million.

10 That's a real life effort that makes a
11 difference in people's lives.

12 (Applause)

13 We passed a hate crimes bill that the
14 Chairman mentioned. I was proud to stand up. There
15 was only one state up there with the President
16 represented from the state government and it was
17 Arizona that was there. This conservative state was
18 up there with the President speaking out against hate
19 crimes, speaking out against those who would threaten
20 or intimidate or terrify or commit assaults on people
21 because of their race or their religion or their
22 gender or hopefully at some point in time now their
23 sexual orientation or disability and if the President
24 has his way on a federal level because we passed that
25 here in Arizona and it wasn't easy.

26 Many of the people in the room fought for
27 years and years on this and we finally did it with a

1 conservative governor and a conservative legislature.
2 It can be done and now we're actively enforcing it.
3 I am the chief law enforcement officer of this state
4 and I'm proud of the police department and the men and
5 women that I serve with and all of the police officers
6 that I've dealt with over the years as attorney
7 general.

8 Having said that, it's the duty of the
9 attorney general that when police officers cross the
10 line to step in and say something about it and take
11 action against it and in Arizona we did that. We were
12 asked to do it. We had complaints about the Chandler
13 episode and, yes, Chandler has -- this incident in
14 Chandler has taken on national ramifications and I say
15 that's great. It should have.

16 Our goal was not to focus simply upon
17 Chandler for Chandler's sake. Our goal was that we
18 could work together; the Border Patrol, the Department
19 of Immigration, and the Attorney General's office and
20 we could come up with a situation which I think we
21 will have now in the future and that is what happened
22 in Chandler will never happen again in the United
23 States of America because it was a disgrace.

24 (Applause)

25 And I'm proud of the response of the
26 United States Attorney General, of the Director of the
27 Immigrations Services, of the Border Patrol and we're

1 going to work together to see that they can do their
2 job, of course. We support them doing their job if
3 they do it in a way that doesn't violate basic rights
4 of citizens.

5 Oscar Tillman is here from the NAACP. He
6 spoke out and he should have spoken out about some of
7 the things that have gone -- that were alleged to be
8 going on in the Scottsdale Police Department, but what
9 happened there is that he has engaged in a dialogue
10 and the major of that city didn't ignore what went on.
11 The mayor stepped forward and the police chief, I
12 believe, is stepping forward and I don't believe that
13 the mayor of that city is going to let the drop until
14 we know that what was alleged in that court case no
15 longer exists and that's the proper response from
16 government, not to look away, not to jump to
17 conclusions either but to investigate and then tell it
18 like it is.

19 And if there's discrimination there based
20 upon race, then it's up to the government to point it
21 out. Lastly, I'd like to -- I would like to commend
22 the President as well. This Commission has been
23 criticized as much as it's been praised and that's
24 kind of ironic to me. I will tell the people of
25 Arizona here that this Commission and the White House
26 asked me to specifically comment upon these
27 controversial areas, that they wanted this dialogue at

1 this meeting.

2 No one is trying to avoid anything at
3 least during this trip to Arizona, but I would point
4 out to the critics that this is the first president in
5 my lifetime, at least that I can remember, who has had
6 the courage to stand up and engage this dialogue, a
7 dialogue that is long overdue in the United States.

8 (Applause)

9 So lastly, I did bring this controversial
10 document here. I say that to my Republican colleagues
11 every time I speak to them on civil rights and I will
12 tell you that is every time that I speak to them and
13 I'm almost done. It's almost eight years and I've
14 talked about civil rights every place I've gone, every
15 time because I promised myself I would. It's not a
16 Republican or Democrat issue. It's an American issue.
17 And this --

18 (Applause)

19 When people want to know why is the
20 President involved in this, why is the Commission
21 involved, why are we continuing to have the Federal
22 Government involved in a very serious way in these
23 areas? Why is the Attorney General's office in
24 Arizona made this one of its very top priorities
25 throughout the '90's? Why were we involved in
26 Chandler? Why are we involved in housing, in lending,
27 in advertising, in public accommodations and

1 employment? The reason is, I think, in this
2 controversial document which many people talk about
3 but very few follow, it's the Declaration of
4 Independence for this country and I'm going to just
5 leave you with two sentences from it.

6 The first one is very famous. The second
7 isn't as famous. I'd like for you to focus upon the
8 second. The first one is, "We hold these truths to be
9 self-evident, that all men are created equal, that
10 they are endowed by their Creator with certain
11 unalienable rights, that among these are life, liberty
12 and the pursuit of happiness". And the very next line
13 is, "That to secure these rights, governments are
14 instituted among men deriving their just powers from
15 the consent of the government".

16 So when people ask why, our founding
17 fathers said, "This is the purpose of the government,
18 to secure these basic human rights that are not given
19 by government but should be protected by government
20 first and foremost, now and always". Thank you.

21 (Applause)

22 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: You have indicated by
23 your applause your great appreciation for the remarks
24 both of Supervisor Wilcox and Attorney General Woods.
25 I want to add that I am very inspired and very moved
26 and very delighted that they have come to us and
27 spoken with us at this session. Thank you very much,

1 Supervisor Wilcox and Attorney General Woods.

2 Now, I'd like to introduce the moderator
3 for the community forum this afternoon. It is Frank
4 Comacho. I'm sure many of you recognize Frank from
5 Channel 3, KTVK of which he is the weekend news co-
6 anchor. He is a native of Phoenix. He's had
7 extensive experience working in the news media. His
8 experience has garnered several Arizona Press Club
9 Awards. Prior to getting in the broadcasting field,
10 he worked as community development manager for the
11 Phoenix Chamber of Commerce and spent seven years as
12 the Phoenix Police dispatcher.

13 I'll turn over the forum to him so that we
14 can begin. I know that I speak for the entire
15 Advisory Board when I say we know there are many local
16 issues that we have not heard or we've just heard a
17 little about and we're looking forward to receiving
18 your contributions to this meeting. It's yours,
19 Frank, and it's yours, Audience. Thank you.

20 (Applause)

21 MR. COMACHO: Thank you Doctor Franklin.
22 Welcome to you all and we are running out of time so
23 we want to get this going as quickly as possible and
24 before we do, there are several ground rules that we
25 want to lay down. One is the fact that because of the
26 time restrictions we would like for you to; A) when
27 you do speak, please make your point as quickly as you

1 can and succinctly as you can, and we will have a two-
2 minute limit because we understand there are a lot of
3 people who wish to speak.

4 And the Advisory Board's primary role in
5 this forum is to listen and the only way we can do
6 that is if we can get everybody to go ahead and say
7 what they need to say, but to do it as quickly as
8 possible and as respectfully as possible.

9 Before we begin to receive some of the
10 comments from all of you in the community, we do want
11 to touch upon several issues that have already been
12 brought up by Mary Rose Grant Woods and that has to do
13 with some of the issues that we've been facing here in
14 our community the past year especially.

15 The first one probably there's been no
16 more contentious issue than the raid in Chandler. I
17 can't -- I'm a native here in Phoenix and I can't
18 remember one issue that has divided this community and
19 has shocked and sickened this community as much as the
20 raid in Chandler. And to speak on that, I'd like to
21 introduce the attorney who is on behalf of the
22 plaintiffs in a class action suit that's been brought
23 against the Chandler Police Department and the Border
24 Patrol, Mr. Stephen Montoya. Stephen?

25 (Applause)

26 STATEMENT OF MR. STEPHEN MONTOYA

27 MR. MONTOYA: Thank you. I would like to

1 welcome you. I think what happened in Chandler has
2 been well-visited by the Attorney General's report.
3 I think it is a mistake to look at the Chandler
4 episode as something unique in our state
5 unfortunately. In fact, I think it's all too
6 characteristic of the behavior of our state and the
7 several municipalities within our state.

8 (Applause)

9 I think it is wonderful that the President
10 has launched this initiative. However, I think that
11 there is an appalling absence in reference to this
12 initiative and with the exception of Supervisor Wilcox
13 and Attorney General Grant Woods, where is a
14 representative from the executive branch of our state?
15 Most of the racism that we suffer here in Arizona is
16 -- has its origins in the actions of state and local
17 governments.

18 (Applause)

19 I think it behooves the chief executive
20 of the state of Arizona, Governor Jane Hull, whom I
21 greatly respect, to start her own initiative regarding
22 race so we can clean up our state governments, and so
23 we can clean up our municipal governments and I would
24 also call upon the Advisory Board to review the
25 Federal Government's prerogatives under Title 6 of the
26 Civil Rights Act of 1964.

27 For so many municipalities and for a state

1 to be guilty of so many acts of racism but to
2 nevertheless be able to enjoy huge amounts of federal
3 monies in violation of Title 6 of the Civil Rights Act
4 of 1964, I think is appalling. But my main point is
5 I think that we are playing Hamlet without the prince.
6 Governor Hull should be here. Governor Hull should
7 launch her own initiative regarding race. We need to
8 start at home.

9 I think that this debate is national but
10 it's also local and I think that we need to direct our
11 attention to the public servants that we pay and that
12 we elected, namely our state and local elected
13 officials and make them step up to the plate and face
14 the type of responsibility that anyone in the private
15 sector would invariably and inevitably face. Thank
16 you.

17 (Applause)

18 MR. COMACHO: Another issue that was
19 touched upon earlier in the remarks by Mr. Woods and
20 Ms. Wilcox had to do with the situation in Scottsdale.
21 That is one of several that has -- that have been
22 alleged against various police departments around the
23 Valley and one of those who have been the leading
24 force or leading voices, I should say has been the
25 Reverend Oscar Tillman from the NAACP and Reverend
26 Tillman, if you would.

27 (Applause)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27

STATEMENT OF REV. OSCAR TILLMAN

REV. TILLMAN: Thank you and I'll be very brief because I think enough has been said. We need to see some action. I'm very disappointed in the lack of leadership that has been in this state in dealing with this issue. I am extremely disappointed today to find that the Chief of Police of Scottsdale has been replaced temporarily by a person that I think would not need to be there and that is the person who will be acting in his stead now that he's resigning.

I think that we have a serious problem here. We have it in Phoenix since 1990. There have been over 40 people killed, shot by the Phoenix Police. Not one of those police officers have ever been charged. We have time and time again that the police is policing themselves. The Federal Government is in a position to withhold funds until a civilian overview is done of the police departments and until that time our young people will continue to die and no one will care. Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. COMACHO: Again, as I mentioned before we do have some very strict guidelines that will be strictly enforced and that's the time limit on the remarks, on your remarks. Please bear with us and please understand that we want to hear from all of you, as many as possible.

1 In that vein, I will ask you a couple of
2 things. Number one, when you do wish to speak, if you
3 could, please move to the aisle on either aisle.
4 There are a couple of people with microphones, some
5 staffers. They will handle the microphones and I can
6 see we have a lot of folks already.

7 Also, at the beginning or the end of the
8 previous session, at the end of the previous session
9 not everyone had a chance to speak. They were
10 promised that they would get a chance to speak at this
11 general forum. We will begin with them. I think it
12 might be best if you can have a seat before we clog up
13 the aisles too much.

14 I will call on these people and if they
15 would please go ahead and make their remarks as
16 quickly as possible. Carolyn Addington, is Carolyn
17 Addington here?

18 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

19 MS. ADDINGTON: Hello. Is the microphone
20 on?

21 MR. COMACHO: Yes.

22 MS. ADDINGTON: Okay. I made a comment
23 this morning and this afternoon with a great deal more
24 inspiration and spirit and love and excitement, I
25 would like to reveal a secret that has been too long
26 hidden and a solution that has been too long behind
27 the scenes.

1 As I mentioned this morning, I know why
2 Attorney General Grant Woods that this was placed in
3 Phoenix and in Arizona, because it's about the
4 Phoenix. Colonel Bernard J. Addington, who is the
5 king of kings and the lord of lords and the light of
6 the true God in the White House, is to be revealed.
7 We have a difficulty and we have a solution. The
8 solution is in understanding race relations, in
9 understanding community development, in understanding
10 all the crimes and the hurts that have gone on, on
11 planet earth, Bernie is most capable of doing that.

12 MR. COMACHO: Excuse me, ma'am.

13 MS. ADDINGTON: He is --

14 MR. COMACHO: Excuse me, I'm sorry, but
15 this is not for political candidates.

16 MS. ADDINGTON: It isn't.

17 MR. COMACHO: This is for the community.
18 If you have a point, please make it.

19 MS. ADDINGTON: I'm going to finish it,
20 please let me.

21 MR. COMACHO: Please, make it, please.

22 MS. ADDINGTON: He is of all nations and
23 all races and he has that understanding. We have a
24 difficulty because he's tall, broad shouldered, can
25 take care of everything and has a very, very dark skin
26 but he's invisible.

27 MR. COMACHO: Ma'am, your two minutes are

1 up.

2 MS. ADDINGTON: Just a minute. He's
3 invisible.

4 MR. COMACHO: I'm sorry, ma'am. Your two
5 minutes are up. Ann Heart? Ann Heart?

6 MS. HEART: Yes, my name is Ann Heart and
7 I would like to take this opportunity as an educator
8 in this city and a concerned parent and active
9 participant in the community and the church that for
10 all constituents; leaders, CEO's, corporate leaders,
11 business people, ministers, Ph.D's, EDD's, MOO's,
12 COO's, take a position and grab ahold of the community
13 people, especially parents and get parents involved.

14 I am concerned about today's youth and
15 what is occurring in our schools that is spilling into
16 the streets and is occurring once again, back into the
17 classroom. And all of you here today on the panel, in
18 the audience, here representing each and every
19 affiliate, we need to take responsibility and take
20 charge and stand up for the leadership of our youth
21 and I hope we can do that collectively and
22 collaboratively. Thank you.

23 (Applause)

24 MR. COMACHO: Jane Jones?

25 MS. JONES: Thank you. I'm Jean Jones
26 from Arizona Public Service Company and we held over
27 from the earlier session because of several things

1 that had been presented to us about the need for the
2 private sector to accept a challenge and
3 responsibility for changing and shaping the world in
4 which we live and in which our customers live.

5 Omar DeMichael (ph) which many of you
6 know, one of his outgoing challenges for those of us
7 who remain in Arizona Public Service Company, said the
8 one thing that he did not accomplish of the many
9 wonderful things that he did do there was we did not
10 accomplish what we set out to do in terms of
11 diversity. So rather than wait for legislation or
12 anyone else to tell us what to do, we felt it was
13 important that we make change happen at the top and
14 had an opportunity to shape and change the Arizona
15 Public Service Company Board of Directors.

16 And I'm very proud to say that our
17 investors and our shareholders and our companies
18 supported us in that effort and in June of 1997, we
19 appointed four new members to our board who are
20 reflective of the community we serve. Thank you.

21 MR. COMACHO: Santos Vega?

22 DR. VEGA: I'm Santos Vega from Hispanic
23 Research Center at Arizona State University and
24 there's three questions here from the Board. And I'm
25 not sure if it's the same board that was in this
26 morning. What I had down was follow up from those
27 presentations. There are three questions. In order

1 to solve racial issues and problems and prejudice if
2 you could keep in mind that much of this pattern of
3 behavior begin at the elementary schools and that many
4 times the schools find themselves being prejudiced by
5 systemic institutions.

6 For example, the funding of schools in
7 Arizona has for many, many, many years been unfair so
8 that some kids don't have the same type of equipment
9 or classroom space or books, that sort of thing. So
10 one area that needs to be looked at is that the youth
11 and the funding, in order to avoid dropouts and
12 prejudice later on, because in this country -- this
13 morning a lady said, "The fourth question we always
14 ask is where do you work", not only your name and who
15 you are, but where do you work.

16 And we seem to be sending so many of our
17 youth either into low working positions or prisons.
18 And so that brings me to the second point, there needs
19 to be done an analysis of the Board that we have a
20 behavior in America of downgrading all manual labor
21 and people that work with their hands. So we can
22 start to look at how we can create vocational schools,
23 vocational schools that will prepare youth with the
24 right skills in order to gain better employment and
25 the third is that we don't seem to put any money into
26 adult education in the communities.

27 We need to help people get reskilled

1 because of the tremendous change in technology. So if
2 we want to stop prejudice and discrimination, we need
3 to look at the systemic causes of these issues and
4 problems. Thank you.

5 MR. COMACHO: Doctor Vega, thank you.

6 (Applause)

7 MR. COMACHO: Rosalia Garcia?

8 MS. GARCIA: I am Rosalia Garcia. I'm a
9 citizen and a native born Arizonian and one of my
10 issues is I'm a small business owner in Chandler,
11 Arizona. I was a bilingual elementary school teacher
12 for nine years. Anyway my thing that I worry about is
13 redevelopment in our cities and I tend to feel that
14 redevelopment of inner-cities and downtown areas
15 particularly in Chandler, effect communities and they
16 effect people and I think that was one of the basis
17 for the sweeps. Thank you.

18 MR. COMACHO: Thank you.

19 (Applause)

20 MR. COMACHO: Roger Axford?

21 DR. AXFORD: Thank you. I'm Doctor Roger
22 Axford. Doctor Franklin and Mr. Comacho, I'm a
23 emeritus professor at Arizona State University, the
24 author of four books called Black American Heros,
25 Spanish Speaking Heros, Native Americans and Too Long
26 Silent Japanese Americans Speak Out.

27 One of the reasons the President sent us

1 here, sent this committee is because there were two
2 concentration camps in this state. Now, a message
3 back to the President; would you carry this to him
4 Doctor Franklin, my colleague from the University of
5 Chicago? Ask him to release Peter McDonald in the
6 interest of human relations and race relations.
7 Return him to the reservation to let him die there.
8 Don't make a Geronimo out of him.

9 Number two, you wanted to know, Doctor
10 Franklin, where you could get the money. Take \$100
11 billion from the Pentagon and put it in race
12 relations. It's real simple.

13 (Applause)

14 Number three, take this back to the
15 President. In the interest of human relations, stop
16 making land mines and sign the treaty with the 105
17 other nations and got out of bed with Husaan. He's in
18 bed with Husaan. Stop making land mines.

19 (Applause)

20 Number four, I will give anyone a copy of
21 an article called by Diane Post, if you haven't read
22 it, read it today, Dianna Post is the NAACP Redress
23 Committee and it's called "It's Time for Whites to
24 Apologize and to Pay for Slavery". That will shake us
25 up. That will shake us up.

26 Those are the four points and I think that
27 will keep you busy and the President, too.

1 MR. COMACHO: Jess Toros?

2 MR. TOROS: My name is Jess Toros and I
3 was the Hispanic officer for the City of Scottsdale
4 that sued and reported civil rights violations.

5 (Applause)

6 I appreciate those applause but, believe
7 me, the people that deserve them are the three young
8 Hispanics that were face down in the dirt that I spoke
9 of and the young Black man, who had a gun to his chest
10 and was called derogatory names. I don't have to be
11 Black or African American to know that the term
12 "nigger" or "no nigger zone" is offensive. I don't
13 have to be female to know that "bitch" and "cunt" are
14 offensive.

15 I don't have to be Hispanic to know that
16 the term "taco" used for supervisors that are Hispanic
17 in the Scottsdale Police Department is offensive. I
18 merely have to be human.

19 (Applause)

20 There has to be consequences for these
21 individuals that do these acts and I appreciate
22 Attorney General Grant Woods saying that they are
23 alleged, but if you need a witness, Attorney General,
24 I am here. So are a lot of other police officers.

25 (Applause)

26 Mr. Thomas, you said that it takes courage
27 in the board room to stand up. I can guarantee you

1 that my \$36,000.00 a year that supported five people
2 meant as much to me as your six-figure income.

3 (Applause)

4 I would ask this Board to take back that
5 there has to be consequences to municipalities that
6 violate people's civil rights and do what is wrong and
7 it can be on the federal level. If you hold one week
8 of federal subsidized taxes to the road improvement or
9 highway improvement to any municipality and to the
10 private sector, if you decided to go ahead and pull
11 out of that community when these things are proven in
12 court, that would again, turn the tide here. Thank
13 you.

14 (Applause)

15 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, Mr. Toros.
16 Sharon Robertson?

17 MS. ROBERTSON: Hello. I'm Sharon
18 Robertson and I just had a couple comments from the
19 previous panel. I agree with Mr. Russell that you
20 should send the good old boys back to school, but
21 further I think my recommendation to the President is
22 that we mandate and implement programs in the grade
23 schools starting with Head Start that teach cultural
24 sensitivity, diversity and teaching tolerance in all
25 public schools and any school that gets federal
26 funding.

27 And as Ms. Dewey said also, we need not to

1 set a program but to set policy and procedures that
2 are progressive.

3 (Applause)

4 MR. COMACHO: Thank you. Gene Parrish?

5 MR. PARRISH: My name is Gene Parrish.
6 I'm a psychologist, educator and a member of the
7 Maricopa Branch of NAACP. For 30 years I've been
8 engaged actively in the awareness and sensitivity
9 relative to this issue and 30 years later we're still
10 here talking about the awareness of it. My conclusion
11 is that on the whole, white males in particular, must
12 address their fear of having to compete on a level
13 playing field in the workplace.

14 They must also get psychological help, if
15 necessary, for their displaced anger and hostility
16 towards the ever-changing trends in this country as
17 well as the world. The answer cannot be found through
18 joining militia hate groups and bombing public
19 facilities. The answer is in racial, ethnic and
20 gender inclusion. Thank you.

21 (Applause)

22 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, Mr. Parrish.
23 Jerry Span, I'm sorry, Jerry Span.

24 MR. SPAN: I'm Jerry Span, an Arizona
25 citizen. I'm 62 years old. I have a lot of brothers
26 and sisters that's pretty close behind my age. I've
27 been in Arizona pretty much my whole life and I can

1 say a lot of good things about Arizona because Arizona
2 is my state and there's a lot of good stuff, but I'm
3 not here to talk about the good things. I'm here to
4 tell you about the troubles that Arizona has about the
5 criminals that's doing things in office, certain ones,
6 just a handful.

7 Once they're gone everything will be
8 probably fine. Myself, I'm part Indian, I'm part
9 Hispanic, I'm part Black and I'm part White. And
10 since God made me, I'm proud to be what I am. And
11 what's happening in Arizona, there's a lot of people
12 getting treated wrongly. And my neighborhood, where
13 I live was all Hispanic people, Black people, White
14 people and they didn't have a lot of money but they
15 had neighborhood called the Golden Gate.

16 And the city decided they wanted that land
17 for themselves to redevelop and make money on and
18 build buildings on. So they come and they took the
19 land from the people, that's fine. Some of the people
20 they treated right and there's a whole bunch of them
21 they didn't treat right at all because we were told
22 that we are dumb Mexicans that can't take care of
23 ourself. That we don't know how to fight for our
24 rights in court because we're too dumb. We don't have
25 money. We don't have no help. We are stupid
26 Mexicans.

27 MR. COMACHO: Mr. Span, two minutes, sir.

1 MR. SPAN: I didn't get to say what
2 happened.

3 MR. COMACHO: Well, if I may remind
4 everyone here that there is brochures out in the lobby
5 and that if you do want to go ahead and complete your
6 statement, you can write to the Board and they will
7 include it in the record.

8 MR. SPAN: Well, there needs a government
9 investigation on this and we have information and
10 facts and everything else that we can show.

11 MR. COMACHO: I'm sure if you'll provide
12 it to them, sir, they'll do something with it. Thank
13 you very much, sir.

14 MR. SPAN: My phone number is 273-1903.

15 MR. COMACHO: Sure, if you'll include that
16 in your information, somebody will get in touch with
17 you.

18 MR. SPAN: And the Board, if you'd please
19 call me and I'll give you information that shows
20 what's going on out here.

21 MR. COMACHO: Thank you very much, sir.

22 MR. SPAN: 273-1903.

23 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, sir.

24 (Applause)

25 MR. COMACHO: Sir.

26 MR. GATABI: (ph) (Statement in Spanish)

27 (Applause)

1 MR. COMACHO: Yes, sir.

2 MR. GUERRERO: Good afternoon. My name is
3 Nicholas Guerrero. I'm a senior at Tucson High School
4 in Tucson, Arizona. I commend the Advisory Board for
5 being here today. As a youth, I found one solution
6 where you can break down racial barriers and
7 misconceptions. This intensive program, which is
8 sponsored by the National Conference ECCJ that's
9 called Any Town. Any Town is an atmosphere for
10 growing, expanding and uniting.

11 There were several stages that I went
12 through. One was getting to know my peers and
13 breaking down those stereotypes. The second was
14 getting a clear perception of who I am. I learned
15 what we hope, fear and seek binds us together. Any
16 Town had made a dream of harmony become a unifying
17 reality. Watch how vegetables, fruit, flowers grow in
18 the same garden. That garden is unity. We, as the
19 people of this nation, must surpass any barriers and
20 educate each other about individuals and not about
21 groups of people.

22 This is why I urge you to support Any Town
23 through funding. Any Town cannot do it without you.
24 Please. Thank you.

25 (Applause)

26 MR. COMACHO: Thank you.

27 MR. MEYERS: Good afternoon, again. I'm

1 Jesse Meyers and I'm still Jesse Meyers. I was told
2 that I could finish and someone from the staff would
3 talk to me. And so I tried to talk to somebody from
4 that staff and she said, "We don't want to hear that".
5 She sure did, Ms. Gonzales, if you're going to look at
6 me strange like I'm making up stuff.

7 And so I went through the trouble of going
8 to get the information, my documentation and showed
9 her part of it. "I still don't want to see this".
10 And she said, "This is a listening session for
11 President Clinton". And she said, "We can't do
12 anything about your problem". And I said, "Isn't he
13 the President? Isn't he the one that put the federal
14 judge -- he's the one that put -- Judge Carroll is a
15 Democratic appointee.

16 The person that fired me, Robert Persano
17 is a Democratic appointee and the Judge Jack Saliu
18 (ph), who will not make a determination on my firing
19 case, he's an employee of the U.S. Government. What
20 is President Clinton there for, just to have something
21 to watch on television?

22 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, sir.

23 (Applause)

24 MR. KING: (Speaks Navajo) My name is
25 Aaron King and I'm Native American and Filipino. I'm
26 going to go ahead and introduce myself like I was told
27 by my elders. Again, my name is Aaron King. I come

1 from Akma Altim (ph) which is Gila River Pima and I'm
2 Danaia (ph) which is Navajo born from the Kinklachini
3 (ph) and Kianni (ph) clans, that's the Red House and
4 the Towering clans. I was taught to introduce myself
5 this way in order to pay respects to all my listeners
6 and all my ancestors which grant me this chance.

7 I'm also here, like my brother before me,
8 to speak about Any Town. Any Town is a good program.
9 Any Town, it's hard to sum up the experience you go
10 through in this camp because it's a place in your
11 heart that you always wanted to be. Any Town promotes
12 unity. I could be considered bi-racial. If the
13 government forces me to choose, I could be considered
14 Native American or Filipino. I could be considered an
15 urban Indian but I am an individual and I believe
16 that's where it starts with each and every one of us
17 in here and that's what the solution is going to be.

18 That's what Any Town provides, a chance to
19 be an individual and I will just kind of wrap it up
20 here. Everybody is in my prayers and I invite anybody
21 to find out about Any Town and come up to camp. Thank
22 you.

23 MR. COMACHO: Thank you. Yes, sir.

24 MR. FLYNN: Hello. My name is Carlisle
25 Flynn and I'm one of three directors of the Arizona
26 Civil Rights Movement. And I'd like to touch on the
27 Chandler incident real briefly. We talked about the

1 civil rights violations that occurred there but we
2 sort of overlooked one thing that was the physical
3 abuse that was created by the police department.

4 It's reflective of the cultural
5 insensitivity that that department has towards the
6 community and we feel that there should be more
7 training. Actually, people don't need to be trained
8 on how to inter-relate with others, but that may be a
9 politically charged issue and we feel -- our
10 organization feels that a political forum should be
11 set up to address this type of issue. Thank you.

12 (Applause)

13 MR. COMACHO: Yes.

14 MS. FEEDS: (ph) My name is Lindsay Feeds.
15 I'm 16 and attending Corona Del Sol High School in
16 Tempe and I'm dedicated to promoting and celebrating
17 diversity. I've long held the belief that in our
18 prioritization of items in our life we, in fact,
19 determine who we are. So it seems that a government
20 is at least somewhat determined by their funding
21 policies.

22 I view this race initiative as a challenge
23 to the government priorities on funding. The voters
24 and legislators put the funding in place to show
25 through their actions that one America is important.
26 We need to make clear it is a priority. To
27 financially make clear to my generation, to the next

1 generation and the proceeding generation that improved
2 human relations, race relations is crucial to one
3 America.

4 I ask the Board to fund activities and
5 programs especially in our schools and educational
6 programs like Any Town. I hope that we can work
7 towards ending ignorance through education as we
8 recognize similarities, recognize differences and
9 appreciate the diversity. And so we, the three of us,
10 we all went to Any Town this summer and that would
11 make about over 25,000 that have gone in the past 40
12 years, we're inviting you to visit the camp that we
13 believe is definitely fitting of your definition of a
14 promising practice.

15 And so we offer you this gift, not only to
16 your wardrobe because there's a shirt in there, and to
17 the soul because one of the shirts in there says
18 "Nobody's Born a Bigot" and that's a really important
19 statement.

20 (Applause)

21 MR. COMACHO: She's so excited she fell
22 out of her shoes. See, there is hope, there is hope.

23 (Applause)

24 Yes, sir.

25 MR. NOEL: Hi, my name is Rubin Noel. I'm
26 a public relations consultant here in Phoenix and I'm
27 not going to get this all in two minutes, so right now

1 I would like to say on this issue I would like to make
2 an appointment with Mary Rose Wilcox and somebody from
3 this Board up here and also Mr. -- I'm sorry.

4 MR. COMACHO: Comacho.

5 MR. NOEL: Comacho, I'm sorry.

6 MR. COMACHO: Close enough.

7 MR. NOEL: I've seen you a million times
8 on television. You don't look the same. But this is
9 about --

10 MR. COMACHO: I hope that's good.

11 MR. NOEL: It's very good. This is --
12 what I was going to say is I hope you can get with
13 your reporters and everybody else, the reporters in
14 town, and tell them to stop taking police reports as
15 the gospel. They've become the greatest fiction
16 writers in Arizona.

17 (Applause)

18 The other thing is this is about women.
19 Women are a minority, aren't they? Aren't they
20 considered a minority? They tell me they are anyway.
21 There was a great picture that Grant Woods gave awhile
22 ago. He did a good job in Chandler. There are
23 pockets of bigotry, there are pockets of hate and
24 they're right in the Scottsdale Police Department. A
25 handful of cops over there who take their duties like
26 Jack-booted street thugs. That's the way they
27 operate.

1 mother and father at the age of 75 were beat up by law
2 enforcement officers and there was three Hispanic
3 other officers who wanted to testify but they were not
4 allowed to testify at the federal court here in
5 Arizona and so then they -- we got -- they lied and
6 they convicted us of the crime because my mother and
7 father died as the result of the beating.

8 And it started with the City of Phoenix
9 officials taking our land at the Golden Gate area
10 where it's Hispanic people and I'm part Hispanic and
11 I'm part Black and I'm part Indian and I'm part White
12 and I have -- they had a class that they called low
13 economic level and they abused those people. And I
14 would ask -- I take this as a blessing that President
15 Clinton sent somebody down. It's like an Army of
16 angels coming to finally help people here in Arizona.

17 Two thousand families were taken out of
18 their homes and about half of those were abused.
19 Federal funds were misused, misappropriated and put in
20 the -- lined a lot of people's pockets. And I want to
21 give the evidence to you, if you folks would, please,
22 up there on the panel take it with you because in
23 Phoenix no one will stand up for the people's rights
24 here because this is too serious and I want to show
25 you the crime.

26 MR. COMACHO: Ma'am, if you could, right
27 now the Board -- ma'am the Board does not have enough

1 time for this right now.

2 MS. LOPEZ: I wanted to show you. My 75-
3 year old mother is bleeding. She got beat up and I
4 want you to see. Everybody tries to hush everything
5 up. Their civil rights were violated. They were
6 taken -- I was thrown in the street, my mom was made
7 homeless. Her business was bulldozed and she got not
8 one penny, zero, for relocation. And the government
9 laws say we were supposed to get relocated. We were
10 supposed to have a home. It took us 35 years of labor
11 to buy our American dream home.

12 It was taken by city officials in Phoenix
13 and my mother went to the court and put in a petition
14 to look at this improper land take by Bob Logen (ph)
15 Economic Development and other city officials. And
16 they sent these two thugs out to beat us up. And they
17 kicked in the door of my father's house and he died
18 within a month on Father's Day.

19 MR. COMACHO: Ma'am.

20 MS. LOPEZ: They beat me up. I need your
21 help and I'm begging, please listen to my story. If
22 you don't, nobody will, they will keep it hushed in
23 Phoenix.

24 MR. COMACHO: Okay, thank you, ma'am.

25 MS. LOPEZ: At least somebody listen,
26 please, and I take this as God sending you and we need
27 you here in Phoenix because of racism that is covered

1 up.

2 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, ma'am. Thank
3 you.

4 (Applause)

5 Ma'am, your name is on the record. Thank
6 you. Sir.

7 MR. HICKS: Good afternoon. My name is
8 James T. Hicks. I'm the second vice president of the
9 Maricopa Branch of the NAACP and committee
10 coordinator. On behalf of the Maricopa County Branch
11 of the NAACP, we applaud President Clinton and his
12 distinguished panel for this healthy dialogue.

13 Throughout the day we've discussed the
14 many inequities within our environment. My only
15 question is, what is our next step and how do we
16 proceed from here. Recognizing that the Maricopa
17 County Branch of the NAACP stands in the forefront of
18 valuing our diversity while embracing equality and
19 justice for all, we are asking a very simple question.
20 Where do we go from here?

21 We stand ready to serve in any and all
22 matters possible while recognizing that together we
23 can overcome any obstacle but divided we will
24 certainly fall. Thank you.

25 (Applause)

26 MR. COMACHO: Yes, sir.

27 MR. FOSALA: Hello, my name is Tony Fosala

1 (ph) and I'd like to echo what Attorney Montoya
2 earlier mentioned in his comments and that is that the
3 disparate and discriminatory treatment of minorities
4 is rampant among all levels of law enforcement from
5 the local to the federal level. I personally have
6 been subjected to discriminatory treatment and also
7 violations of my civil rights in the last five years.
8 And all this has resulted from my following the system
9 and filing complaints, letters that I have written to
10 the Department of Justice, congressmen, et cetera.

11 In one particular incident I was suspected
12 of being American's most wanted criminal, solely
13 because of my race. And I filed those complaints,
14 nothing was done. The Mesa Police Department, they
15 were very arrogant about it. They claimed that the
16 way they posed it was accelerated policy failure.

17 The Chandler Police Department said, "We
18 have conducted a thorough investigation into the
19 events surrounding this incident and the investigation
20 revealed actions were not consistent with departmental
21 policy and procedures. Appropriate disciplinary
22 action, remedial training and policy review will be
23 administered to insure future improved performance".
24 That was dated January the 20th, 1993.

25 What happened here last month, two months
26 ago in Chandler, nothing. Now also two weeks ago on
27 my way to a golfing event down in Green Valley,

1 Arizona, as I entered the golfing development, I was
2 stopped by the Border Patrol and I was told it was an
3 immigration stop. Since when does the border extent
4 30, 40 miles beyond the border.

5 (Applause)

6 Now, the other point and my most focal
7 point that I want to bring out is if you will please
8 write down this police report number, Cochise County
9 Investigative Report Number 94-2916. In that report,
10 my nephew, 23 years old, and a fellow friend also in
11 his twenties, were cold-bloodedly murdered by an off-
12 duty border patrolman while these young man, along
13 with the border patrolman who was there celebrating my
14 nephew's twenty-third birthday.

15 This young man -- I mean, this border
16 patrolman --

17 MR. COMACHO: Sir, your two minutes are
18 up, sir.

19 MR. FOSALA: Okay, what I'd like to do is
20 that this investigation be re-opened and the treatment
21 that goes on in the border patrol not only against
22 illegal immigrants but among our own U.S. citizens is
23 beyond -- is reprehensible and that it needs to be
24 stopped. Thank you.

25 MR. COMACHO: Thank you.

26 (Applause)

27 MS. PATTERSON: Yes, this is a copy of my

1 file, partial copy. It includes newspaper articles,
2 ASU documents, state government documents and my
3 lawsuit in Federal Court.

4 MR. COMACHO: What is your name, please,
5 ma'am?

6 MS. PATTERSON: My name is Bobbi
7 Patterson. I worked at Arizona State University for
8 six years in a department where the director used
9 racial slurs such as "burr head", "wetbacks", "slant
10 eyes", "turban head", and "Jap". Epitaphs for women
11 were "MU bitches", "dumb broad", "dingy broad", "dumb
12 bitch" and on and on.

13 I went to EEOC and for three years they
14 fooled around with my complaint. They gave me a
15 letter that says, "It is not necessary that you be
16 represented by an attorney while we handle your case.
17 If not, you'll lose every right in court you have".
18 I contacted the U.S. Department of Education, the U.S.
19 Commission on Civil Rights, the U.S. Justice
20 Department, EEOC, my representative in the U.S.
21 Congress, the Governor's office, the Governor's Office
22 for Affirmative Action for Women, the Attorney
23 General's Office in 1993 and 1995.

24 I've contacted five legislators in the
25 state of Arizona, the Board of Regents, Maricopa
26 County Attorney's Office and the Campus Police and
27 nobody will do a thing. Now, the Board of Regents

1 needs to take control of the affirmative actions at
2 the three universities and let them report directly to
3 the Board of Regents and quit tap dancing on a string
4 before the President.

5 (Applause)

6 MR. COMACHO: Yes, ma'am.

7 MS. MORRELL: I am Jean Morrell a former
8 businesswoman. I have lived in this state all my
9 life. I was born here as well as my relatives from
10 the 1800's. We have environmental racism in this
11 city. They have located numerous, at one time the
12 county thought 900 businesses in my impoverished area
13 and the moment I called the EPA in 1989, I have been
14 subjected to untold violations of my civil rights and
15 those of my family.

16 At this present time, the city of Phoenix
17 has been using an organization of a neighborhood
18 association called Green Gables to further violate my
19 civil rights. The moment you complain, that's when
20 you are charged frivolous violations and it continues
21 forever. Last night I had a call from Mr. Willard
22 Chin, who is the Director of the Environmental Justice
23 Division. His mail that was sent to me two weeks ago,
24 as well as any other mail that I get from federal
25 officials, are opened.

26 You can see the envelopes, that every one
27 of them have been opened. I have contacted lawyers

1 and they tell me they want big bucks. The doctors and
2 nurses came to me when I was still in business to ask
3 me if I would support their efforts to close down
4 Browning Ferris Industries. In the meantime, I found
5 out all those other businesses have poisoned my fellow
6 community, all of them.

7 MR. COMACHO: Your two minutes are up,
8 ma'am. Thank you. Yes, sir.

9 (Applause)

10 MR. GRACE: Good afternoon, my name is
11 Jesse Grace and I have a bilingual kindergarten class
12 here in Phoenix at Garcia Elementary School and I'm
13 here to express -- to echo and to further the call
14 that went out earlier for a better comprehensive
15 curriculum dealing with race issues, dealing with
16 multi-culturalism in our schools. I've been trying to
17 with my class and I've mostly made up my own
18 curriculum there, and I just wanted to share a story.

19 The reason that I sent out this call is
20 because I feel that multi-cultural issues need to be
21 addressed in order to deal with divisions on all
22 levels, not just black/white, not just Hispanic and
23 white but also between African American and Hispanic
24 -- Mexican American, Hispanic American communities.
25 Also in having a conversation with my kindergarten
26 class last week, we were talking about Martin Luther
27 King day coming up and one of my students -- we were

1 talking -- I had placed a drawing on the blackboard of
2 a young boy and I said, "This is my friend. Can
3 anyone tell me why he's sad"?

4 One of my students said, "It looks like
5 he's fallen in the mud". And I said, "Okay, why do
6 you think that"? She said, "Well, his skin looks all
7 dirty". I said, "What would you say if I told you
8 that was his skin color"? She said, "Okay, I get it,
9 he's an alskudo (ph), a dark-skinned person". And I
10 said, "Okay, why do you think he's sad"? And she
11 said, "Well, I think it's because of what his mother
12 did".

13 And I said, "Well, what did his mother
14 do"? And she said, "Well, you know, it's because of
15 the water". And I said, "The water, what do you mean
16 by that". She said, "Well, that's how black people
17 are made is that their mothers drank dirty water when
18 they were pregnant and you know, that's how they came
19 out". And so I had to take a step back and really
20 replan how I was going to address these issues. And
21 I think if there were more resources available to
22 teachers to teach multi-culturism, I think these
23 problems would not exist.

24 And if more teachers took the time out to
25 suggest these in class.

26 MR. COMACHO: Sir, your time is up, thank
27 you.

1 (Applause)

2 MS. FALASKIS: Yes, my name is Falaskis
3 and I'm a victim. I'm a victim from the judges as in
4 the city of Phoenix. I have tried to get a court
5 order for harassment. This man has even come to my
6 driveway, cussed at the police and everything else,
7 threatened me in front of the police. He's an Anglo.
8 They didn't haul him away or anything but you see, and
9 then my house has been burned down.

10 He broke all my windows and then he goes
11 to the preservation and files a complaint against me
12 because the windows are broken after he has done it.
13 I'm up to \$25,000.00 of medical bills. I've got one
14 hand, one foot and one eye now out because of -- and
15 they have called me a wetback. I am not a wetback.
16 I am half Navajo and half Hispanic. My grandma was
17 raised here on 16th and Wood and she was up to 74 and
18 nobody bothered her at all.

19 And I'm sorry, I can't talk about it.

20 MR. COMACHO: Yes, sir.

21 MR. OREO: Frank Orea (ph), a native of
22 the state of Arizona. I'm here representing the
23 League of United Native American Citizens which is the
24 oldest and largest organization in the country. We
25 continue -- I'll let you know, we continue fighting
26 all these matters, all these civil and human
27 disobedience and what have you. However, we do need

1 your help and I think all organizations need the help.
2 We have for years worked very close with the --
3 networked with the NAACP as well as the other
4 organizations to get these things corrected.

5 We did correct them at one time, we
6 thought we had. Twenty-five, 30 years ago we were
7 doing a lot of progress. Since then we've held back
8 and we need to get back in there. It doesn't matter
9 how much we talk about all these incidents. They
10 continue to happen. I could predict that then, I
11 could predict it today. Unless we get these federal
12 laws -- and I want to go on record that I'm a firm
13 supporter of affirmative action as well as the Civil
14 Rights Act of 1964 and other laws that we need to get
15 into the books and reinforce them, reinforce them.

16 (Applause)

17 I was at a panel discussion with the
18 Tribune and all these individuals were on this paper.
19 They all had the same problems we're expressing today
20 right here, the same problems. And they continue to
21 go on and on and it's time that we do something. It's
22 time and I think this is the place to do it. We talk
23 about these terrible things that happen to individuals
24 as well as the immigrants, the things that happened in
25 Chandler.

26 Let me tell you, LUNAC got involved in
27 this immigration business about 25 years ago and no

1 one ever heard about it. We were saying make these
2 individuals in this country who have been here 25, 30
3 years, make them citizens now. Eventually a law came
4 about, I think the Reform Act of 1986 that President
5 Reagan signed. We then we also said remove certain
6 things that are effecting, will effect our citizens,
7 the new immigrants. So --

8 MR. COMACHO: Excuse me, sir, your time is
9 up.

10 MR. OREO: Thank you. I just want to let
11 you know that I do appreciate being here and I
12 understand all the problems you're going through and
13 we'll be here to assist you whenever. Thank you.

14 MR. COMACHO: I know our schedule said
15 that the forum would conclude at 5:30. We do want to
16 hear from as many people as we can, so we will hear
17 from the people that we have left standing and also,
18 a couple of the Board members do have to leave in the
19 next few minutes to make airplanes. So I believe
20 that's okay. So if we can just go ahead. Just to let
21 you know, if you're standing now, you will be heard,
22 but that is it. Yes, sir.

23 MS. RHODIS: Hi, my name is Melissa
24 Rhodis. I'm a student. I'm 22 years old. I
25 graduated from Central High School in Central Phoenix
26 and I'm now a senior at Wellsley College in Wellsley,
27 Massachusetts. I have a very brief question and it's

1 not a rhetorical question, so I'd appreciate if
2 Chairman John Hope Franklin or another member of the
3 Board could answer it very briefly.

4 MR. COMACHO: Excuse me, that wasn't the
5 purpose of the forum today. They're here to listen,
6 not necessarily answer any questions regarding the
7 Administration's policy on any issue.

8 MS. RHODIS: Okay, I'll somehow make my
9 question into a statement then.

10 MR. COMACHO: Okay.

11 MS. RHODIS: One of the most widely used
12 and perhaps least effective methods of distributing
13 funds for public schools is based upon property taxes.
14 This system is clearly disadvantaging the urban poor
15 and the urban poor are disproportionately people of
16 color. I wanted to know in your report to the
17 President will you advise a plan to make school
18 funding more egalitarian? I think that this is
19 essential.

20 I would like to see public education be
21 paid for differently. I believe that we need to
22 distribute funds in a more egalitarian fashion.

23 MR. COMACHO: Thank you.

24 (Applause)

25 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: I just want to say, we
26 will address the education issue. I can't say that we
27 will do it exactly like you want it but we will

1 address the education issue in our report to the
2 President.

3 (Applause)

4 MS. CONRAD: My name is Ruth Johnson
5 Conrad and Doctor Franklin, I'd like you to tell
6 President Clinton that in spite of all the negative
7 criticism your panel has received as some kind of
8 smoke front or smoke screen, I think that President
9 Clinton is definitely concerned. I know that I am
10 concerned about race relations.

11 I came to this meeting this afternoon
12 because I was very excited about this open forum and
13 I could not wait to get here. But once I arrived, I
14 was sad. I passed five people coming into this forum
15 and I always say hello, I always make eye contact and
16 not one person looked at me or said a word. As much
17 as I'd like to believe that legislation can change
18 things, I'm a grassroots person. I think that it
19 starts on an individual basis.

20 You've got to start by saying hello to
21 that person you meet on the street. You've got to say
22 hello when you meet somebody in the grocery store.
23 When you go to a PTA meeting or you take a class at a
24 community college, you've got to talk to those people
25 in that classroom. You've got to talk to people on
26 the street. I didn't raise any bigots.

27 I've raised three children. I also had a

1 day care in my home. I had German children. I had
2 bi-racial children. I had Laotian children. As Any
3 Town people said, bigots are not born, they are
4 raised. So if we want to change this thing and really
5 turn it around, if we're serious and we're not just
6 talking out of another opening in our body, then let's
7 do it individually. Let's speak openly, let's speak
8 honestly when we meet one another.

9 Don't have a public face and don't have a
10 private face. Have the same face, because, you know,
11 a chain is only as strong as its weakest link, so if
12 I fall, you're going down with me. So let's stay up
13 together.

14 (Applause)

15 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, ma'am. Yes, sir.

16 REV. MORRILL: My name is Right Reverend
17 Steve Morrell. You heard from my aunt earlier, Jean
18 Morrill. I'd like to confirm much of what she was
19 saying is true. In fact, everything she was saying is
20 true but I'd like to go into a little more specific
21 detail very briefly.

22 Since the 1950's we've had numerous
23 companies that have been dumping toxic chemicals into
24 our groundwater and have been doing so up until very
25 recently. Also for quite a number of years, they have
26 been burning these toxic chemicals in incinerators
27 around the Valley. So when these chemicals went into

1 the water, they had no idea that they would spread out
2 as far as they would.

3 Now, we're being told by the officials
4 from the Federal Government that the toxic plume
5 spreads from Williams Air Force Base to Luke Air Force
6 Base. Those are on two opposite ends of the Valley,
7 which means everybody in this room is drinking toxic
8 water. We are bathing in toxic water. We are
9 breathing this stuff out of the air. Many people have
10 already died from this stuff. Many more of us, myself
11 included, are dying from it now.

12 I can tell you that it's very difficult to
13 get anything done about it. Your doctors don't want
14 to test you for the presence of these chemicals. My
15 doctor, Doctor Jeffrey Fisher, refuses to. He doesn't
16 want to have any part of it. This environmental
17 racism is going on all the way around the country.
18 It's not just here. And our local officials not only
19 allow it, they promote it, not just the environmental
20 racism, but the many other forms of racism that you've
21 heard about today.

22 I've been working with Dolores, the Indian
23 lady who was standing up here before. I can tell you
24 they are going out of their way to help her be
25 harassed.

26 MR. COMACHO: Sir, your time is up. Thank
27 you.

1 (Applause)

2 MS. BARRETT: My name is Lisa Barrett and
3 I am a beleaguered teacher from Mesa, Arizona. I have
4 been told that I am a troublemaker. In Mesa, if the
5 panel doesn't know it, African Americans in the East
6 Valley are few and far between and if Mesa and other
7 parts of the East Valley has it their way, as
8 Scottsdale, they will keep it that way.

9 I work in a predominantly white district
10 and I have been told, as I said, that I am the problem
11 when I bring up issues related to not only African
12 American kids, but all people of color and white kids,
13 too. They tell me that before I got to that district,
14 they did not have any problems. So I brought the
15 problems to Mesa.

16 I, like the lady before, I filed an EEOC
17 case and got nowhere. So you tell Bill for me that
18 EEOC is a straw man. It doesn't do anything.

19 (Applause)

20 Okay. My family has suffered. I continue
21 to suffer and I mean emotionally. I have had an ALCU
22 lawyer tell me that I look too good to go to court.
23 Okay? We're talking problems. Tell Bill for me that
24 education is not the answer since the majority of
25 teachers in this country are white. Who is going to
26 educate the educators?

27 (Applause)

1 Because I see no educators -- few, I
2 shouldn't say no because it's never all or none, but
3 I have been doing multi-cultural training for years.

4 They have cut me out of things. They have
5 discriminated against me in Mesa. Thank you.

6 MR. COMACHO: Excuse me, ma'am, your time
7 is up.

8 MS. BARRETT: But tell Mr. Clinton that
9 EEOC is not the answer, nor is education the way it is
10 now.

11 MR. COMACHO: Thank you. Yes, ma'am.

12 MS. POST: My name is Diane Post. I'm an
13 attorney and I'm the chairperson of the Legal Redress
14 Committee for the Maricopa County NAACP. I've been
15 doing that for three years and I made an 11-year data
16 base of all the complaints that we got and I think
17 that the statistics will be instructive because they
18 support the anecdotal evidence that has been brought
19 forth here today.

20 We get about 200 complaints a year and of
21 those, 65 percent are employment discrimination
22 complaints. Of those 65 percent, over 60 percent are
23 complaints against the government; city, county, state
24 and Federal Government. The kinds of complaints that
25 we get, the main complaint is firing, termination of
26 employment. The second complaint is terms and
27 conditions and the least is hiring.

1 I agree with the panel this morning, that
2 hiring is probably where the most discrimination
3 occurs; however, it's harder to prove and once you
4 have the job and you're fired, you have more of an
5 incentive to fight about that. The kinds of
6 discrimination that we see range from very subtle to
7 very blatant. Some of the more subtle kind is two
8 young man were told at an all white store, "You're
9 just not right for our family". Well, what does that
10 mean?

11 We've also had some very blatant incidents
12 in which adult black males have been called "boy",
13 "nigger" or "spook". We also had one incident where
14 a white supervisor fashioned a cross out of a piece of
15 paper and threw it at the black employee, who had the
16 forethought to stamp it out and lock it in his toolbox
17 so that he could then have that as evidence.

18 We also see retaliation when the NAACP
19 does get involved in the case. We had one employer
20 who told his employee as he fired him, "That's what
21 you get for going to the NAACP". When we intervene,
22 by and large, the result has been denying and
23 stonewalling. We've had some successful cases. We've
24 had some successful relationship develop. However, by
25 and large they stonewall and so the people end up
26 having to go to the EEOC.

27 The three solutions or the three

1 suggestions that I would have for you, one and two of
2 which you've already heard; one is that the government
3 has to clean up its own house and you already know
4 that. The second is that the EEOC needs drastic help
5 and you already know that.

6 MR. COMACHO: Okay, ma'am, your time is
7 up.

8 MS. POST: And the last thing I want to
9 say is we have had a racial preference in this country
10 for over 200 years. It's for white males.

11 (Applause)

12 MR. COMACHO: Excuse me, before we go on,
13 I'd like to announce something that for the individual
14 who owns this car it's probably as important as what
15 we're discussing now, your lights are on. It is a
16 Toyota four by four dark color. The license plate is
17 227B as in boy, E as in Edward, P as in Paul, Arizona
18 license, Toyota four by four, your lights are on.

19 Yes, sir.

20 MR. HAVENS: Hi, my name is Bill Havens
21 and I want to bring up an issue that relates to what
22 I perceive to be new -- well, not necessarily new but
23 a movement that's dangerous in this country right now
24 having to do with legislating discrimination, paving
25 the way for discrimination and racism through
26 legislation.

27 Most of you probably know that the state

1 of California recently put in a bill, their
2 Proposition 209, which outlaws affirmative action
3 programs in hiring in education institutions in that
4 state. Washington State also has an Initiative 200
5 that is the same kind of legislation. Now, in the
6 state of Arizona we have a state senator I read in the
7 Arizona Republic that is wanting to introduce that
8 kind of legislation in this state.

9 Now, as far as I'm concerned, this is one
10 of the most sinister forms of racism and
11 discrimination that we can find in that it's hidden --

12 (Applause)

13 -- and it's masked as equal rights
14 legislation. By trying to say that you're eliminating
15 discrimination by outlawing affirmative action, it's
16 going -- I think it's going to be well supported in
17 this state and I think that every organization
18 represented here needs to get together to fight this
19 kind of legislation before it gets to the table or on
20 the floor of our senate and I think that -- I hope
21 that this committee will take back to the President
22 that he please continue to speak out against this type
23 of legislation like he did in the state of California.

24 Even though it didn't do any good
25 apparently, at least he was speaking his mind. And I
26 think that we really need to fight this kind of stuff
27 because all the states are jumping on the bandwagon.

1 Thank you.

2 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, sir. Yes.

3 MR. WADE: Good evening, good evening,
4 Doctor Franklin. My name is Henry Wade. I am an
5 entrepreneur so therefore, I don't represent anyone
6 but myself. I don't represent special interest
7 groups, civil rights organization, none of that. The
8 reason I'm here is because I have a 12-year old son
9 and I'm concerned. I have watched these things take
10 place over the last 25 years I've been involved in
11 issued like this over the last 25 years, first of all,
12 as a member of the military for 20 years.

13 And I've seen things like this take place
14 time and time again. The reason I come here, as I
15 say, I'm an entrepreneur. I pay lots of taxes and if
16 my tax dollars are being used for this, I want to get
17 something out of it and I want something to come out
18 of it that's going to be beneficial to my 12-year old
19 son. So I come to you as an individual with no
20 interest other than the fact that you work for me as
21 does Bill Clinton, as does Congress, as does the
22 senators and I want something for my dollar. I want
23 value for my dollar.

24 People come to me, my customers come to
25 me, they want value for their dollar. I'm coming to
26 you in that light, in that vein. I appreciate you
27 being here but I want something done. If not, stop

1 wasting my money. Thank you.

2 (Applause)

3 COMMANDER FLORIAN: Doctor Franklin and
4 panel, my name is Commander Marsha Florian. I'm
5 commander with the Phoenix Police Department. And I'm
6 here to tell you about some good news about a very
7 exciting program that was made possible through a
8 government weed and seed grant. And that's a Spanish
9 emersion program where we are sending officers down
10 into Hermosia, Mexico to live with Mexicano families
11 so that they can experience the Hispanic culture and
12 to learn the language.

13 I experienced that program myself in
14 December. I can tell you that it was the most
15 rewarding experience of my life. I have many Hispanic
16 friends but this was the first time that I lived in a
17 Mexicano family. I experienced their joys, the
18 Christmas season and the holidays and they treated me
19 as a member of their family. I increased my language
20 capabilities.

21 We sent 17 officers in December and over
22 the period of time that we've been using the program,
23 we've sent almost 80 officers and employees. It's an
24 excellent program and we're doing this because we, at
25 the Phoenix Police Department are committed to
26 understanding and being able to communicate with and
27 working with and living with our Hispanic citizens,

1 our Mexicano neighbors. We want to know. We want to
2 be able to speak and officers are going and changing.
3 And it's an excellent program. I have good news. I'm
4 happy to tell you about it.

5 (Applause)

6 MR. COMACHO: Thank you.

7 MS. WADDELL: My name is Elaine Waddell.
8 I'm 17 years old and I would like to welcome you all
9 to Arizona and good evening. My main problem is I'm
10 with the American Indian Movement Youth Council of
11 Arizona and we are the ones who are trying get the
12 term, the S term referring to women's genitalia
13 removed from the names throughout Arizona.

14 We are trying to get it replaced back to
15 Iron Mountain which is the name that it was before any
16 settlers came over here by the Acoma Autam (ph)
17 people. That is the name, Iron Mountain. And my
18 concern is that you people support not using the N
19 word for the black people or the S word that is
20 derogatory toward the Mexican people. Then why don't
21 you support us when we come to you for this and if you
22 -- the people who named this we are hoping that they
23 name this thinking that it was an Indian woman but it
24 does not refer to that. It is referring to a woman's
25 genitalia area and we're asking that you side with us.
26 If you support the N word not being used and the S
27 word for the Hispanic derogatory not being used, then

1 why don't you support us. Thank you.

2 (Applause)

3 MR. COMACHO: Thank you.

4 MR. MALLERY: Hello, I was invited here by
5 Scottsdale Mayor Sam Campana today to share my message
6 with you all. First, we would like to thank you for
7 taking the time. I say we because --

8 MR. COMACHO: Can I have your name, sir?

9 MR. MALLERY: My name is Travis D.
10 Mallery. First, we would like to thank you for taking
11 the time to hear our dreams and for listening to our
12 request. Before we go on, I would like to sincerely
13 comment President Clinton and yourselves for peace
14 relations progress over the year was something we
15 needed to do to show our support and appreciation for
16 her -- his sincere compassion before we went on.

17 My name is Travis D. Mallery, owner of
18 Heartfelt Art, a line of greeting cards, tee shirts
19 and custom art pieces that strives to spread inter-
20 racial peace in as many ways as possible. I also have
21 a dream. With the involvement of many upstanding,
22 prominent and giving Valley companies such as
23 International Mail Processing, K96 Christian Radio,
24 Nokes (ph) Marketing, Shasta Pools and the United Way,
25 we have an ultimate goal with Heartfelt Art's inter-
26 racial movement of peace.

27 The first step is to stop judging

1 everything as a whole especially our state. Now, take
2 30 seconds as you have taken all day to listen to
3 complaints and please listen to this message that will
4 be all over the world hopefully with your help. If
5 you can perceive this, we can achieve this. Picture
6 inter-racial peace. Is it impossible, make believe,
7 unreal that if a falling star dropped we would only
8 wish to heal, the hate formed prejudice attitudes
9 people seem to often display with harsh and hurtful
10 words crushing hearts when people say.

11 It's almost everywhere. We try to run, we
12 try to hide. Inter-racial unity is the answer for run
13 and hide, we've tried. It's unreal and hurts
14 everybody, one is better because of race. Put every
15 race together, there should be a smile on every face.
16 There is love to feel if we would all just try and
17 come together for awhile. Just think if we were all
18 one hearted you'd see smile upon smile upon smile.

19 For black or white isn't known at birth,
20 not even ages one, two or three. Every race unite,
21 pat your neighbors back and see what a beautiful place
22 this world would be filled with love and not with
23 pain. Inter-racial peace would fill all hearts and no
24 one ever would complain.

25 We're seeking your support, President
26 Clinton's Race Advisory Board in presenting Heartfelt
27 Arts' inter-racial peace custom poetry art glass piece

1 that is in the lobby because we couldn't bring it in
2 here, to President Clinton on behalf of Heartfelt Art,
3 all supporters and supporting companies and believe it
4 or not, Arizona. We are requesting that President
5 Clinton fight the ignorance of racism in this state in
6 this world with us and propose to the United Nations
7 that we come together worldwide and make inter-racial
8 peace the United Nations' worldwide anthem.

9 What would be accomplished?

10 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, sir.

11 MR. MALLERY: One, letting everyone know

12 --

13 MR. COMACHO: Sir.

14 MR. MALLERY: -- never to judge anything
15 as a whole. We are all individuals.

16 MR. COMACHO: Sir, I'm sorry, I don't mean
17 to be rude, but your time is up. Thank you.

18 (Applause)

19 MR. RANDALL: I am Paul Randall. I am an
20 educator at Arizona State University, a member of
21 PASFE, Cathy Montaro president. Much of what I
22 wanted to say has already been expressed but there's
23 one -- and that's good so I can move on to a more
24 serious concern. Our organization believes that
25 serious discussions must take place and that we
26 mustn't wait until there's a crisis to have
27 discussions about race.

1 I have in my hand a diagnostic manual of
2 psychological disorders and psychologists and
3 psychiatrists represent an abandonment of
4 responsibility on this issue. They know that racism,
5 those who are effected by this vile illness, is a
6 disease. It can be treated but they choose for some
7 reason not to do so. One psychologist states that a
8 treatment for these individuals is incarceration.

9 That's one treatment you can give them,
10 radical surgery and another says death. So if a
11 psychologist would go as far as to make that
12 observation, I think it speaks to the seriousness of
13 this issue. I was moved nearly to tears listening to
14 the various ones discuss their encounters with
15 racists. Let's call it what it is. Let's dispense
16 with this business about discrimination, the cultural
17 diversity and prejudice to -- in reference to racism.

18 It is a very serious issue and I would
19 like -- our organization would like to see this
20 classified and see these people treated medically. If
21 you can treat schizophrenia using government money,
22 treat these people to rid this from our society.

23 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, sir. Yes.

24 MS. EISENBERG: I'm Eleanor Eisenberg with
25 the Arizona Civil Liberties Union and I want to concur
26 with the expression of support for affirmative action
27 that has already been stated by several speakers and

1 I rise not for the purpose of repetition but to
2 beseech you to ask President Clinton to make a more
3 spirited and committed defense and support of
4 affirmative action programs which are under siege
5 nationwide.

6 I'm a survivor of the California Prop 209
7 wars and we're going to have to do it again here in
8 Arizona. It's unclear whether or not there's going to
9 be a ballot initiative but there have already been
10 several bills introduced in the Arizona legislature
11 which opened its session on Monday to do away with
12 affirmative action. At least one of them exactly
13 tracks the language of Prop 209.

14 I'm encouraged that there are people here
15 whose faces I saw this morning who are committed
16 enough to spend their entire day here. I'm
17 discouraged by the fact that there aren't more people.
18 I was terribly discouraged by the results of the
19 struggle in California on 209 but I'm encouraged
20 because in Houston, Texas, they were able to repel an
21 attack on affirmative action and preserve the program
22 there.

23 It can be done and we need to do it here
24 working in coalition, lobbying and at the grassroots
25 level and the ACLU stands to work with people to do
26 that. Thank you.

27 (Applause)

1 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, ma'am. Yes, sir.

2 MR. TRAMARCO: Hi, John Hope Franklin and
3 fellow committee members. I'm Mike Tramarco. I lead
4 the noon mass rosary at Saint Francis Xavier cathedral
5 sized church in North Phoenix and I'm proud that
6 you've come to Phoenix and I'm proud, super proud that
7 as a good Democrat that President Clinton has selected
8 Phoenix for this wonderful seminar program.

9 When I brought the bus schedule booklet up
10 there, I worked very hard on trans Propositions 1 and
11 2 and I have some brochures I'd like to give, just a
12 second. Okay, you take these six up there. Now, what
13 I'm trying to do is this; I'd like very much to have
14 -- I'd like to ask your panel to ask President Clinton
15 to eliminate discrimination by delay.

16 As an example, we worked very hard on
17 Trans Proposition 1 and 2. It only lost by about 200
18 votes. What happened was at the election, I had a
19 great idea about having a public donation fund for
20 Sunday/holiday bus service which Mayor Rimsza has
21 approved of and asked Deputy Mayor Jack Tevlan (ph) to
22 start. The trouble is we don't have the funds
23 apparently for a publicity campaign for this wonderful
24 public donation fund for Sunday/holiday bus list which
25 the public, all 43 million annual riders in Phoenix
26 can contribute to it.

27 Would you please ask President Clinton, as

1 this is a good example of discrimination by delay,
2 where people want this. Our bus system is integrated.
3 It's a wonderful all American bus system, but they
4 delay things in essence on this and most of the
5 Mexican Americans and Black Americans live in District
6 7 and 8 on the west and south side. And will you
7 please ask him to get their committee -- city
8 councilmen on the transportation city council
9 subcommittee so that we can eliminate discrimination
10 by delay and particularly in this case, would you
11 please ask to have funds for a public -- ask him to
12 get a publicity campaign for the public donation fund
13 for Sunday and holiday bus service immediately.

14 And thank you very much for your time.
15 It's wonderful having you in Phoenix. Please come
16 back. Phoenix is a great city. God bless.

17 MR. COMACHO: Thank you.

18 MR. ENRIQUEZ: Thank you. My name is Mike
19 Enriquez and I'm an architect. I'm here by myself,
20 representing myself. I'm the fourth Hispanic to
21 graduate from ASU with a degree in architecture and I
22 don't know whether that says good or bad about Arizona
23 but that's pretty typical of Arizona.

24 Over the last 15 years I've spent a
25 tremendous amount of time in housing projects,
26 inspecting houses and I just wanted to bring to the
27 committee information about the amount of

1 discrimination that occurs in housing construction.
2 The Attorney General talked today about the agreement,
3 the settlement of \$3 million. Well, it's really just
4 the tip of the iceberg because in Arizona \$3 million,
5 the lenders loan that by 10:00 o'clock in the morning
6 every day.

7 You know, it's really a big problem and
8 what I've noticed over the years, for example, is that
9 you have no -- there's only one builder in the state
10 that has a Hispanic superintendent. There are no
11 black superintendents in housing projects, none
12 whatsoever. There's also a tremendous amount of hate
13 and hate crimes, hate signs all over these housing
14 projects.

15 You look at some of these nice
16 subdivisions in the north part of town or the east
17 part of town, if you'll go into some of the houses
18 under construction, you'll find graffiti, anti-
19 minority graffiti everywhere. Now, you may say why
20 bring something up like this, this is independent
21 building people building houses. These are not
22 independent houses. These are houses insured by the
23 Federal Government under the FHA and the VA program.

24 I brought this to the attention of the VA
25 and they just kind of laugh it off. They're not
26 interested in getting involved in the discrimination
27 issues under the VA lending policy. Yet, under the

1 Equal Housing Opportunity Act, it says that there can
2 be no discrimination under appraisal or housing
3 lending and under appraisal it fits the category of
4 building these houses. And so I would just bring that
5 information to you.

6 And another sad thing is I am the only
7 Hispanic in the entire state of Arizona who can
8 inspect the house and have it insured and funded by
9 the Federal Government and I'm an architect and it's
10 ridiculous to have that kind of qualification for a
11 minority to do this job when the Anglos, they come out
12 of construction jobs and they give them this position,
13 this authority to inspect those houses. But for
14 minorities, we have a triple standard.

15 MR. COMACHO: Sir, your time is up.

16 MR. ENRIQUEZ: Thank you very much.

17 MR. COMACHO: Thank you. We are a little
18 bit running short on time, so I would ask if the
19 remaining speakers, we do want to hear from you but if
20 you could keep your remarks as close to a minute as
21 possible, please, we'd appreciate it.

22 MR. OLSON: My name is Joel Olson, Doctor
23 Franklin. I'm a great admirer of your works. I
24 would like to ask the panel if they would address what
25 I think to be the key issue in the race problem today
26 and that is the problem -- the issue of white
27 privilege. And by white privilege I mean habits and

1 values, customs and the actions both deliberate and
2 passive by governments and business that
3 systematically privilege white folks in the areas of
4 education, school education, business and basically
5 every aspect of our society.

6 When I pump gas at a Circle K and I don't
7 have to worry about getting green carded, that's white
8 privilege. When I get in trouble with the law and
9 being a young person, it happens once in awhile, not
10 having to fear getting knocked up beside the head by
11 a police officer at the station, that's white
12 privilege. When I have the expectation of graduating
13 from a decent college and moving on to a decent well-
14 paying job and seeing that as part of my birth right,
15 that's white privilege.

16 And to me it seems that this problem is a
17 systematic problem and for that I would respectfully
18 suggest that I think that as much as I'm glad that
19 Clinton's talking about the race problem but I think
20 that the Clinton Administration has as much a problem
21 in this issue as it is a solution in that they
22 maintain and are responsible for many of the
23 administrations that continue to perpetuate this issue
24 of white privilege. So I would just suggest that I'm
25 glad to hear talk about unity and diversity and multi-
26 culturalism. I'm fully in support of all of that, but
27 until we address this issue of white privilege, until

1 white folks come to recognize they have a special
2 responsibility to recognizing the privilege and
3 working to abolish it completely and by doing so
4 recognizing that that makes a freer society for all of
5 us. I'm not sure where we're going to do if we don't
6 do that, so I'll submit that.

7 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, sir. Thank you.

8 (Applause)

9 MS. PATTERSON: First of all, I'd like to
10 say to Doctor Franklin that I love you with all my
11 heart and soul and that I only have three heros in my
12 58 years. That was you, Malcolm X and Fannie Lou
13 Hamer. I didn't get a chance to tell Malcolm and
14 Fannie that I love them but I got a chance to tell you
15 that I love you.

16 And I sent you a letter two months ago.
17 I don't know if you remember me but somebody put in my
18 desk drawer "Kiss my white American ass, bitch". I
19 work for the Federal Government, Farm Service Agency
20 in Phoenix, Arizona. I've been there for 13 years.
21 I have a college degree. I'm still a GS-6. All the
22 time I've been in this office for 13 years I've been
23 the only black person there. They have never
24 recruited anybody there.

25 They have never -- there was only two of
26 us. One was fired last year and now I'm harassed.
27 But, you know what, Doctor Franklin, I got a lawsuit

1 in and it's been in for two years because the first
2 time in December of '95 somebody left something on my
3 voice mail and called me the N word and said they were
4 going to put me on a slate. But I was afraid, but I'm
5 not afraid, Doctor Franklin.

6 Just like Martin Luther King said and I
7 honor his birthday tomorrow, "We've come too far to
8 turn back now".

9 (Applause)

10 And do you know what else, I'm not afraid.
11 And I know the person who put this in my drawer, the
12 person that's been leaving messages on my voice mail.
13 I know who they are, they know -- I know who you are
14 and I'm going to tell you right now, I'm not afraid
15 because like King says, "I'm not afraid because we're
16 all here together and I know you're with me". And I
17 want you to take back to President Clinton, I want you
18 to tell him to jump on those lawsuits and EEO because
19 there's too many backlogs. I've been waiting too
20 long. We're got to deal with those complaints.

21 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, ma'am. May we
22 have your name for the record, please?

23 MS. PATTERSON: My name is Sandra
24 Patterson and I live in Tempe, Arizona.

25 MR. COMACHO: Thank you. Yes, sir.

26 (Applause)

27 MR. FLEISHER: I'm Mark Fleisher. I'm the

1 state Democratic Party Chair and I appreciate
2 President Clinton bringing this forum to Arizona and
3 I appreciate you spending the time and energy here in
4 Phoenix meeting with our people.

5 I, like President Clinton, am also
6 interested in the fact that almost without fail every
7 time you hear someone say that affirmative action has
8 reached it's goals, it's a white male speaking and
9 it's interesting that they're the only ones that feel
10 that it's reached its goal.

11 We do have a few open doors of opportunity
12 for some of the wealthiest and brightest Hispanics,
13 Blacks and Native Americans, but the door of
14 opportunity is not open to the average person of
15 color. And until those doors of opportunity are
16 opened we have a long ways to go. The fact that those
17 doors are closed, hundreds of doors a day, every day
18 across America, thousands of doors, doesn't offset the
19 fact that once in awhile in awhile they love to pick
20 up a white male that was -- they say was discriminated
21 about somewhere.

22 I don't believe that happens very often.
23 I don't think there's very many whites that are
24 refused college admittance that deserve it and I think
25 we need to keep affirmative action in place and we
26 have a long ways to go before we're judged by quality
27 of our characters not the color of our skin. Thank

1 you very much.

2 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, sir.

3 (Applause)

4 MR. COSTA: Greetings, relatives. My name
5 is Tupoc Enrique Costa. I'm a member of the Chicano
6 Nawak (ph) nation, Escalota (ph) Pueblo. I also come
7 before you today as a member and a director of the
8 Indigenous People's Alliance which is an element of
9 the Continental Commission of Indigenous Nations and
10 Organizations of this continent misnamed America.

11 It's a laughing matter for some but if we
12 know and we realize that the true authority, the only
13 authority comes from the truth then we will have to
14 come to some point in our common history and
15 understanding that it is our very humanity that is at
16 stake in these kind of discussions or these kind of
17 dialogues.

18 I have a comment for the group and I have
19 several -- two requests to be made to the Hispanic
20 members that are present in this forum and the African
21 relatives, African American relatives that are also
22 present. Number one, I have a document in my hand
23 which is a copy of a page of the 1850 census of the
24 territories that were ascribed to the jurisdiction of
25 the United States which is reflected in that geography
26 that is represented on the podium that described the
27 populations that were to be transferred in

1 jurisdiction from the government of Mexico to the U.S.
2 jurisdiction.

3 By the way Treaty of Guadalupe Largo (ph)
4 is going to be anniversary 150 years February 2nd.
5 There's categories here; whites, colored, all classes,
6 total populations. The census for California there
7 was an added category. It was called domesticated
8 Indians. What I'm speaking about is the concern that
9 I have related to a principle that the fish perhaps
10 does not see the water that it is swimming in.

11 Throughout this discussion in this
12 document the 1985 census --

13 MR. COMACHO: Excuse me, sir, your time is
14 up.

15 MR. COSTA: Just one final point.

16 MR. COMACHO: Go ahead, make the point.

17 MR. COSTA: What is a white person? Why
18 is everyone African American, indigenous American but
19 the European Americans are relegated and given legal
20 status within the U. S. Constitution as white person?
21 That's my question.

22 MR. COMACHO: Thank you. Yes, ma'am.

23 (Applause)

24 MS. CRAMER: I'd like to say good evening
25 to everybody out here. My name is Elana Paloma
26 Elizabeth Ninush Cramer (ph). I was born a Chicano
27 woman, I was born and Indian woman, I was born a

1 Scottish woman and I was born an Irish woman. I was
2 born multi-racial and for 18 years of my life I have
3 been treated like a piece of shit by everybody.

4 And it goes without saying that people in
5 this audience did not even respect what anybody was
6 saying, what anybody was saying. And I want you to
7 hear what I have to say because I'm sick of it. A
8 nigger is a nigger is a nigger. A person who is
9 ignorant to me is a nigger. You can be white, you can
10 be black, you can be Indian, you can be anything you
11 want to be but nonetheless, if you're ignorant and you
12 don't care about anybody and you have that feeling for
13 nothing but yourself and you don't care about anybody,
14 you're a nigger.

15 I get looked on as a skin head because I
16 shave my head. I never get smiles any more. I lost
17 a good friend of mine who was black because I shaved
18 my head. It's not a statement. It's not anything.
19 To me and myself I was mourning. It's the native way
20 for me and all I have to say is I'm going to die what
21 I am, a multi-racial, a strong woman.

22 MR. COMACHO: Thank you.

23 (Applause)

24 MS. SWANSON: I'm Trish Swanson. I
25 represent the Spiritual Assembly of the Bahis of
26 Phoenix. We'd like to join our voices in those that
27 are commending the President on this initiative and

1 say that any initiative of this sort at the national
2 level that will work to bring the races together we
3 hope will be made permanent and deepen and broaden and
4 continue to say that we hope this initiative can have
5 steps taken to make it continue beyond this president
6 and this administration. Thank you.

7 MR. COMACHO: Thank you. Yes, ma'am.

8 (Applause)

9 MS. MONTARO: My name is Cassie Montaro.
10 I am the President of PASFE, Parents and Students for
11 Equal Education, a grassroots organization that has
12 been organized over the last three years in the East
13 Valley to combat and to support our children of color
14 in the school system. And one message I would like,
15 Doctor Franklin, for you to take back to the President
16 is that we need to take a serious look at the U.S.
17 Department of Education, at the Office for Civil
18 Rights and some of these agencies that were designed
19 to support racism as it is now.

20 They're not doing anything. They are not
21 doing anything. They are backlogged just like the
22 EEOC and they're useless. We've had to take out
23 struggles to the street because the government is just
24 not there to help us with our children. I have a
25 daughter of African descent that is in the Tempe High
26 School system and I put her in what I thought was a
27 free public education system and it turns out that

1 this has not been a free public education.

2 The cost that children of color, of
3 African American descent, of Hispanic, Native
4 Americans, the price that they're asked to pay at the
5 school door is the price of their dignity and self-
6 respect.

7 (Applause)

8 And I would like for the government and
9 for the President to know that if you all are not
10 going to do anything about it, we are.

11 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, ma'am.

12 (Applause)

13 MR. WILDE: Hi, my name is Mark Wilde. I
14 have to admit that although I did vote for President
15 Clinton in '92 and was very enthusiastic about the
16 things that he said, I have steadily lost faith by
17 observing his actions. Thank you very much, or
18 inactions.

19 I have grown to be very under-whelmed by
20 his motivations and my point here tonight is probably
21 some of the worst things that we've heard are the
22 pains people have gone through and in some cases
23 outright atrocities involved with trying to get
24 justice in this country. And I find it very
25 disturbing and I've recently heard that Ms. Reno finds
26 no reason to investigate suspicious wounds to Ron
27 Brown. I find that very disturbing that in a very

1 nice looking panel presented to us by a very nice
2 talking president to help heal the wounds in this
3 country that the chief law enforcement agency in this
4 country is neglecting to pursue this matter.

5 And my suggestion to the President, if he
6 wants to win back those he has lost, and that if this
7 is more than just a dog and pony show designed to help
8 him with his popularity polls, that he take serious
9 look and investigate the suspicious wounds in to
10 former Commerce Secretary Ron Brown. Thank you very
11 much.

12 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, sir.

13 (Applause)

14 MS. MALAY: Good afternoon, my name is
15 Caroline Malay and I am also with the organization
16 PASFE, acronym Parents and Students for Equal
17 Education. I am here today, a parent in pain, a
18 parent in an enormous amount of pain. A parent
19 calling upon the Clinton Administration to hastily
20 begin a federal probe into what's occurring in this
21 state.

22 Our children throughout the state are sent
23 off to the public school systems, sent off into a
24 virtual war zone. Our children are constantly being
25 attacked by racist white students as well as faculty
26 members. This system has proven time and time again
27 that they not only are unwilling to look into these

1 matters but they, too, are a part of -- they support
2 what is occurring here.

3 My son was ran -- there was two racists
4 students at Red Mountain High attempted to run over my
5 son. They pushed it aside as being nothing but a
6 teenage prank. My son was called a stupid black ass
7 nigger at Red Mountain High by a fellow football
8 player. He was told that he was too sensitive and
9 spoiled, that he should forget about it and go out
10 Monday and play good football.

11 Since this incident, these incidents have
12 occurred, my phone rings off the hook from parents
13 valley-wide crying out because the systems that are in
14 place are failing them. So once again, I charge this
15 panel as well as President Clinton to immediately
16 begin a federal probe into the racists practices in
17 this state of Arizona.

18 MR. COMACHO: Thank you, ma'am.

19 (Applause)

20 MR. WILLIAMS: Hello, my name is Cody
21 Williams and I am a city councilman here in the city
22 of Phoenix and I represent the district that you have
23 spent the past few days and I also represent the most
24 culturally diverse and ethnically diverse district in
25 the city of Phoenix if not in Maricopa County or the
26 state of Arizona.

27 The first thing I'd like to do is say

1 thank you for choosing Phoenix and I welcome you here.
2 I want to say to William and Linda and Judith and John
3 and Robert and Angela that I appreciate your patience
4 and your willingness to listen but I am also not
5 necessarily clear that you have achieved your mission
6 or not. But I do in synopsis suggest that the
7 issues of race and racism, mean spiritedness and
8 common senselessness is alive and certainly operating
9 actively here in the state of Arizona and the city of
10 Phoenix.

11 I would also charge you to take back to
12 the President, however, that this is a community that
13 has always been racial diverse. I was born and raised
14 in Phoenix and the community in which I was raised in
15 there was never a period of time when there wasn't
16 someone in a classroom that was black, Hispanic and
17 white. So that I can say that there are issues that
18 create racial harmony here in this city that I think
19 are second to none.

20 But I do need to ask the President on
21 behalf of the people that I represent as well as for
22 the things that I think need to take place is to
23 please appoint as many all of the federal judgeships
24 and appeal court judgeships openings and appellate
25 court judgeship openings that currently exist because
26 when redistricting and decisions and discussions about
27 the future about this community are made, those

1 individuals will play a very, very important role.

2 Please also ask the President to not
3 forward any entitlements to us as local government and
4 state governments without creating some expectations
5 that those dollars reflect the diversity of the
6 communities that they are being sent to so that if you
7 are saying here are 5 or \$10 million for police
8 officers that there is not the expectation that that
9 is a very racially and ethnically diverse police
10 officer body that's being developed.

11 MR. COMACHO: Excuse me, sir. Time is up.

12 MR. WILLIAMS: Your work is wonderful and
13 I really do appreciate you being here. Thank you
14 very, very much.

15 (Applause)

16 MR. COMACHO: Sir, you will be the last
17 speaker.

18 MR. GARCIA: My name is George Garcia.
19 I'm an immigrant to the United States. I believe in
20 the future that this country will be a multi-
21 culturally diverse country, the people of the United
22 States and I also was disappointed that President
23 Clinton did not apologize for slavery. I don't
24 believe it's a them and you issue.

25 I think an apology would be an apology to
26 all our grandchildren and great grandchildren in this
27 country. It would be part of a healing process and I

1 think it would show a lot of vision on the President's
2 part to apologize nationally. It would be a national
3 apology.

4 I also think it's becoming increasingly
5 harder to succeed in the country. We have two people
6 that have to make an income and children are not
7 getting the proper educational start in the beginning.
8 I feel that they don't have the proper training and
9 skills to enter the grammar schools and succeed and
10 continue through high school and college. I think
11 this should be a national priority, the education of
12 pre-development, pre-school children and I could go
13 into more detail but I have limited time.

14 MR. COMACHO: Thank you very much, sir.

15 (Applause)

16 MR. COMACHO: In closing, Doctor Franklin
17 would like to make a short statement.

18 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Thank you very much.
19 First of all, I'd like to thank Frank Comacho for his
20 patience and his wisdom and his good nature in
21 conducting this meeting. It's been a very, very
22 inspiring leadership that you've provided.

23 Secondly, I want to thank all of you, each
24 and every one of you for coming here today and for
25 sharing with us your experiences. Let me say that I
26 can -- that everything you've said resonated with me
27 for I have experienced either actually or symbolically

1 everything that has been said here today. Don't
2 forget that I was born in a state that had copied its
3 first constitution from the most anti-deluvian
4 backward new constitution that have been made in the
5 early part of this century in the former confederate
6 states.

7 My state took all of them. I don't know
8 any other state in the union that wrote in their
9 constitution that there should be separate telephone
10 booths for blacks and whites. So that your -- and
11 after all, I was a product of the race riot in 1921 in
12 the sense that my father, his house was burned down.
13 We didn't know for a week whether he was living or not
14 for we were in a village waiting to move up there.
15 And that destruction of our property caused us to be
16 -- caused our move to be postponed for four years.

17 I merely want you to know that I'm not
18 sitting here listening to you without understanding
19 your pain and your experiences, your suffering and
20 that sort of thing. And you, through your
21 representatives here today, have brought to our
22 attention the kinds of experiences that you've had and
23 your statements have clearly indicated that you have
24 had experiences that were certainly undeserving and we
25 take seriously our responsibility in advising the
26 President on many of the matters you have brought to
27 out attention related to race, racism and community

1 responsibility for building one America.

2 It would be inappropriate of course, for
3 us to comment specifically on the incidents that you
4 have brought to our attention because some of those
5 are under investigation, active investigation by
6 federal agencies. Many of the statements you've
7 expressed are the very heart of our mission. Those
8 are the things that we are interested in. Those are
9 the things we want to do something about.

10 Those sentiments were mentioned in
11 statements made by Supervisor Wilcox and Attorney
12 General Grant Woods and they certainly include the
13 importance of the government and working to solve the
14 problems and to enforce human rights regardless of
15 race, ethnicity or legal status.

16 On behalf of the entire Advisory Board to
17 the President's Initiative on Race, let me say that
18 this community forum and the concerns of Arizonians
19 generally along with other community meetings that we
20 will hold around the country in the future, will be
21 incorporated into our deliberations and our
22 communications to the President. I want to thank you
23 for joining us this afternoon and for sharing with us
24 the pain and the experiences that are yours.

25 I can say in conclusion that your pains
26 are my pains, our pains. We're together in this and
27 I hope that we can do something, just something to

1 ease the pains for all of us and move toward the kind
2 of world in which we want our children to live in, a
3 world where there's one America, undivided and where
4 we respect each other on the basis of common humanity.

5 Thank you very much.

6 (Applause)

7 (Whereupon, at 6:20 p.m. the above-
8 entitled matter concluded.)
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27