

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
PRESIDENT'S INITIATIVE ON RACE

+ + + + +

MEETING OF THE PRESIDENT'S ADVISORY BOARD

+ + + + +

Thursday, June 18, 1998

+ + + + +

The Board meeting was held in the Truman Room, White House Conference Center, 725 Jackson Place, N.W., Washington, D.C., at 9:00 a.m., Dr. John Hope Franklin, Chairman of the Advisory Board, presiding.

PRESIDING:

DR. JOHN HOPE FRANKLIN, Chairman

MS. LINDA CHAVEZ-THOMPSON

REV. DR. SUZAN JOHNSON COOK

GOVERNOR THOMAS KEAN

MS. ANGELA OH

MR. ROBERT THOMAS

MS. JUDITH WINSTON, Executive Director

C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S

	<u>PAGE</u>
Introduction by Chairman Franklin	4
Presentation by Rev. Suzan Johnson Cook	10
Presentation by Angela Oh	13
Presentation by Governor Thomas Kean	53
Presentation by Linda Chavez-Thompson	58

1 P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

2 (9:03 a.m.)

3 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: I want to specify
4 thanks to you for joining us this morning. I want to
5 welcome you here today to the ninth session of the
6 Advisory Board of the President's Initiative on Race.

7 Before I go any further, I'd like to take
8 a moment to send our condolences to the family of
9 James Byrd, Jr., in Jasper, Texas. The shocking and
10 horrible circumstances of his death remind us of the
11 reasons the President created this effort to address
12 the troubling issues of racism.

13 This incident was a horrible example of
14 the kind of violence that exists in our society. It
15 has its roots in prejudice, hatred, and extremism that
16 has no place in civil society.

17 I wish that I could say that this is an
18 isolated, aberrant example or manifestation of this
19 lack of civility, but I'm afraid that it has happened
20 all too often, and I wish I could say that it will be
21 the last time.

22 At any case, we applaud the people in the
23 community who have stepped in to help the city join
24 together in dialogue across racial lines to illustrate

1 that an act like this is not what this country is all
2 about.

3 I think I speak on behalf of the members
4 of the Board of the President's Initiative on Race
5 when I say that our thoughts are with the Beard family
6 and the people of Jasper as they seek to work out
7 their problems in a civil manner.

8 When the President began this effort now
9 a year ago, he set out to develop national policies
10 and initiatives that would support the vision of
11 America that respects our differences, but embraces
12 our shared values. The President wanted to identify
13 local communities around this nation that are making
14 a difference with efforts of racial reconciliation and
15 bridging racial divides.

16 And he wanted the American people to have
17 a frank an open discussion about race in this country
18 and how it affects our lives.

19 Over the past year, the Advisory Board
20 members have been examining racial issues and our
21 common future, looking at current laws and policies,
22 and making recommendations that can help insure that
23 we will become one America.

24 We have been talking to and hearing from

1 and listen to communities, businesses, government,
2 community organizations and others at all levels in
3 this effort. I believe that we have made significant
4 strides in several important areas.

5 We have recommended from time to time new
6 and important policies and public and private
7 partnerships that will help to close the opportunity
8 gap, improve access to education, health care and
9 housing, and reduce racial disparities in areas such
10 as crime and the administration of justice.

11 The Initiative has already identified some
12 200 examples around the country of local and national
13 grassroots efforts to bring people of different races
14 together. One example is the young Maryland high
15 school student, Tom Manitux (phonetic), who organized
16 students from other high schools for a town hall
17 discussion on promoting racial harmony with other
18 schools.

19 Another example is a program I visited in
20 Los Angeles several months ago called STAR, Students
21 Talk about Race. This program teaches college
22 students to facilitate discussions on race with middle
23 and high school students. College students receive
24 professional facilitation training on discussing

1 issues of diversity and are then paired up to visit
2 schools near their campuses.

3 This list of promising practices continues
4 to grow. In Seattle, Washington, for example, there
5 was a very extraordinary meeting a few weeks ago of a
6 collection of community groups that had been meeting
7 for several months, coming together, exchanging views,
8 and making recommendations of how to lower racial
9 tensions and improve their society.

10 The same thing is true in Oxen,
11 Mississippi. There are large numbers of students at
12 the University of Mississippi, as well as citizens
13 from surrounding areas, who came together making
14 reports on their own activities in this area of race,
15 and suggesting that they were determined to eliminate
16 the whole problem of race in the area.

17 And in Newark, New Jersey, just a few
18 weeks ago, we had a very extensive and in depth
19 meeting regarding housing not only in the New Jersey
20 area, but throughout the country, and there we found
21 that organizations were getting together for the
22 purpose of eliminating discrimination in housing in
23 New Jersey and elsewhere.

24 And we have elevated the issue of race on

1 the agenda through efforts like the very successful
2 month of dialogue in April with over 600 colleges and
3 universities, as well as the governors of 39 states
4 and two territories, and 22 mayors participating in
5 dialogues, service projects and other activities.

6 I believe that these efforts will have a
7 lasting effect.

8 The charter for the Advisory Board expires
9 in September, on September 30th. This winter the
10 President will issue a report to the American people
11 with recommendations for continuing to build on the
12 achievements of this effort.

13 Yesterday Board members prepared short
14 presentations for the full Advisory Board on four
15 different topics: education, economic opportunity,
16 leadership and values, and a vision for one America.

17 The purpose for these presentations is to
18 help launch a discussion among Board members on these
19 topics. Our plan for today, therefore, is to have a
20 five-minute introduction of each of the topics and
21 then Board discussion on the topics that we have
22 covered.

23 During the course of the last year,
24 various members of the Advisory Board have visited 35

1 states and almost every region of the country through
2 the efforts of the Board and the Initiative staff.
3 The opportunity to hear from all people in this
4 country has been invaluable to our experience.

5 Well, today's meeting is an attempt to
6 synthesize some of the key points we have learned and
7 options for ways in which we can continue to advance
8 the goals of the Initiative.

9 We will also begin thinking about ideas
10 that we may want to share with the President. I want
11 to emphasize we are considering options. Think of
12 this as a brainstorming session, if you will. We
13 don't intend that the ideas discussed today to be in
14 any way final or without opportunity for revision of
15 recommendations.

16 I've asked the Executive Director, Judith
17 Winston, to facilitate today's discussions so that the
18 members of the Board can participate in full
19 discussions. That includes the Chairman.

20 At this time I'd like to turn the
21 conversation over to her.

22 MS. WINSTON: Thank you very much, Mr.
23 Chairman.

24 There are, as you indicated, four areas in

1 which the Board members have indicated an interest in
2 making presentations, and we wanted to start the
3 presentations with a discussion regarding leadership
4 and values and vision for one America, followed by
5 general Board discussion of these issues.

6 I understand, Mr. Chairman, that you've
7 asked Board Member Angela Oh --

8 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Yes.

9 MS. WINSTON: -- to provide a presentation
10 on that component of the vision for one America
11 discussion, addressing values, and the Reverend Dr.
12 Suzan Johnson Cook will make a presentation, as well,
13 on the vision for one America, a presentation
14 regarding leadership issues.

15 So why don't we -- shall we start with the
16 Reverend?

17 REV. DR. COOK: Good morning, Mr. Chairman
18 and Executive Director and all of my colleagues and
19 each of you.

20 It was my pleasure to serve yesterday
21 along with Governor Winter who unfortunately could not
22 be here today and the rest of our subgroup, and we
23 were looking at the leadership and values, and through
24 the activities of the Advisory Board, which the

1 Chairman has outlined, and the Initiative staff, we
2 have identified through this year thousands of
3 potential leaders who can take responsibility for
4 building on the foundation for racial reconciliation
5 that we've created.

6 As you said, we have been to some 35
7 states in almost every region. It's been our pleasure
8 to serve, and we see that much still remains to be
9 done, and so to insure that the work of the Initiative
10 continues, and again, this is in a proposal state, but
11 we understand that there must be a government
12 structure that will support cadre of leaders.

13 And the most appropriate structure to
14 provide the support is a President's council, which
15 would be appointed by the President with the clear
16 imprimatur of the President and a clear mission and a
17 staff to implement the mission and the authority to
18 utilized resources from both the private sector and to
19 build public-private partnerships to promote racial
20 reconciliation.

21 We identified some priority goals of such
22 a structure, and that would be to be in a positive and
23 a proactive manner.

24 Number one would be to increase public

1 awareness and understanding of racial issues and
2 dilemmas.

3 Number two would be to promote meaningful
4 interracial interaction among individuals.

5 And number three would be to foster
6 policies and procedures that would strengthen racial
7 diversity in both government and nongovernmental
8 institutions.

9 So to achieve these goals, it would
10 require a set of strategies, which we spent a long
11 time discussing, which would be implemented through
12 partnerships with the private sector, focused on the
13 design and execution of a public information campaign
14 to promote racial reconciliation, the promotion of
15 increased opportunities for interracial interaction by
16 supporting people and institutions already involved in
17 racial reconciliation, and that would be major for us
18 because we feel that it is important to focus on
19 people who are doing the work and give some increased
20 priority to what is being done.

21 We saw many, many examples of people who
22 are doing work all over this country.

23 And the third strategy would be the
24 building of community and institutional momentum for

1 change in individual behavior and also on public
2 policy, which both are necessary.

3 So we believe it's vitally important that
4 strong efforts be made to fully engage the community
5 of people who recognize the importance of racial
6 reconciliation, and to certainly reach out beyond this
7 community to those who are people of goodwill, but who
8 don't recognize the need or don't feel a personal
9 stake in bridling our racial divisions and narrowing
10 the racial disparities.

11 So it's been a great year, and we look
12 forward to the Initiative staff helping us to flesh
13 out and help make these proposals much more concrete,
14 but we suggest this to you from the leadership and
15 values subgroup, and we thank you for your time and
16 attention.

17 MS. WINSTON: Thank you, Reverend Johnson
18 Cook.

19 Ms. Oh, do you want to make your
20 presentation?

21 MS. OH: Yes. Good morning to all of our
22 good members, and thank you, Dr. Franklin, for your
23 leadership yesterday in our vision discussion.

24 I'd like to report back that the way we

1 looked at the framework for the future is that the
2 core concern seems to be equality of opportunity. In
3 almost every aspect it is important in people's daily
4 lives.

5 So we're talking about economic,
6 political, educational, housing, health. These are
7 things that touch upon people's daily existence, and
8 the challenge for the next period ahead is to look to
9 that core concern in a multi-cultural context. We
10 need to focus on policy initiatives with regard to
11 this core concern, and that focus needs to be grounded
12 in some fundamental principles that we believe are
13 basic to our American democracy, those principles
14 being justice, equality, respect, honor, integrity.

15 And more recently, in the last few years,
16 I would say in the last three decades we were talking
17 about this concept of inclusion, which is something
18 that America is going to have to meet as its new
19 challenge in the 21st Century, to approach the notion
20 that Americans can begin to define themselves as a
21 multi-cultural people functioning in a multi-cultural
22 society.

23 The implications are tremendous because of
24 our standing in the world community and the fact that

1 we have this vast human resource in this nation that
2 is yet to be harnessed.

3 Right now we're going through confronting
4 a change that we know is very real. Some of us can
5 see it right in our backyards in terms of this multi-
6 cultural, multi-racial context. We will see new and
7 emerging populations. We will see more mixed race
8 people who call themselves Americans, and the shared
9 value set or set of principles are those that I
10 referred to earlier.

11 We want to talk about developing
12 strategies for creating this equality of opportunity
13 with this new piece of inclusion being kept in mind.
14 We understand that most of the information that we
15 have at present is based on what we know about
16 experiences of African Americans and Caucasians in
17 this country, and we know that we will need to work
18 hard to expand understanding the data that is
19 available now and will be more available in the future
20 on emerging populations in this country.

21 We've asked ourselves how will we know if
22 things have improved, and fundamentally, we will know
23 when the poor demonstrate or we can demonstrate that
24 the poor at least have the same equality of

1 opportunity in these areas that I call and we call
2 deeply connected to our daily lives.

3 And I guess what we're hoping is that when
4 the President turns to the work of putting together
5 his report to the American people, that he will be
6 bold, and we will encourage him to be bold, because we
7 will in our recommendations set out a series of
8 options that we think reflect truthfully what we've
9 heard all across the country in this past year.

10 I think also what we're looking for is a
11 way to express to him that we know that leadership
12 capacity in the future rests on the ability of
13 individuals to operate comfortably in a multi-cultural
14 context, to begin to move away from a race based
15 framework that might, might decrease our ability to
16 meet this goal of inclusion.

17 We want to be able to continue to talk
18 about inclusion in a real way, and we want to see it
19 reflected in the policy initiatives that are put
20 forward.

21 We're looking to other sectors to help us
22 move this idea forward, and Reverend Johnson Cook
23 mentioned those other sectors, who of course we all
24 know. If you stop for just a minute and ask how do we

1 get this done, that is, improve or advance race
2 relations, there is no one group that can get it done.
3 There is no one political party; there's no one race
4 or ethnic group. There's no one religious group. One
5 gender can't do it. It must involve the business
6 sector. It must involve nonprofits.

7 We have to look to the creativity that
8 philanthropy has to offer. We have to look for the
9 faith community to anchor the spiritual walk that
10 we'll be talking, and we have to also look to
11 representatives in important institutions, such as our
12 justice system, local government, and institutions of
13 higher education.

14 Governor Kean reported to us that he met
15 with several people who are presidents of universities
16 and colleges across this country, and they stand ready
17 to do whatever it takes to take up this agenda for the
18 future.

19 So the invitation has been extended by the
20 President. The American people have responded in the
21 past year in an overwhelming way, and we hear from
22 important sectors in our society that they're prepared
23 to do what it takes to follow a vision that is laid
24 out.

1 MS. WINSTON: Thank you.

2 And now we would like to open for
3 discussion among Board members this issue of the
4 challenges that stand before you in terms of the
5 vision that you are projecting for the 21st Century,
6 one America, both in terms of leadership and values.

7 There was some discussion among the
8 subgroups about some of the challenges that you've
9 identified in both projecting the kind of multi-
10 cultural approach to one America, and I wonder if you
11 might want to just follow up on that discussion.

12 Governor Kean, did you want to talk a
13 little bit about that?

14 GOVERNOR KEAN: I expect just to emphasize
15 how very important we think this is. At the end of
16 the last century and the beginning of this century,
17 many of us, I suspect, who are in this room and
18 outside had parents and great grandparents who
19 immigrated to this country under the worst of all
20 possible conditions.

21 There was no minimum wage. A number of
22 them didn't know the English language. They had to
23 take the most menial jobs imaginable. They lived
24 sometimes ten to a room.

1 What kept them going is a very strong
2 belief that even though they may never rise above the
3 condition they were in, that in this country as
4 opposed to where they came from, their children would.
5 They had confidence in the common school. They had
6 confidence in the American Dream, and that through all
7 of that bitter time, that kept the flame of hope
8 burning.

9 I suspect, and I know, that it's very,
10 very hard, for instance, for an African American
11 parent who lives in very difficult conditions in this
12 city or Detroit or Chicago, in Newark or Camden, to
13 have that faith, and if they cannot have that faith,
14 if they cannot have the hope perhaps for their
15 children, even if not for themselves, if they don't
16 feel the opportunity of the American Dream is out
17 there, then this nation will not succeed in the coming
18 century.

19 Many of you remember Randolph Langston
20 Hughes and what happens to a dream deferred. Does it
21 dry up like a raisin in the sun or does it explode?
22 My suspicion is that if we don't do a lot more to
23 recreate opportunity, equal opportunity for all people
24 in this country, and break down the barriers to it,

1 then our children and us, if we're around, are in for
2 a very difficult time in the coming century.

3 That's the vital importance of this work.

4 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: One of the very
5 interesting things is that the concept of equality and
6 particular equality of opportunity has been kept alive
7 perhaps more by immigrants than by the older settlers,
8 whether they were black or white. That is, with every
9 wave of immigrants, we have a renewal of the object
10 for which this country theoretically was established
11 in the first place, and that even though the older
12 settlers might be somewhat jaded and unenthusiastic
13 about it, the view has come alive with every wave of
14 immigrants. This is the land of opportunity. This is
15 the place whether you're migrating across the country,
16 as Brigham Young was doing, or whether you landed on
17 Ellis Island as large numbers were doing. This is the
18 place. This is the opportunity.

19 And the moment that we get some
20 assimilation and some adjustment and some feeling
21 that, well, everything is comfortable, another group
22 will come in and say that we're not comfortable, but
23 we believe that this is it. We believe this is the
24 opportunity, and so this is the thing that has been

1 renewed with every generation, and this is, I think,
2 an important factor in the growth and maturation of
3 this country, the renewal of the hope that every
4 generation has.

5 I think that, if I may just veer for a
6 moment from this discussion, I think that we -- I
7 believe the Board members understand this. I'm sure
8 they do, and I hope others do, that the Advisory Board
9 is really a part of a larger initiative, of the
10 Presidential Initiative on Race, which is on going,
11 and that this Board, which has a life of only a year
12 and now 15 months, may go off into the sunset, as it
13 were, but that the Initiative on Race is something
14 that's large and continuing. It's a White House
15 initiative, and that what we're trying to do is to
16 give that initiative the kind of impetus and
17 encouragement and stimulus and information and context
18 for its own growth and development.

19 I think it's important for us to recognize
20 this, and therefore, there might be limitations of the
21 role and function of the Board, of the Advisory Board,
22 but the Initiative is an ongoing effort that has a
23 life of its own. This is very important, I think,
24 that we all understand this.

1 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: What encourages me
2 is that as we traveled across the country and as we
3 visited universities and we met with young people, we
4 found that they are having less problems than we did
5 in the discussion of race or that some of them believe
6 that there is no issue having to do with race because
7 they're very comfortable in dealing with their peers
8 no matter what the color of their skin.

9 It doesn't mean that there aren't
10 problems. It doesn't mean that we don't have a lot
11 more work to do, but I feel very strongly that
12 whatever program, whatever recommendations and however
13 they ultimately get formulated and reported, we must
14 continue to emphasize the need of inclusion of our
15 youth in this discussion, in whatever programs and
16 whatever possibilities are for the continuance of any
17 initiative on the dialogue on race because they are
18 the young people who are going to make the difference
19 in the 21st Century, to make sure that we abide by
20 this multi-culturalism that we keep talking about
21 because they're the ones that will concentrate on it.
22 They're the teachers of tomorrow.

23 I see it every day. I have a nine year
24 old grandson who has no concept of color. I don't owe

1 that to myself because I have not been raising him.
2 I have a daughter who has raised him, and he has no
3 concept of color. He often wonders why he doesn't
4 have a better suntan than some of the other children
5 in school, but he considers it a suntan. He doesn't
6 know that the child is an African American, that the
7 child has a better suntan than he does, and he wants
8 to know how he can get one himself.

9 So I just wonder, you know, if that is the
10 kind of level -- of course, he's only nine years old.
11 I don't know what's going to happen in his future
12 years, but hopefully that his mother's teachings will
13 carry him further.

14 The problem here is that I see is we have
15 so many golden opportunities to do something about
16 this in our elementary schools, in our middle schools,
17 in our high schools, and we had 600 colleges
18 participating with us on a dialogue on race, doing
19 something in these universities.

20 Sometimes I feel it's too late by then.
21 We have to do more and concentrate at a lower level to
22 get this issue talked about and resolved at a younger
23 age for our young people in america.

24 MS. WINSTON: I want to -- oh, go ahead,

1 Bob.

2 MR. THOMAS: I just wanted to explore
3 maybe a couple of things you talked about. It was
4 unfortunate I couldn't be here yesterday, so I wanted
5 to -- one of the things that happens to me when people
6 ask me my or our opinions of how things are going, it
7 comes to this issue of how will we know, and I was
8 interested in the way that you phrased it, that when
9 the poor have the same opportunities, and the
10 discussion of a race based framework, because I've
11 come to see poverty and race as two separate issues,
12 and those who have opportunity still get affected by
13 race and those who don't have opportunity still get
14 affected by race.

15 And I just wanted to explore some of the
16 dialogue on race as it affects how will we know when
17 we've made headway. I've heard earlier a lot of
18 dialogue about, you know, in audiences about this race
19 neutrality or lack of race consciousness as being a
20 measurement.

21 We'll get to that, but anyway, if you get
22 the gist of the question, if I could just pick up on
23 some of the dialogue as to how you played that off
24 with race versus poverty.

1 GOVERNOR KEAN: In the dialogue yesterday
2 one of the things we said, you know, we can tell
3 things are happening if we moved around the country
4 with hearings, and when we had a hearing on housing,
5 we didn't have a bunch, a full room complaining about
6 housing discrimination and how it's affected them.

7 We'll be getting somewhere when we don't
8 have a hearing on justice and have to hear a lot about
9 race profiling when people are stopped by law
10 enforcement.

11 We'll be successful when we hear about the
12 schools where they are no longer segregated and
13 neighborhoods that are made by housing patterns.

14 You know, when all of these areas we
15 identify as a Board start not to be problems, that's
16 the dream, that there won't be problems anymore.
17 That's one way of telling, you know, we're making
18 progress.

19 MS. OH: I wanted to clarify that the
20 concept of moving toward a multi-cultural way of
21 thinking of ourselves, for all Americans, including
22 Caucasians, which is something that I heard frequently
23 among Caucasians, in particular, is that they felt
24 sort of like they didn't have much of a role in this

1 discussion because they don't have a racial or ethnic
2 or cultural identity to discuss here, and there's no
3 room for them.

4 Well, that's ridiculous because all
5 Americans can trace their roots back to a place that
6 are far from the shores of this country. This is a
7 country that is built on a multi-cultural and now more
8 and more multi-racial reality as we move to the next
9 century.

10 And I don't think when we say that we're
11 talking about losing our identities. That's not at
12 all what we're talking about. We're talking about a
13 framework in which we can continue to honor our
14 heritage, but do so in a way that doesn't tear away a
15 the fabric of this society as we see it happening so
16 often around issues that get racialized, one of the
17 toughest being, for example, and it's one we talked
18 about yesterday, was language, English language
19 acquisition.

20 But before I leave the multi-cultural
21 framework, I just want to say that that framework also
22 permits us to acknowledge the first Americans, the
23 Native Americans as part of this society because they
24 are within this society and next to the society, and

1 we haven't been very successful, I don't think, in
2 even a state-by-state effort, such as Minnesota, which
3 now requires that if you want a teaching credential,
4 you have to show competence about your knowledge of
5 who the Native American nations are within your state.

6 It's a very interesting things that we're
7 part of this in that state to make that a reality.

8 But on the language issue, you know,
9 there's this debate that is brewing, and one of the
10 things that happens on the language issue is there
11 seems to be this subtext like immigrants or newcomers
12 who are limited English proficient, don't have a
13 desire and an appreciation for acquiring the English
14 language, and that is so far off from what the data
15 tell us in almost every survey, which is that
16 immigrants place among their highest priorities
17 language acquisition, if not for themselves, then
18 their children, because they understand that you can't
19 succeed in this society without mastering the English
20 language.

21 But there is a concern that as emerging
22 populations that are non-English speaking begin to
23 grow that we will somehow lose our capacity to
24 maintain a cultural cohesion, an American cultural

1 cohesion.

2 And there I think there's a solution, and
3 that is that our initiatives should be advocating
4 English language acquisition for everybody, you see,
5 and that's a different approach than declaring English
6 is the only language.

7 The reality is that if we are going to
8 maintain our standing in the world community and be
9 competitive in the 21st Century in markets that are
10 international, we should be promoting the notion of
11 being multi-lingual, not even bilingual.

12 You know, I have good friends that are in
13 the State Department. I just met a friend who's been
14 assigned to El Salvador. His wife is Lebanese. She
15 speaks French, Portuguese, Arabic, English, and
16 Spanish. They communicate in Portuguese.

17 We were in a Moroccan restaurant in
18 Hollywood. We met up with a French and German woman.
19 I only speak English and Korean to a limited degree.
20 So I would talk to my friend in English who would then
21 translate in Portuguese, and then she would come back
22 in a little bit of English and a little bit of
23 Spanish. She could also speak to the waiter who was
24 Moroccan, and the woman sitting next to us said, "Oh,

1 you know, where are you from?" And so she explained
2 in French because that's the language that she taught
3 when she lived in Brazil.

4 I mean it's just this is the reality of
5 the future, you know, and so on the language agenda,
6 I think we move to a place where they're saying we
7 want to help all Americans or people who want to
8 become Americans to learn the English language, and we
9 approach it in that way.

10 You get rid then of this political wedge,
11 I think.

12 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Not to reject the
13 language --

14 MS. OH: Exactly.

15 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: -- the old language.

16 MS. OH: Exactly.

17 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: But perhaps to acquire
18 some other language.

19 MS. OH: Exactly. It's a new thinking.
20 It's like this out-of-the-box thinking that people are
21 so afraid to do, but we have to be bold, and we have
22 to put these kinds of ideas in front of the President.

23 MR. THOMAS: It just seems like there's
24 things that rub against the mainstream, let's say,

1 maybe the Caucasian mainstream, the language being one
2 of them, and that becomes a hot issue in electoral
3 propositions and stuff.

4 But also I just wanted to bring it back
5 also if I could to people of color. I mean, it's a
6 racial issue, but it's also people of color. So, I
7 mean, somebody who's different, and it can be
8 differences in color; so between races there's also
9 that issue.

10 And the thing that we were tasked with was
11 really along the racial lines, and obviously the thing
12 that we ran into was that there are poverty
13 implications and a lot of issues that come up, but
14 again, if I could, I want to drop back to the race
15 comparison to poverty and how we resolve that.

16 Which is the greater emphasis, based on
17 need/poverty -- here starting at the bottom -- or look
18 at it through the race prism, people of color?

19 MS. OH: I don't think it's an either/or
20 proposition. I think it's both. Everywhere we've
21 gone --

22 MR. THOMAS: But I'm saying it's become an
23 either/or in the perception of people because a lot of
24 discussion started off on the race side, and because

1 of affirmative action and other things, people
2 explored and looked for other ways and came up with
3 based on need.

4 And also I think people promote the idea
5 that I'm a person of color. I made it. Anybody can
6 make it, and it just seems like all of the work we've
7 done has found that's not true.

8 I mean, yes, people can make it, but
9 people of race have a problem -- people of color have
10 different problems, different hurdles.

11 Now, it's also true regardless of your
12 race that if you are poor, you have problems, but that
13 doesn't necessarily go up and down the economic
14 strata. I mean it is true for people of poverty, but
15 it's not true -- that's only -- I mean that's true
16 regardless of your race. If you are poor, you've got
17 problems in this country, but regardless of the
18 economic position, if you're a person of color, you've
19 got problems, and it just seems like that's the trump
20 card.

21 MS. OH: Well, in our economic
22 opportunities discussion, which we will get to, I
23 think, yesterday we discussed that because we did look
24 at data that seems to suggest that even if you control

1 for things like educational attainment, you still have
2 this persistent problem of disparity when you compare
3 whites against any other group.

4 And with Asian Americans it's disruptive
5 because we throw into that racial classification
6 people who suffer the highest levels of poverty, the
7 Mong (phonetic), the Cambodian, Southeast Asia, and it
8 gets masked because of the way they're lumped together
9 by the racial categories.

10 So it's true that that persists, but
11 again, I guess my response is it's not an either/or
12 proposition. I think that you must deal with the
13 poverty issue. I think that's fundamental because
14 everywhere we've gone people have talked about poverty
15 in relation to race relations, but it is a different
16 magnitude of responsibility, I think, in being
17 motivated about our policy to begin to address what we
18 know to be persistent discrimination.

19 So that's why we have conducted -- in
20 fact, communicated this already with the President --
21 supported that there be strong enforcement of anti-
22 discrimination laws, and beyond that, we have spoken
23 clearly that there's -- I think I'm correct in saying
24 that all of the Board members anyway are supporters of

1 affirmative action as a tool.

2 Now, it's been decided in some states that
3 they won't use it. That's fine, but that's not the
4 reality for many parts of the country, and we hope
5 that the discussion around affirmative action does not
6 get so bogged down in what I believe is the natural
7 reaction to the change that we're seeing where what
8 have been traditionally called minority populations
9 are going to grow in the next 50 years.

10 We know this. I think it's a natural
11 reaction to sort of want to shut down if you feel that
12 the competition is going to get rougher or there's
13 going to be some favoritism here that isn't proper in
14 some way.

15 But even when you look to California,
16 which has had the most dramatic shifts demographically
17 and the most dramatic reaction legislatively to those
18 shifts -- and I believe 187, 209 and 227 represent a
19 very natural reaction -- I think it will return
20 because when you look at even the basis for 209, you
21 know, 85 percent of the public contracts were going
22 already to non-Hispanic whites, and in a climate where
23 only 15 percent was being, you know, set there to try
24 and target minority and women owned business

1 enterprise. You had 209 come forward saying this is
2 unfair.

3 Well, you know, I've never heard any real
4 intelligent response to how is 15 percent of the total
5 picture unfair here. It is more an emotional
6 reaction. I think we have to deal with that in this
7 new paradigm and be sensitive to it. That's why the
8 faith based piece was so important, because it's a
9 matter of people having faith that, you know, we don't
10 have to repeat the mistakes of the past because we all
11 know that we can look back over 200 years and see what
12 the unjust laws were and policies were and
13 institutions were that we intended.

14 That is for all Americans to shoulder as
15 a burden.

16 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: I think that all of
17 our discussion through the years has tied color and
18 economic initiative in one way or another, poverty
19 usually, believing that prosperity being the opposite
20 of poverty was related in some way to color. The data
21 seem to indicate that. Observations, casual and
22 scientific observations seem to indicate that.

23 And I think it is one of the questions
24 that that is a factor, and when one sees it very

1 dramatically that way in the Native American
2 community, which I want to remind us that that's one
3 group who was already here, and they ended up with
4 much less the new arrivals, and it was, in part,
5 because of color.

6 Certainly the baggage which the Europeans
7 brought with them and which had a profound on the way
8 in which they looked at their society and looked at
9 the people who were involved in that society was a
10 matter of color. We know that is a fact.

11 The consciousness was in Europe in the
12 16th Century, and they brought it with them, and the
13 first time they had an opportunity to exercise it was
14 with the Native Americans, and then later on with
15 other groups of that they brought.

16 So I think the relationship is very clear.
17 What we need to do is remember those things, is to
18 search for ways in which we can eliminate that as a
19 factor, and we eliminate it as a factor by creating
20 conditions and circumstances and sometimes laws that
21 will negate these practices and will work through some
22 other more humane and democratic ways of looking at
23 the problem.

24 GOVERNOR KEAN: You've got to look at

1 individuals, and it's very difficult, maybe even
2 impossible, to escape from that. It's a very
3 difficult task.

4 Then you add race on top of the task, and
5 somebody who goes for a job feels that perhaps they
6 didn't get that job not because of their ability, but
7 because of the color of their skin, and somebody feels
8 when you come for the panel that maybe they were
9 discriminated against in that housing or maybe even in
10 the courts and with the local policeman on the corner.

11 So when somebody's trying to escape from
12 poverty and face that, combined with the fact that
13 probably the schools their children go to are among
14 the worst in the country and, therefore, not even
15 giving their children the opportunity to get out, it
16 makes it twice as hard for anybody to really claw out
17 of poverty into the mainstream.

18 Some do it, and, God bless them, they're
19 remarkable people, but if we remove -- hopefully start
20 removing race as a factor, it's going to be a lot of
21 easier for millions of Americans really to escape from
22 the trap of poverty.

23 MR. THOMAS: Well, that gets to the heart
24 of my question. Let me see if I can articulate it.

1 It's do we believe that solving the economic problem
2 will solve racism or discrimination based on color or
3 the effects of racism or discrimination on color.

4 You know, I mean I certainly come from the
5 standpoint that, yes, we need to fix the economic side
6 of it for a whole lot of reasons, but whether we do or
7 don't, we are going to be faced with this racial issue
8 that is overriding, and if we don't tackle that as a
9 separate issue, we can solve the economic thing and we
10 still haven't solved the racial thing, I guess, is --

11 MS. WINSTON: I think there was some
12 discussion in the various subgroups that met yesterday
13 that suggested that we really need to be talking about
14 a multi-pronged strategy and that it's not an
15 either/or.

16 I think that I wanted to suggest that we
17 might want to return briefly to a point that several
18 made yesterday and Dr. Franklin mentioned today, and
19 that is the sense that perhaps our newest immigrants
20 have a better sense of what it means to be an American
21 than perhaps those of us who have been here and whose
22 families have been here for generations, both in terms
23 of their expectations, but perhaps most importantly in
24 terms of our chartering documents, the Constitution

1 and the promise of America.

2 I think it might be, you know, in terms
3 of the vision. Who do we want to be as a people? I
4 think if you turn to the Constitution and you turn to
5 the Declaration of Independence and you start thinking
6 about those principles, many of them mentioned by Ms.
7 Oh in her statement, there is this expectation that
8 there is equality of opportunity here, that there is
9 the kind of prospect that when you come in some
10 instances with virtually nothing, that because if you
11 work hard and follow the rules, that you will then be
12 able to bring yourself up out of poverty.

13 We know that that promise has not been
14 available for all of us on the same terms, and that
15 race and ethnicity have often been the markers for,
16 you know, reduced opportunity.

17 So it seems to me that, again, if we begin
18 to talk about what we would want for all of us who
19 are, in fact, Americans or who want to be Americans
20 and then look at the impediments, historically the
21 impediments that have kept some people from realizing
22 and taking advantage of opportunity, then, you know,
23 there would be, one, an understanding that education
24 is key; economic opportunity is key; and then there

1 would be a desire, we would hope, through the
2 conversations we've been having for those of us who
3 believe in the American promise to want to have that
4 promise available to all regardless of race and
5 ethnicity.

6 But, you know, bringing that understanding
7 to the public and to our leadership has been the
8 challenge that you all certainly have been facing over
9 the last 12 months, a challenge that we face in the
10 Initiative.

11 And again, the question: how do you
12 revive our understanding of the American promise and
13 the principles that we say we believe in? How do we
14 make those, in fact, work in practice in day-to-day
15 living?

16 Maybe we could talk about the
17 responsibility of leadership that I know both Reverend
18 Johnson Cook and Bob Thomas have been working -- Mr.
19 Thomas with the corporate business community, Susan
20 with the community of faith, in trying to figure out
21 how leadership -- what leadership's responsibility is
22 for leading this discussion.

23 REV. DR. COOK: We had several faith
24 forums around the country. The last was in

1 Louisville, and I think the, you know, echoing thought
2 throughout was who was the promise for, and I think
3 you raise an important question about our founding
4 documents.

5 I guess what the faith community is
6 looking at now is trying to, as we raise the question
7 can there be one America, really make that promise for
8 everybody, and so that the race and the poverty issues
9 are not inseparable for most people, and particularly
10 those at the grassroot level. The one directly
11 affects the other.

12 And so the faith leaders are really, you
13 know, hoping that the Initiative will continue beyond
14 just what we've done this year because we're talking
15 about a lifelong process of trying to rectify some
16 things that have not been corrected and trying to get
17 America to where it does deal with more than just
18 those who were at the table when the founding
19 documents were signed.

20 And so I think, you know, we've gotten a
21 great response from all levels of leadership in the
22 faith community, and the question is, you know, who
23 was the promise for, and now can it be for everybody,
24 and that's one of the questions we're raising.

1 MR. THOMAS: On the corporate forum,
2 basically when we meet with groups, when we met across
3 the country -- and our next meeting is in St. Louis --
4 and we have emphasized at one time or other one of
5 three things, that the majority company's
6 responsibility to its employees and vice versa, the
7 whole labor issue.

8 We've looked at majority companies'
9 responsibility to be part of the community and what
10 that means, and also the majority company/minority
11 company interrelationship.

12 So each meeting has taken its own turn on
13 those issues, and by the very nature that most people
14 in those discussions are employed or employers, it
15 probably raised my sensitivity out of the poverty
16 issue into even though you're not giving poverty
17 issues, you're still dealing with issues of race. So
18 that's probably one of my sensitivities, like that.

19 But I think the people involved are
20 susceptible to leadership, and I think your idea of
21 having a President's council as an after initiative,
22 a post Initiative activity. It would be interesting
23 to hear a little bit more discussion on how you
24 conceive that, but I think that kind of lamp post for

1 leadership, I think, will be very well received by the
2 business community.

3 MS. WINSTON: Let me explain here about
4 Linda. Ms. Thompson was in the session with us also.

5 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: Well, I think what
6 we talked about is what would make the better sense,
7 you know, a council and office of the President, a
8 commission, and we determined that the best approach
9 would be to have a President's Council with staffing
10 because it does several things, and I think primarily
11 because it can operate as part of the President's
12 direct -- appointed by the President, but can tackle
13 on and provide some direction in several areas in
14 trying to bring in what we talked about, the public-
15 private sector partnerships, advocating and
16 monitoring, we believe, areas where divisions of the
17 government can implement programs and actually having
18 someone on board at all times with their own direction
19 of a council appointed rather than having someone in
20 the office and kind of losing the scheme that we have
21 built up over the past year's discussion.

22 REV. DR. COOK: Maybe I'll ask some of the
23 groups that we've met with this year and who have
24 responded to our work to help us carry out the

1 challenge beyond this group. So it's also about
2 getting more persons than just this team of advisors.

3 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: One of the things that
4 I think causes me to have some problems with the
5 relationship between, say, poverty and race or the
6 fact that race is a factor in the minds of people with
7 respect to others, and the type of profile or creative
8 impression of an individual based on his race and
9 nothing else, and I'm sure that anyone who is of color
10 has that experience.

11 And it goes beyond those sort of economic
12 levels or what have you. An example would be that
13 here is an African American, in this case myself,
14 standing in the lobby of a hotel waiting for someone
15 to join him and to have dinner, and a white man comes
16 in and sees me and already has profiled me as a member
17 of the servant class.

18 I have a little problem with that, except
19 that it has not to be a problem, and he approaches me
20 and he says, "Go and get my automobile." He doesn't
21 ask me if I work there or I'm anything. He has
22 assumed that I am there to serve him, and he hands me
23 his keys.

24 As I told you before, people say, "You

1 should have taken his keys."

2 (Laughter.)

3 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: But I told him I was
4 not in the business of delivering cars, and he finally
5 realized that I was not there to serve him.

6 Now, what I'm saying is that there's an
7 age here, there's a problem here that is not solved by
8 the problem of poverty as opposed to race or poverty
9 problems. I'm somewhat above the poverty level, and
10 this man assumed that I was not or that was working to
11 stay above the poverty level, and so do you.

12 You've got this problem. It's not solved
13 by just statistics or by saying that X number of
14 African Americans are above the poverty level. Such
15 a matter as the experience of mine has to be dealt
16 with, and I think that we may have an opportunity to
17 discuss this when Governor Kean talks about education
18 and that sort of thing a little later, but it's a
19 complex problem.

20 MR. THOMAS: It's a measurement of
21 success, and one of the -- a measurement of the lack
22 of success that we've met, and we would readily admit
23 to it, that it's difficult to get anybody but the
24 choir involved in the discussion.

1 So regardless of your race, if you're
2 involved in working this issue, there's a lot of
3 energy and discussion and particularly people of color
4 are interested in this issue, but there's a number of
5 people that aren't, and a lot of the people hold a
6 whole variety of impressions of stereotypes and
7 profiling of which you speak, and that was sort of the
8 challenge I guess I was speaking of earlier.

9 A measurement of success is if we could
10 engage those people in a meaningful discussion, and I
11 see business councils as a way to do that through some
12 leadership, but to engage them and change their mind
13 so that when they see you, they have no different
14 impression of you than another person standing in a
15 lobby with a suit and tie on.

16 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: There's a sequel to
17 the story. I don't know whether this means that he
18 got his education, but apparently he asked someone in
19 the lobby or at the desk who I was, and they told him,
20 and I waiting to have lunch at a book store, and
21 preceding my going to the bookstore to pick up some
22 books of my own, and when I was at the bookstore, and
23 there was a line of at least a dozen people waiting to
24 get my autograph for my book, this man appeared.

1 He came to the head of the line, just came
2 on up to the head of the line, which proved he didn't
3 quite have his manners --

4 (Laughter.)

5 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: -- he got in the head
6 of the line, and he said, "I want to apologize." He
7 brought his friend alone, and he said, "I had no idea
8 who you were."

9 His friend said, "I guess you won't do
10 that again, will you?"

11 He said, "No."

12 While that was somewhat unusual, I thought
13 I suppose I would have been satisfied. It didn't
14 satisfy me though because he had no business
15 prejudging, and I don't know --

16 MR. THOMAS: Nor any business in saying
17 you were okay because you were somebody special.

18 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Yes.

19 MR. THOMAS: That's no good either.

20 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: I just wanted to point
21 up -- mention to point up the context.

22 MS. WINSTON: Well, I think you've also
23 illustrated the power of education in that one
24 example. Two men, both with the economic means to be

1 in a hotel as guests; the other is the power of
2 education so that this man has now -- now understands
3 as a result of his exposure to you and to others that
4 it was an inappropriate thing to do.

5 We've talked about the fact that our
6 history has consequences, and probably 60 years ago,
7 Dr. Franklin, if you had been standing in that hotel,
8 you probably would have been the one to go get the
9 car.

10 Times have changed. The Council on
11 Economic Advisors published for the first time this
12 year as part of their President's economic report a
13 chapter on race statistics, and while it was -- the
14 council was able to demonstrate that things are
15 getting better in terms of the disparities that have
16 existed along racial lines in economic opportunity,
17 there is still a significant gap.

18 That is information, I think, that is
19 useful for us to have on a regular basis and can be a
20 measure of whether or not we are making progress.

21 We also know that there continues to be an
22 awful lot of racial isolation within our schools, K to
23 12 and higher education. The extent to which there is
24 the kind of exposure to others on college campuses,

1 for example, does have educational value.

2 Angela Oh and I participated in a panel
3 discussion about a week and a half ago. I think, in
4 this very room we were, and one of the panelists was
5 a white man who was in a corporation, small
6 corporation, but talked about his experience prior to
7 his current responsibilities in which he was one of
8 several partners in this business, all of them
9 graduates of the Harvard Business School, all of them
10 white, and he talked about how few new ideas they came
11 up with; that they basically were all were thinking
12 alike, and he compared that to his experience, current
13 experience, in which he has a very diverse group of
14 people, racially and ethnically diverse, employing
15 people who are also diverse in terms of their
16 educational background, not all Harvard Business
17 School graduates, and talked about the high level of
18 creativity and new ideas that people are coming up
19 with that are, you know, some of them, quite cutting
20 edge.

21 So this idea of education not only for the
22 benefit of people who have not been included, people
23 of color in many instances, poor people who may not be
24 people of color, is a benefit not only to those who

1 are coming to the table for the first time, but those
2 who have been there who have not had the benefit of
3 that exposure.

4 Again, these are things that are not new,
5 but things that certainly have come out in lots of the
6 dialogue that we've been exposed to or heard about,
7 and again, this idea of racial reconciliation means
8 people have to be talking to one another, sharing
9 ideas, overcoming the stereotypes that you have in the
10 absence of the direct exposure.

11 At the same time you need to be looking at
12 policies and institutional practices that have an
13 impact on the extent to which opportunities are made
14 available.

15 When I was talking about multi-pronged
16 approaches, I was talking about basically these two
17 tracks that have to be worked on, and probably in
18 terms of future responsibilities, there has to be
19 continued emphasis on both of those things.

20 It might be a useful thing at this point
21 if we had the report out on both the discussions of
22 education and economic opportunity because I think
23 already the conversation is clearly focused, in part,
24 at least on that.

1 So I would ask Governor Kean if you would
2 provide us with the economic opportunity -- I'm sorry
3 -- the education piece.

4 GOVERNOR KEAN: We had a very fruitful
5 discussion yesterday and came up with a number of
6 substantial proposals, which I'll try to summarize in
7 give minutes.

8 First of all, we believe that if we're
9 going to build one America, we have to overcome racial
10 disparities in educational opportunity and provide all
11 children with the highest quality education, and we
12 think we ought to do that emphasizing the earliest
13 years.

14 We believe that if you can succeed on
15 education, a lot of the other problems that we've been
16 talking about are going to go away naturally.

17 We also believe that meeting our goals
18 will require substantial commitment, and that as we
19 spend for education at the federal government level,
20 we must target those opportunities which need that
21 spending the most.

22 It makes no sense at all to have schools
23 for our poorest children be getting less resources.
24 It should be just the other way around, and we really

1 must try to educate our children in high quality,
2 integrated schools. Those of high quality and
3 integration are not mutually exclusive, but they're
4 complementary. You can obviously have a good
5 education in a school that's not integrated, but not
6 the kind of education you need to go into the next
7 century of a multi-cultural democracy.

8 Integrated schools are always better with
9 the same quality of teaching, always better than the
10 schools that are not integrated. In effect, isolated
11 schools in high poverty areas are our greatest
12 educational problem.

13 And there's no excuse for failing to meet
14 these goals for all our children. We know what to do
15 now. It wasn't like the '80s when we had some
16 questions about how to improve schools. In the '90s,
17 there are a number of good schools that work and
18 school districts that work around the country even in
19 high poverty areas.

20 We have to have the courage and
21 intelligence to follow suit and do those things so
22 that those benefits are extended to all of our
23 children.

24 There are four key areas that we

1 discussed. First of all, the school construction.
2 Many of our children are going to school in buildings
3 that are not adequate for teaching or for learning,
4 and we believe that the federal government could
5 explore additional funds for school construction in
6 areas of urban and rural poverty, and that substantial
7 federal funds should be provided in a matching grant
8 for the states.

9 There are massive programs in this country
10 for highway construction and for dams and for all of
11 those things. We happen to think schools are probably
12 even more important than those things.

13 Teacher preparation. We believe that the
14 government and work with higher education leaders and
15 the private sector to revamp and improve teacher
16 education. There is no point really in the fact that
17 our education schools are really the weak sister in
18 every single higher educational university or college.
19 They should be high quality programs. They should be
20 rigorous, and the people that go through them should
21 have the same respect as the people who go through any
22 other rigorous program at the university, and we
23 believe we must work with college presidents to insure
24 in the future that that happens.

1 We now have tracking in a great number of
2 schools. We think we can consult and share the best
3 practices with school districts to insure that
4 tracking is not implemented in a way that resegregates
5 students.

6 Also, the way tracking is implemented now
7 in a number of schools, it's really inconsistent with
8 our idea in this country of all students, all students
9 can learn if they're given an opportunity to do so and
10 high quality teachers.

11 Also we believe in strengthening the
12 pipeline, that we should explore efforts in addition
13 to the High Hopes initiative to strengthen the
14 pipelines in K-12 to higher education in the medium
15 and short term. We simply have to find more ways of
16 getting students who have the ability to do it into
17 institutions of higher education.

18 A few other key issues. As far as
19 American Indian schools, we have to insure adequate
20 funding through the Bureau of Indian Affairs to
21 schools that serve American Indian students. We don't
22 always do that at this point.

23 We believe also that in the coming
24 generation of technology, it's going to be important

1 for each and every student no matter what profession
2 they go into, and therefore, we must include access to
3 modern computers and other technologies, particularly,
4 particularly in high poverty schools, and we have to
5 make sure, by the way, the teachers know how to use
6 them themselves so they can teach the students.

7 We believe nothing is more important than
8 early childhood education, that there should be full
9 day Head Start and kindergarten available to all
10 students, and particularly, again, in high poverty
11 areas there should be school available for all four
12 year olds.

13 And we also believe on the expansion of
14 school choice, school choice as part of public school
15 choice. In a poor area, particularly in urban
16 neighborhoods, we believe that parents ought to be
17 able to make the decision as to which public school
18 their children attend.

19 I don't know if I -- I tried to keep to
20 five minutes, but there's a lot more here, but I think
21 that may be something that we can start with.

22 MS. WINSTON: Let me ask would you like to
23 go ahead and take the opportunity to have discussion?

24 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: I think we can go

1 through both subjects because I think they tie in.

2 MS. WINSTON: Okay.

3 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: I think we have
4 talked about how the 1960 civil rights laws have had
5 important effects on people of color and the same
6 opportunities that -- I mean, the opportunity that
7 those gave in regards to creating better jobs, a
8 living wage, and providing minorities a life in the
9 middle class of America, but in the following decade,
10 the minority workers experienced a decline in the
11 '80s, and the upswing in the 1970s certainly was a
12 downswing in those '80s because of the proportionate
13 number of minority people that benefitted from
14 manufacturing jobs and from the benefits of civil
15 rights law enforcement.

16 Unfortunately in the 1980s, the decline in
17 manufacturing and the reduction of law enforcement set
18 in, and of course, at that point, patterns of
19 occupational segregation emerged, and unfortunately
20 further solidified a weakening in labor market
21 institutions, such as minimum wage protection, labor
22 unions, and other protections, as well as a slow down
23 in educational attainment, and weaker enforcement of
24 anti-discrimination laws contributed to the increase

1 in racial disparities as seen in many of the attached
2 charts that we looked at as a subcommittee.

3 People who served with me on that
4 subcommittee were Angela Oh and Reverend Suzan Johnson
5 Cook.

6 We found and identified what we believe
7 are five challenges. By large numbers, minority
8 workers earn, of course, poverty wages. African
9 Americans, 40 percent of all; Latinos, 50 percent of
10 all worker and jobs that are paying minimum wage; very
11 poverty level wages that do not support a family of
12 four, and for the most part those jobs do not have
13 health insurance, pension coverage, benefits.

14 Our challenge comes to insure that
15 minority workers have access to jobs that pay a living
16 wage, not just minimum wage, but a living wage that
17 includes those benefits.

18 We found that the wealth gap is even
19 greater than the income gap. The wealth of a typical
20 white family is ten times the wealth of an African
21 American family or a Latino family. Of course, this
22 is a substantial wealth gap of great concern as, of
23 course, wealth determines whether you have health
24 insurance, pension coverage, whether you can own a

1 home or start a business. It becomes a major factor.

2 This level of racial and economic
3 inequality is a major part of the challenge facing our
4 country, and in the next century will be an issue for
5 all Americans including the private and public sector
6 who must address this issue.

7 We believe that education alone is not
8 enough. It is important. It is a major important
9 factor in the lives of all of our children. While
10 through the years there has been tremendous progress
11 in education for most minority groups, it has not been
12 fully or completely effective in closing the earnings
13 gap between minority workers and whites. The gap
14 persists at all educational levels, and unfortunately
15 has increased since 1979.

16 The fifth challenge for us, of course, is
17 that we emphatically state that the discrimination
18 persists. There's clear and current evidence that
19 active forms of racial and ethnic discrimination
20 persist in employment, in housing, credit markets, and
21 many other areas of social life. Eliminating these
22 persistent forms of racial disadvantage needs to be a
23 central commitment of the country to insure equal
24 opportunity.

1 Now, we've identified five areas where we
2 looked at for solutions. Tight labor markets are
3 necessary, but not sufficient. The economic expansion
4 over the last seven years has clearly increased job
5 opportunities for minorities. Over 13 million new
6 jobs have been created, and the unemployment rate of
7 African Americans has dropped to its lowest since
8 1973.

9 The poverty rate dropped its fourth
10 straight year in 1996, but the recent strong economic
11 growth, while it has been very, very important and
12 improved job opportunities and wages for people of
13 color, we still see wide disparities that continue to
14 exist, and that continuing the economic expansion is
15 necessary, but not sufficient to create the
16 opportunity to address racial disparities.

17 Labor market institutions need support.
18 Our experience from the 1980s tells us that without a
19 strong labor market and labor market institutions in
20 place, a rising tide cannot lift all boats.

21 Raising the minimum wage is the very key
22 element to increase the living standards of low wage
23 workers and, in particular, minority workers who hold
24 these jobs. When the minimum wage was increased in

1 1996 and '97, 13 percent of all African American
2 workers and 16 percent of Latino workers benefitted.

3 Collective bargaining and unions are
4 important in reducing wage disparity between minority
5 workers and white workers. Collective bargaining
6 helps eliminate discrimination in pay and raise wages
7 of low skill workers relative to high skill workers,
8 expanding our institutionalized support mechanism,
9 including the earned income tax credit for low income
10 families, equal pay, national labor relations
11 policies, and family and medical leave programs.

12 Strongly enforcing our anti-discrimination
13 laws is another of our solutions. Numerous studies
14 have shown that people of color continue to face
15 discrimination in hiring, in the housing market, in
16 the loan markets, and even from buying a car.

17 Expanding education and training will have
18 little effect when employers pursue misguided
19 restrictions on hiring, whether conscious or
20 otherwise.

21 Community initiatives are, of course,
22 very, very important. Programs and support are needed
23 to help provide support for community and neighborhood
24 associations or community associations based on

1 initiatives, reducing racial and economic disparities
2 and segregation within our metropolitan areas.

3 We believe that nonprofit organizations
4 will provide a major and indispensable tool for
5 revitalizing our communities and in many cases
6 reconciling our differences.

7 Another one of the issues and solutions is
8 involving and addressing the youth of our country.
9 Young people of color have simultaneously told us that
10 they both are hopeful for a better future for
11 themselves and their children, but also fearful that
12 they do not have the same opportunities to succeed as
13 whites. Even though they play by the rules, they have
14 said to us that they will still not get ahead as fast
15 or as far because of their race.

16 Young people of color have told us stories
17 about the discrimination they face in education and in
18 the job market and in their fears and legitimate
19 concerns. We need to address them in a serious and
20 sustained manner.

21 A final issue of concern to us, and I
22 think it's been discussed as far as the entire
23 Advisory Board, is that in regards to many key
24 indicators, the country does not have adequate data

1 covering the experiences of all major racial and
2 ethnic groups. I get it in every quarter that I go
3 that there are no statistics for other racial groups,
4 major statistics or African Americans and Latinos.

5 We, again, recommend that careful
6 attention needs to be paid to improving the collection
7 of regular data on the economic and social progress of
8 this country's diverse populations.

9 MS. WINSTON: Well, I have received the
10 two reports of the subgroups that met yesterday.
11 Would you like to elaborate any further on how you see
12 taking the concerns further into the future and how it
13 relates also to the earlier discussion about doing
14 post Initiative activities?

15 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: One of the things that
16 always interests me in a discussion of education is
17 that there's a fairly considerable segment of our
18 population that feels that this is a local matter,
19 that education is a local matter, and that the federal
20 government's interests should be very limited and
21 activities should be very limited in this.

22 I always had difficulty with that notion
23 for several reasons. One is that there are other
24 areas, as you've suggested, Governor Kean, that are

1 viewed just normally as national problems, highways,
2 for example, and the movement of commerce generally.
3 Of course, we've got some constitutional basis for
4 that and support for it, but I think education must be
5 conceived of as a national interest anyway.

6 How far we can go in that in supporting
7 that idea without additional legislation is a problem,
8 to be sure, but if we're going to have poor schools in
9 one part of the country and good schools in another
10 part of the country, it's not worse than having poor
11 schools in one part of a city and good schools in
12 another part of the city.

13 Our population moves all the time. We're
14 a moving people. We're here today and gone tomorrow.
15 We're in Maryland one day, and we're in Massachusetts
16 another day and in Washington State another day.

17 If we bring to our life in, say, the State
18 of Washington a poor education than we received in
19 another state, then we are not going to be able to
20 take advantage of the opportunities in our new
21 location, and we do move. There's no population in
22 the world that moves more than we do.

23 So it seems to me that's a natural
24 national responsibility that cannot be shirked, and we

1 have to put that cast on any program we have in the
2 area of education. To the extent that we can, we must
3 make this a national obligation, a national activity
4 so that regardless of where we end up living, we bring
5 with us the kind of education with the possibilities
6 to prosper in that community. I absolutely believe
7 that we have to do that some way.

8 GOVERNOR KEAN: I don't think there's any
9 question about the fact. The debate comes as to
10 whether or not the federal government should get
11 involved in the content of education, and most people
12 feel they should not be involved in that area, other
13 than to apply standards everywhere of what to learn.

14 But I know of no argument with anybody who
15 wants to help with things like school construction.
16 Nobody has ever suggested that the federal government
17 can stay out of providing funds so that people have a
18 decent place to go to school.

19 And the two areas that we're recommending
20 most strongly for federal intervention is, first of
21 all, that area, to help states rebuild schools that
22 are no longer adequate not only from the point of view
23 of teaching, but in many cases from the point of view
24 of health and safety as well so that teachers have a

1 decent place to teach and students have a decent place
2 to learn.

3 And the second area we're recommending is
4 in teacher preparation, that it be rigorous, that it
5 make sense, what you have to know to go into the
6 schools, and that the emphasis be on the lower grades
7 where every bit of research shows that the teacher is
8 most important.

9 I don't know and don't believe that those
10 people who object to federal intervention would object
11 in those areas. In fact, I suspect many of them would
12 be very supportive in both those areas.

13 So I don't see these as controversial
14 recommendations. Everybody wants to improve teacher
15 education. In many areas it's been a national
16 scandal, and we obviously can't have poorly prepared
17 teachers teaching our children, and everybody knows
18 that children can't learn in totally inadequate
19 schools, and yet for many of our poorest children,
20 that's what they have to deal with.

21 And without that help, many of the other
22 things we're talking about today just aren't coming
23 up.

24 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: There is a tendency

1 for policy to follow financial support. Would you
2 expect the federal government to pour X number of
3 billions of dollars into education without wanting to
4 say that we think the money ought to be spent this way
5 or that way? We think this ought to support a set of
6 national standards, let's say, and make certain that
7 the education in this state is similar to and has the
8 same standards that education in Massachusetts has.

9 GOVERNOR KEAN: I have always been a
10 believer in national standards personally. The
11 difficulty has been arriving at those national
12 standards outside of math and science. People debate
13 what the history standards ought to be, and they get
14 quite irritated with each other.

15 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Every man thinks he's
16 his own historian.

17 GOVERNOR KEAN: Yeah, exactly, and some of
18 the other standards. I believe if we can agree on
19 certain standards, then it's very important to install
20 those standards so that we can measure what a student
21 in Mississippi is learning compared to a student in
22 California or New York, and if the Mississippi student
23 is learning considerably less, then I think there's an
24 obligation to let the parents and the state know that

1 so that they can upgrade. Parents could demand at
2 that point that they upgrade if they had that kind of
3 information and knowledge.

4 But I think this -- I've always been for
5 that, but I think I would hate to see anything
6 substantial tied to monies for school construction at
7 the moment. The need is so great, and the difficulty
8 in doing it may be so great, as well, that I just --
9 it has to be done economically.

10 I mean to keep it in line, it's got to be
11 school construction funds. I don't think it can be
12 spent in areas of poverty, new poverty or old poverty,
13 but with that one stricture, I would just like to see
14 matching funds made available to the states the same
15 as they have been made available for highways and a
16 number of other priorities so that students can learn
17 and we can make progress.

18 MS. WINSTON: I just wanted to just take
19 a moment remind particularly our audience that this is
20 a brainstorming session, and I think we mentioned
21 explicitly earlier that the reporting out is basically
22 for Board members to consider, and there may, indeed,
23 be some interest in having us do a little bit more
24 research on some of these areas, generating more ideas

1 for the President, but that what have been called
2 recommendations, as I understand it at this point, are
3 not recommendations yet from the Board, but
4 recommendations from the subgroups for the rest of the
5 Board's consideration.

6 MR. THOMAS: I just wanted to ask a couple
7 of questions. One was, again, -- supports on the
8 dialogue that we had in the other -- in the first one,
9 but one of the things that we've noticed as we've gone
10 around and visited either individually or
11 collectively, and there seems to be a public-private
12 issue discussion at a lot of schools, particularly in
13 smaller communities that have had a lot of success in
14 the public schools.

15 They feel -- and I would say it's a
16 perception -- that because there's great community
17 support for the public schools rather than the
18 community largely supporting private schools and the
19 public schools being a stepchild, and I just wanted to
20 ask you, you know, if you discussed anything about
21 that in the subcommittee.

22 And then the other thing was just as you
23 left politics and reentered the education field, from
24 your vantage point, I just was interested in what your

1 biggest surprise was, what you saw in this area that
2 kind of surprised you as being a major impact in this
3 area.

4 GOVERNOR KEAN: Well, I don't think -- I
5 went, of course, to higher education, and most of my
6 life has been involved in K through 12. So I wasn't
7 surprised a lot.

8 I did visit a number of schools,
9 particularly schools that were educating children in
10 areas that were very difficult to try and determine
11 why it was that the school here worked and ten blocks
12 away was a school with a 50 percent dropout rate and
13 kids just not getting educated.

14 And I tried to identify the elements, and
15 generally it was a great principal, a man or woman who
16 just inspired that school, and parent involvement.
17 Those seem to me to be the only two real keys of
18 seeing what really worked in a difficult area.

19 And of course, a third element is
20 teachers. Where you don't have trained teachers,
21 where you don't have good teachers particularly in the
22 lower grades, children don't succeed, and where you do
23 and they have classes that they can handle instead of
24 mammoth classes -- smallness in education will get --

1 you some of the best educational experiments that I've
2 seen cut down these huge schools into livable units.
3 In fact, in one experiment the principal is supposed
4 to know every student and not just come to the
5 football game, but actually know every student, visit
6 classes, look and see what the teachers are doing and
7 be thoroughly involved in the life at the school, and
8 that's something, again, that works.

9 When you do that kids respond, and that's
10 why I said, you know, there are a lot of examples all
11 over the country of schools that work.

12 REV. DR. COOK: I think that parent
13 involvement goes back to what you were saying in terms
14 of whether the parents feel they have hope in this
15 society, whether there are opportunities there for
16 that next generation, and usually when there's a ray
17 of that, they tend to be more involved, and it's
18 directly related to that race-poverty issue because if
19 we feel that there's nothing to fight for, we kind of
20 just leave it to the system to do for your children.

21 And so they really are all intertwined.
22 The base of education, the heart of education brings
23 us back to our discussion where we started here a year
24 ago, that economics and education are the key factors

1 and the issue of race, and that they're the
2 inseparable trio in a sense. They all really walk
3 together.

4 GOVERNOR KEAN: And in many ways schools,
5 urban schools, the teachers are so committed that they
6 will go visit children at home. If the parents don't
7 come to the school, the teacher will go to the home.

8 In one school I talked about, it's
9 practice, for instance, that every term the teachers
10 at least call if they don't visit each and every
11 parent in the school and any student they have in
12 school because the connection, we know, between home
13 and school that is absolutely vital. The school can't
14 substitute for everything going on in the home. The
15 parent has got to be brought in.

16 And when they are brought in, education
17 appears.

18 MS. WINSTON: One of the consistent
19 comments that we heard not just here this morning, but
20 in most of the discussions that the Board has had at
21 its meetings and outside of its meetings is the degree
22 of similarity in aspirations around the country
23 regardless of who you're talking to in terms of race
24 or ethnicity, either social class even, and I wonder

1 that, you know, given that experience -- and I think
2 I'm correct in saying that we were all in this to a
3 person, and I think to a person have made that
4 response -- I'm wondering what, in light of the common
5 set of aspirations that people have, what is it that
6 is preventing these common goals from being the source
7 of action for policy making and diagram for producing
8 and to achieve that.

9 What should the Advisory Board and others
10 be looking for in terms of overcoming some of the
11 challenges without trying to harness those --

12 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Resources, resources,
13 it seems to me. I'm not at all certain that this
14 nation is committed in terms of providing facilities,
15 physical facilities. We're not really talking about
16 hundreds of millions of dollars or going into billions
17 of dollars to shore up our schools, the dilapidated
18 conditions that we see in many parts of the country.

19 I just think that that's a hard, cold fact
20 that we have not yet been willing to commit ourselves
21 to the expenditure of resources to make it possible
22 for our children to have decent physical facilities.

23 I know that in some parts of the country
24 they are sent home when it's too hot. They don't have

1 any air conditioning, and they're sent home when it's
2 too cold. They don't have enough heat, and somehow
3 they just make it through the school year on what they
4 call good days, days in which they don't have -- when
5 it's not too hot and not too cold.

6 That, it seems to me, is not a
7 satisfactory basis for establishing and maintaining
8 the educational system in the country that's the
9 richest country in the world. It just doesn't make
10 any sense to me.

11 GOVERNOR KEAN: If we turn things --
12 you're absolutely right -- things on its head also, I
13 mean, any kind of logic, I mean, anything people would
14 think as logical, where should you put the most
15 dollars?

16 You should put the most dollars where the
17 children have the greatest need because they need more
18 resources in order to bring themselves up to the
19 starting line and get that educational opportunity,
20 the opportunity we've all been talking about.

21 That's not what we do. We spend more
22 dollars on the students who need it less, and the
23 richer districts are the ones that have the greater
24 resources. It makes no sense at all.

1 And we know from the research also that
2 the most important years are the earlier years. If
3 you start in school at four years old and go through
4 kindergarten, those elementary years are the most
5 important. If you can give kids a start there, they
6 can go on and have a good chance of succeeding.

7 And yet we pay people more in high school.
8 We recognize high school teachers more. People in the
9 elementary school are in and out all of the time, are
10 not as well trained. Most kids don't even have the
11 same teacher for the entire year.

12 So, again, the research shows one thing.
13 We do the opposite, and all we have to do really in
14 the area of education now -- and this is what's
15 frustrating when it gets into education reform -- all
16 we have to do now is follow the practices which the
17 research shows we ought to be doing.

18 There are a number of good educators who
19 have done this. It's being done with a number of
20 schools in Baltimore. The same thing is happening in
21 Chicago and Detroit, things that work.

22 All right. Why can't we scale it up? It
23 works there. It can work in other places, and it's a
24 matter of will now. It's not a matter of knowledge.

1 We know what to do to make a school that's failing
2 into a good school. Whether or not we have the
3 political will to do it is another question.

4 We also know, by the way, that resources
5 -- we can't do it without resources. We also know
6 that's not enough. We've got to get into these other
7 areas of in a sense reorganizing the school for
8 learning, making sure that teachers are well trained,
9 making sure that we have a principal who knows how to
10 run a school, making sure of parent involvement,
11 making sure that there are standards for kids.

12 All of these things enter into it, with
13 the resources, but together we know how to do it.
14 We're just not doing it. We know how to do it.

15 REV. DR. COOK: That's where the faith
16 institutions are feeling the most weight because as
17 the children are sent home on those cold days or those
18 hot days and the parents aren't home, you know, they
19 go to the faith based institutions, and then because
20 their resources are so limited, you find the faith
21 institutions having to set up the after school
22 programs, trying to catch up what they didn't learn
23 that day in school.

24 So it's a tremendous load, and that's

1 where the pressure is being felt because the resources
2 haven't been adequately given to the institutions
3 either in terms of making it available for them to do
4 the right kind of program.

5 So they're trying to play catch-up with
6 people whose lives are at stake. It's a real issue in
7 terms of what's happening, and we do know what to do.

8 MR. THOMAS: Another thing is it's a
9 little bit of the chicken and egg, but I'll take the
10 chicken approach here, and that's salaries. If you
11 take a matrix of payment of an educator in California
12 where they max out in education and years of service,
13 that approximates from the training level salary that
14 people get when they enter industry.

15 And so when people come out of college en
16 masse, it's where do they head. They head to the jobs
17 which pay 40, 50, \$60,000 a year, and there are jobs
18 that do that and more, and yet the education jobs
19 don't.

20 So if we were to say that the most
21 important thing for this country is to educate our
22 children, we don't reflect it in the way we compensate
23 those who do, and we rely on their self-generosity and
24 self-sacrifice to make it happen, and it's just not

1 the right thing.

2 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: Robert, would you
3 like a job with the union with me?

4 (Laughter.)

5 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: I just made that
6 statement. I don't know how we can afford you though.

7 (Laughter.)

8 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: But, you know,
9 that's also very clear and important when it comes to
10 tying in the education piece to the economic situation
11 when you provide living wages, the opportunity to live
12 in a better neighborhood, the opportunity to provide
13 your children with a college education.

14 You're bringing the economic factor into
15 the equation of education. I rode to Brookings, South
16 Dakota. I told this story yesterday, and sitting next
17 to me was this very, very young baby. I mean he was
18 18 years old, but he had such a baby face and so
19 polite, "yes, ma'am," "no, ma'am." He was from Texas
20 like I was, a very polite young man, and he was
21 going --

22 (Laughter.)

23 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: -- he was going to
24 a job with IBM, a full-time job straight out of high

1 school with the computer software program in IBM.

2 And I said, "So you're not going to
3 college?"

4 He says, "Maybe later on."

5 And I said, "So this is a full-time job.
6 This is not a summer job?"

7 And he says, "No."

8 And someone -- I can't remember -- one of
9 my panel members said, "Yes, but what kind of
10 opportunities did that young man have in his high
11 school," you know, availability of computer, maybe a
12 computer in the home, and when we lack that kind of
13 resource in the home for the child or the resource in
14 the schools, and it's absolutely amazing. I've been
15 involved with the Net Day hook-ups across the country
16 and the empowerment of impoverished areas in schools.

17 And they say, "Our school is hooked up."
18 Well, the school may be hooked up to one computer in
19 the library. So the opportunity for those children is
20 not there where there should be computers in every
21 school room, not just in the library, and maybe if the
22 kids get there at six o'clock in the morning, they'll
23 get a chance to get on that computer and get a job
24 when they're 18 years of age to go to a 50, \$60,000

1 job automatically out of high school.

2 So economics is so tied into it because
3 the opportunities will not be there, because it's
4 going to depend on where you live and what you're able
5 to afford to give your children, unless you have good
6 paying jobs, good benefits that can provide above
7 poverty wages in this country.

8 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: How much for that
9 young man?

10 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: I didn't ask him,
11 but he said he was going to be living in a hotel for
12 a while. So the company's going to pay his hotel
13 room. I would imagine that they are, but absolutely
14 at 18 years of age going into computer software.

15 And I think there was a story even in the
16 Post where there was a 17 year old senior who was not
17 going to college and was earning \$50,000 a year part
18 time working in computer software during his last year
19 of high school.

20 I can just imagine what he would pull in,
21 and like I said, he wasn't going to go to college. He
22 was going to walk out of there with the possibility of
23 a job close to \$100,000 a year, full time.

24 GOVERNOR KEAN: Let's hope later on he'll

1 go on to college.

2 (Laughter.)

3 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: The young man that
4 I sat next to said, yes, he hoped he picked up, but
5 even if he doesn't, you don't think that that company
6 is going to continue to provide him some continuing
7 education in that field? And I think that's one of
8 the things that we'd like to see, is more and more
9 companies investing in the workers that they have on
10 training and education programs to provide them upward
11 mobility because we now have the argument of workers
12 that are being asked to come into this country because
13 of the skill factor when, in fact, we haven't provided
14 the opportunity of training our own, sort of like
15 growing them ourselves from the current work force and
16 providing the opportunity that they can move up within
17 their company without seeing those better paying jobs
18 going to someone else.

19 GOVERNOR KEAN: It's not only that
20 problem, but I didn't realize this a couple of years
21 ago. We always look at corporations that are going
22 overseas to get low wages for their workers. Well,
23 that's not the only problem. I've found out now that
24 some of the high tech companies you're talking about

1 are going overseas because there are more skilled
2 workers.

3 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: More skilled
4 workers?

5 GOVERNOR KEAN: And they cannot find the
6 workers they need in this country, so they go to a
7 place like Singapore where they know people getting
8 out of school are trained to take the kind of jobs
9 they need.

10 And when you're seeing people move out of
11 this country because we don't have enough skilled
12 young people in this country, that is a terrible sign
13 for our future.

14 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: But in addition to
15 that, we're burning them out. In Silicon Valley, when
16 we did a town hall meeting in San Jose, we had workers
17 who were working 80 and 90 hours a week earning big
18 money because they earned -- it was contract work. I
19 mean they were out there as private, individually
20 contracted folks working in that industry and earning
21 a lot of money. Unfortunately no benefits, no days
22 off, no anything, and they were burning themselves out
23 because we're not training companies or wanting to
24 bring in outside workers, to pay them less.

1 You know, we have the reverse, not just
2 companies going over and trying to find cheap work,
3 but companies that are here that want to keep the work
4 here importing skilled workers so that they can pay
5 them less in this country rather than training their
6 own.

7 GOVERNOR KEAN: We've got a choice in this
8 country which we've got to make either consciously or
9 subconsciously in the next five years. We are either
10 going to become a low wage, low skill economy, much
11 like some of what we call the Third World countries,
12 and that's going to be our future, or we're going to
13 become a high skilled, high wage country.

14 And the difference is going to depend on
15 what we do in education and training. If we don't do
16 some of the things that we are talking about here and
17 some of the things that some of the school reformers
18 are talking about around the country, I will tell you
19 our future for our children in this country is not
20 going to be great. Low skilled, low wage economies
21 don't do very well for their citizens.

22 Plus which I think in that kind of society
23 it's going to have implications for the preservation
24 of democracy. It's that serious.

1 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: And even less -- in
2 my report I mentioned the wealth gap. We're talking
3 about African Americans versus whites, Latinos versus
4 whites. White are at the level of \$47,740 versus
5 Latinos at 46 -- I mean 4,656, and African Americans
6 at \$4,418, ten time, ten times a higher, and by a
7 proportionate number minorities are way at the bottom
8 of the barrel in regards to that issue.

9 MS. WINSTON: I think it would be very
10 important to point out at this point that this Board
11 has, in fact, made some recommendations to the
12 President on this score that offer, I think, great
13 promise.

14 One particularly important is the support
15 and recommendation with respect to the Hispanic
16 education program. We know, of course, that we are
17 looking at demographic changes that suggest that the
18 percentage of Hispanic Americans will almost double in
19 the 21st Century at the same time that the situation
20 where Hispanic students are experiencing
21 extraordinarily high dropout rate, being pushed out in
22 many instances from schools.

23 The Hispanic education program is targeted
24 as a result of a study, many of the recommendations,

1 but also recognition from some of the experts that you
2 talked to at several of our meetings.

3 The other program, of course, the high
4 wage program which Dr. Franklin mentioned earlier,
5 which is designed to insure that children in middle
6 schools, high schools get early counseling, mentoring,
7 as well as information about the financial assistance
8 available to them to go on to college.

9 And come close to closing the gap in high
10 school graduation rates between white and black
11 students, there's still a fairly substantial gap, as
12 I've indicated, with Hispanic students, and we have
13 all too limited information about other groups.

14 So I think that this is something that
15 perhaps the Advisory Board may want to think about how
16 those particular recommendations could be built upon
17 in light of today's discussion and additional research
18 that we would have the staff look at for your
19 consideration.

20 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Well, I think that
21 these education initiatives, which we've undertaken
22 and which the President has stated will take long, are
23 important. Since we're mentioning it, I think we
24 ought to remind ourselves that quite early on the

1 question of the President to increase the corporations
2 and, of course, to put in enforcement of civil rights,
3 the EEOC and other civil rights agencies, and that has
4 become part of his budget, and also the whole matter
5 of enforcement of housing which is related in some
6 ways to what we've been talking about. That's gone
7 on, too.

8 So already our recommendations are taken
9 on by the President. He's proceeded to initiate
10 programs as we've requested that he do so, and I would
11 think that we would be, Governor Kean, one of the
12 persons most interested in picking up on education
13 since he's already involved in the high school
14 Hispanic education, but there would be others that
15 would be pushed on his desk, and we will certainly do
16 that.

17 REV. DR. COOK: I think early childhood
18 and the child care issues, those are very important
19 because we do have to come to it earlier, and if a
20 parent has been in poverty, they're going to need the
21 child care help to be able to get on their feet. As
22 we look at the welfare-to-work programs and all of
23 those, it's very important in terms of all of the
24 transitional pieces to help get the child in school

1 and help get the parent on their feet.

2 So those early childhood initiatives are
3 going to be really critical.

4 GOVERNOR KEAN: And I think everybody
5 knows it, but it's worth saying that what we are
6 spending now on people with a failed education is an
7 enormous cost to our society, but what we are spending
8 on welfare, we are spending in prisons, what we are
9 spending in health care, what we are spending on all
10 the kind of costs that a person brings about when they
11 don't have an education, can't get a good job, not
12 developing any social behavior, that's an enormous
13 cost to us each and every year.

14 And it goes without saying that if we can
15 do what is right and what the research shows is right
16 in the educational area, particularly for those first
17 four years, a lot of those people in the future will
18 be leading productive lives and be contributing to our
19 society instead of costing our society..

20 REV. DR. COOK: And trained for a skill
21 that is needed today so that they won't end up back in
22 an institution.

23 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: We have a very basic
24 philosophical difference in our country with respect

1 to how you handle this in our society, and this is
2 what's clear, that is, that there are people who
3 believe that jails are more effective in arresting the
4 problems of society than educational programs. They
5 simply believe it, and they're in the position to do
6 something about it.

7 The big five star hotels in our big cities
8 -- and my own city has spent more for jails in the
9 last five or eight years than they've spent on hotels
10 or than on education, that is, increased and improved
11 education.

12 And I don't know what we can do, but
13 surely we need to use part of this education to
14 educate the community on the very point that you make,
15 that the greatest returns can come from improvement of
16 the conditions of our young people.

17 GOVERNOR KEAN: I don't know if people
18 really focus in on the numbers, but we couldn't even
19 get spending per child in a lot of our poverty areas
20 up to 10,000 per child. It costs five times that to
21 keep somebody in prison. You know, we're spending
22 \$50,000 later on for the kid that we wouldn't spend
23 \$10,000 on early on, and it doesn't make any economic
24 sense.

1 And if you want to get even the human tax
2 on what that child could be if properly educated and
3 properly trained, look at the economics of it. It's
4 going to be enormously costly, and those funds could
5 be better spent in other ways.

6 REV. DR. COOK: There was a great line at
7 the last faith forum. We were talking about how we
8 give what's not asked for in the community, how we
9 always respond with what we feel they need as opposed
10 to what the need is, and he was sharing that a lot of
11 the African American men in the Philadelphia area were
12 hanging out. They would come to a church and, you
13 know, they would ask, "What do you need?"

14 And it's a job. So they create a council,
15 et cetera, and then they come back next year and they
16 said, "What do you need?" Jobs, and the create
17 midnight basketball.

18 (Laughter.)

19 REV. DR. COOK: You know, so it's always
20 something that will pacify you or say that we did
21 something, but not the response that's needed, and so
22 we've got to really, as we go towards the 21st
23 Century, respond to the needs as they actually are.
24 Don't just pour money where it's not needed, and

1 respond to the actual needs: jobs, race issues, and
2 education. Those are the issues.

3 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: My only addition to
4 that is let's make sure that they're quality jobs.

5 REV. DR. COOK: Exactly.

6 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: You know, years ago
7 when people showed up for a job, it was an expectation
8 that that job would have health insurance; that it
9 would provide a pension; have days off, you know,
10 vacation, build up sick leave.

11 Now you show up for a job, and you're
12 lucky to get a salary for that and above minimum wage
13 slightly or at minimum wage, no health insurance, no
14 pension plan. They will give you a 401(k), but it's
15 your money that you're saving for yourself rather than
16 perhaps a contribution. You can have all the days off
17 that you want. You may not have a job when you come
18 back because you probably did get paid for those days
19 off, and you'll have no sick leave, et cetera.

20 It's also the quality of the jobs that
21 provide, again -- you know, people say, "Well, if you
22 have a job, you can pull yourself up by the
23 bootstraps."

24 Not necessarily, because on many occasions

1 people are holding down two jobs to make one because
2 the salaries just are not being paid. We're talking
3 living wages, jobs, not midnight basketball, but
4 quality jobs as well.

5 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: This Board has two
6 senior consultants. Laura Harris, who was
7 unfortunately unable to be here this morning, was here
8 yesterday, and the other is Professor Christopher
9 Edley, who is here and who I feel is invited to make
10 any comments that he would like to make since he is
11 sitting here and looks very willing to--

12 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: I see his face
13 moving.

14 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: -- participate.

15 (Laughter.)

16 DR. EDLEY: I would make just a couple of
17 suggestions. One is that I think it would be very
18 valuable, albeit difficult, for you to in giving your
19 advice to the President to try to suggest some
20 priorities.

21 My own view, and there can be disagreement
22 about this, and maybe you ought to talk about it, but
23 my own view is that it's going to be very difficult
24 for your advice to him, much less for his book, his

1 report to the American people to have as much impact
2 as we would like if it's a laundry list, if it is so
3 comprehensive that it is lacking in focus.

4 And I think, you know, those of us who
5 have been in or around politics appreciate that you've
6 got to have a fairly focused message if you're going
7 to break through all of the noise and get people's
8 attention.

9 So while appreciating that it's a very
10 difficult discipline both intellectually and
11 politically to pick priorities, I think you would be
12 doing him a great service if you would suggest to him
13 what you believe those might be.

14 If there's a short list that he is going
15 to emphasize in what he says to the nation on this
16 issue, what should be on that short list?

17 Now, there may be then a follow-on of how
18 to fill out his portfolio, how to fill out the set of
19 recommendations, the work plan, if you will, but
20 focus. That's point number one.

21 Point number two is on the education issue
22 specifically, I think it would be very useful if you
23 would wrestle either now or later a little bit more
24 with this question of federalism and input of the

1 federal government simply because it will, of course,
2 be said, you know, by the folks that reporters call up
3 to respond to what you've been talking about; they
4 will say, of course, "Well, the federal government
5 doesn't have a role, that big of a role in education
6 and shouldn't."

7 To stay in local responsibility, the
8 federal government will spend six cents on every
9 dollar to spend on education, and all of the rest of
10 that.

11 So I think that some consideration by you
12 about what it is that you see the federal role ought
13 to be, but also since the President wants to talk to
14 the nation not simply about what the federal
15 government's agenda should be, but on what the work
16 plan is for everyone, federal, state, and local,
17 public, private, et cetera, what the pieces of this
18 education agenda that you've been talking that you
19 think ought to be put as challenges to other actors.

20 So this whole federalism issue, the
21 public-private issue, I think your thoughts on the
22 division of labor would be helpful.

23 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Do you see it only in
24 the area of education or other areas?

1 DR. EDLEY: Well, other areas, but I mean,
2 I sensed from you -- I mean, my guess is, just
3 listening to your conversation -- my sense is that
4 that's one where you think really a qualitatively
5 greater kind of attention and energy is needed by
6 society to get us on track in closing the opportunity
7 gap.

8 And I don't know that the other
9 recommendations that you're talking about pose as
10 sharp a challenge to what people perceive as the
11 existing set of responsibilities, arrangements.

12 We all know that there's federal, state,
13 public, private roles in job creation and job training
14 and many of these other things, but I think for the
15 kind of boldness that you're talking about in the
16 education agenda, you're really suggesting -- it
17 sounds as though you may really be suggesting a
18 rethinking of roles, and I just want to get out on the
19 table what you mean by that.

20 There are many, for example, who would
21 say, "Look. If this is going to continue to be
22 primarily a state and local responsibility, the
23 President's role is really quite limited and ought to
24 be quite limited, that he shouldn't be climbing into

1 the bully pulpit unless he's going to put scores of
2 billions of dollars of federal money into it."

3 Do you agree with that? Are you
4 suggesting scores of billions of dollars of new
5 federal money? Are you suggesting that the President
6 ought to climb up in the bully pulpit even if all he's
7 trying to do is exercise political leadership, moral
8 leadership in encouraging state, local, private sector
9 to do what they ought to be doing?

10 GOVERNOR KEAN: I'll take a crack at that
11 because I think in many discussions yesterday we're
12 not suggesting a change in the federal role as far as
13 the content of what children learn. We were
14 suggesting that the federal government has an
15 obligation in areas that have nothing to do with what
16 children learn, but the place in which they learn;
17 that those people who are scared of the federal
18 government and think the federal government has a
19 secret plan to get things into kids' heads that local
20 communities might not want should not be troubled by
21 that because it will not disturb the basic
22 relationship between state and local and the federal
23 government, and have matching construction funds
24 available.

1 The other area we thought the federal
2 government should be involved, perhaps through the
3 reauthorization of a Higher Education Act, the federal
4 responsibility, and there are a lot of federal funds
5 going to higher education, is teacher preparation.

6 Again, that should be a federal role to
7 insure that our institutions of higher education are
8 not neglecting what should be one of their prime
9 responsibilities, and in many cases they are. They're
10 putting it off and sending this to the side and it's
11 not important at our institution and that's not a
12 school with value.

13 And the people who go there are of less
14 quality, as are the teachers. The federal government
15 has a right to say we can't tolerate that, and we're
16 giving so many federal funds and so much help to a
17 number of these institutions.

18 Some of the other things we talked about,
19 I think the whole area of tracking is to my mind
20 almost a moral presentation. I think the President
21 can talk about that.

22 One of the roles I always thought of the
23 states, the states are the ones who had to follow that
24 through. I always thought one of the main roles for

1 the Department of Education was in research because
2 that's one thing the states don't do. They don't do
3 really a lot of research on what works, and the
4 federal government and the department can do that
5 based on national examples.

6 And I would suggest that for the President
7 in his bully pulpit and for the Secretary of Education
8 to say that research clearly shows that we're putting
9 the emphasis in the wrong place, that it should be in
10 the early years.

11 That's the job of the federal government.
12 The states don't do that.

13 As I said, I don't think we're talking
14 about a fundamental change in the others. We are
15 suggesting that the President use the bully pulpit to
16 articulate the research which everybody really
17 basically acknowledge, and to provide funds for what
18 is a clearly terrible mess and in need right now
19 because they're not getting met, which is the
20 rebuilding of crumbling schools without which all of
21 the other things we're trying to do can't happen.

22 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: The Congress, and
23 unfortunately it's the upper house, has a somewhat
24 different view about its role for it has commented on

1 content in every way and insists that not merely that
2 if it's going to put money into something that it has
3 something to say about the content, but even if it
4 doesn't put any money in it.

5 Note what they did last year with respect
6 to the national history standards. They voted 99 to
7 one to disapprove the national history standards
8 established by the historical profession itself, and
9 the one person who voted against it, he voted against
10 it because it wasn't strong enough, not that he was
11 opposed to it. He was in favor of voting it down, but
12 he thought it wasn't strong enough.

13 Now, this is the temperament you have.
14 They aren't going to put that much money that we're
15 talking about, that you're talking about unless
16 there's something to say about what this house is to
17 be used for that you're going to be making so
18 beautiful.

19 GOVERNOR KEAN: Although my memory of the
20 particular thought in the history standards, that that
21 was a vote against a federal role because they looked
22 at the history standards and speakers on the floor
23 said that, you know, a lot of people and things that
24 we think are very important in American history are

1 not part of the standards. Children will not be
2 learning this and that and the other.

3 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Well, that's the whole
4 point.

5 GOVERNOR KEAN: And therefore, we're not
6 going to try to establish -- we're not going to try to
7 intrude ourselves. What we're going to do is say that
8 the federal government is not allowed to intrude
9 itself in this area at least until they come back with
10 standards --

11 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: That we want.

12 GOVERNOR KEAN: -- that we want.

13 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: It will be what we
14 want. So they're intruding themselves.

15 GOVERNOR KEAN: But I think the first vote
16 was not to intrude because they didn't approve of the
17 intrusion.

18 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: I think the first vote
19 was to disapprove of the content.

20 GOVERNOR KEAN: Well, it went to
21 disapprove of the content, but this content wasn't
22 done at the state and local level. This content was
23 done at the federal level.

24 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: It was national.

1 GOVERNOR KEAN: But some people even in
2 the area of math and science, where people agree on
3 the standards in Congress, are just against any
4 national standards, that they all ought to be state
5 and local.

6 What I'm saying is that some of the things
7 we're suggesting don't get into that. It has nothing
8 to do with standards or content or anything else to
9 say that the child should be able to live or go to
10 school in a building that's got a fire alarm and that
11 there's fresh running water.

12 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Heating.

13 GOVERNOR KEAN: And have got a classroom
14 they can sit in without discomfort, and water is not
15 dripping on their head every time it rains.

16 So I don't think we get into that debate,
17 but that's a very thorny debate you're talking about,
18 but I don't think we have to get into that one.

19 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: We don't have to get
20 into that, but I think if we ask for X number of
21 hundreds of millions of dollars to house the program,
22 they might want to know.

23 MR. THOMAS: The part of the discussion
24 that I couldn't understand, and I think I can ask it

1 in a way that doesn't require you to state your
2 personal opinions --

3 GOVERNOR KEAN: I've never had a problem
4 with that.

5 (Laughter.)

6 MR. THOMAS: But I guess for some people.

7 When I look at this issue, the way
8 corporations would address an issue like this, they
9 would say it is of such a scope and such a magnitude
10 that we have to have a national approach to it. So
11 let's say we have many outlets across the country, and
12 they would acknowledge that there certainly is local
13 interpretation to a certain degree, but they would
14 still have output standards and input standards --
15 reverse that: input and output standards -- and there
16 would be a culture that would be expected to be
17 maintained and on and on.

18 And I would submit that not knowing the
19 argument against it, when I first came into this
20 Initiative and we started thinking and talking about
21 education, I started out with exactly the same
22 position as the Chairman, and that was this is such a
23 societal issue, and it's probably one of the more
24 overriding things facing this country. Therefore,

1 society has the obligation to step it up and be
2 responsible in total for it, which means then that it
3 is elevated to a centralized -- and I don't want to
4 attribute it to -- but it's elevated to a centralized
5 control, measurement, assessment, nurturing, et
6 cetera, et cetera.

7 And yet, as we got into it, we ran
8 headstrong into this, "Yes, but the states feel
9 absolutely mandated and morally and every other way
10 that that's their issue."

11 Could you just state the rationale against
12 the societal responsibility, the rationale?

13 GOVERNOR KEAN: Well, it starts not even
14 at the state level, but at the local level. Every
15 parent in a sense like to insure that they have some
16 control over the way their children are educated and
17 the way that's supposed to be whether it's through the
18 school boards, through PTAs and all of that. It
19 doesn't always work, but at least the philosophy is
20 there.

21 Most states have in their constitutions
22 the responsibility for the education of children in
23 the state, some of them to their sorrow because
24 they've never been sued because they weren't

1 performing their function properly.

2 So it's always the federal government
3 provides a very small amount of the money, five or six
4 percent, for education. States and locals provide the
5 rest. So from all of these points of view, it's
6 always thought to be state and local responsibility.

7 States are like people. Some of them are
8 rich states. Some of them are poor states. It's much
9 harder for states that don't have the economic power
10 to put the necessary resources into the education of
11 children, and therefore, we have poor states that
12 don't have very well educated children.

13 I've always thought the federal government
14 should try to even up the playing field in that
15 area -- that's my personal point of view -- with some
16 help, but I guess what I'm arguing is that we don't
17 have to -- and the Congress, every time the federal
18 government talks about standards, doesn't think of it
19 in terms that you and I do perhaps that we could have
20 a standard for excellence, but a lot of them think,
21 well, they're going to use these standards to say our
22 children should learn this and our children should
23 learn that.

24 And that's not what we want in this

1 community. We would rather have them learn math and
2 reading and so on rather than this or that which might
3 or might not be commanded by the federal government.
4 Therefore, let's keep local control of education, and
5 that's something that's very deeply ingrained in this
6 country, and we're not going to turn that around, and
7 maybe we shouldn't.

8 But there's no way that the states and
9 local governments can come up with the necessary
10 resources in many cases to deal with such a massive
11 program such as the rebuilding of urban schools and
12 schools in rural poverty. That becomes a different
13 matter because you're not intruding in local control.

14 The federal government obviously who's
15 going to supply a lot of the money has a right to say
16 certain standards have to be met in construction. You
17 have to have certain things written into the bill to
18 make sure that the money doesn't go into somebody's
19 pocket and really goes to the children in those
20 schools to build the schools.

21 But it doesn't get into content. It
22 doesn't get into the federal government mandating
23 anything, except hopefully that you follow certain
24 logical procedures in building the schools to make

1 sure the taxpayers' money is well spent.

2 But this whole question of what's local
3 and what's state and what's federal is something we're
4 going to be talking about in this country, I think,
5 for a long time to come.

6 Some of us believe that you can end some
7 places on that spectrum and some believe others, but
8 I don't think -- I may be totally wrong -- but I don't
9 think that you're going to get into that argument when
10 you provide funds for school construction.

11 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: That doesn't go with
12 the point that I raised quite some time ago, namely,
13 that the population right now is going to be moving
14 around; that perhaps would be desirable to have some
15 kind of common set of, common bond of knowledge that
16 would make it possible to live a couple of years in
17 Arkansas or in New York or in -- on and on, because
18 people just move all the time, move from here to
19 there, stay ten years here, maybe five years somewhere
20 else and so forth.

21 And in the same way that we need to speak
22 the common language, we need to have a set of body of
23 information that is common to us, and if we don't have
24 similar educational programs in Arkansas to what we

1 have in Massachusetts, then we won't have equal that
2 have a common body of knowledge and can negotiate in
3 one community as well as in another.

4 It seems to me to be very important.

5 GOVERNOR KEAN: I think it's very
6 important, and I think it should be. The argument has
7 come over what those should be. Even within those who
8 believe as I do that there should be national
9 standards, there's great argument over the content of
10 those standards.

11 And I think if we ever get beyond that and
12 resolve it and get a general agreement, as we have in
13 math and science, by the way, for some of the
14 humanities, then I think we can move on national
15 standards, but until that kind of fight, such as the
16 one you described in the history standards, gets
17 resolved, no, I think it's going to be too
18 contentious.

19 By the way, one of the other things among
20 states that's, I think, terrible is the teachers can't
21 move their credentials around. If you're a teacher
22 and I'm certified in New York to teach, and I'm
23 certified in New Jersey to teach, I can't teach in
24 Pennsylvania. So if there's some reason for my family

1 to move from Texas, from California or anyplace else,
2 I'd have to go right back and take courses or whatever
3 to presumably teach whatever.

4 And I think teacher's credentials ought to
5 be movable also because as families move, you've got
6 to be able to pursue your livelihood in whatever state
7 you go to. If you're a great teacher in one state,
8 certified, you ought to be able to teach in other
9 states as well. That's not the way it is.

10 MR. THOMAS: It just seems like, again, if
11 we could tackle the issue and solve it once, it would
12 be more productive to the country than tacking 100,000
13 or a million situations across the country.

14 If we avoid it, somebody has to resolve it
15 and we leave it to be resolved, I think we never get
16 to that pipeline issue. So if we expect the pipeline
17 to result in something and yet it's a random process
18 to establish what that pipeline is, and yet there's
19 that expectation that there's going to be people
20 coming out of the pipeline qualified to go into this
21 school, how do we --

22 GOVERNOR KEAN: And, you know, again, the
23 shame is that it isn't what it used to be. We
24 questioned seriously what you should do ten years ago.

1 We didn't know. So we tried a whole bunch of school
2 reforms then, some of which worked, some of which
3 didn't.

4 But out of that era of experimentation, a
5 number of governors, one of whom was Bill Clinton, out
6 of all of that experimentation came the sort of things
7 that do work, and the researchers are now agreed as to
8 what you should do and what you have to do if you want
9 to create a good school, no matter where that school
10 is, rural, urban, whatever, what you have to do.

11 So we know what to do. We have the path
12 laid out for us, and shame on us if we don't do it.
13 That's the question right now. Do we have the
14 political will to do it.

15 Some of it costs money. A great part of
16 it doesn't cost anymore money.

17 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Well, we have done a
18 lot when we've explored this whole problem of
19 federalism as opposed to local content and control.
20 We haven't said very much about the other matter that
21 our consultant suggested, namely, the priorities. I
22 mean, in our recommendation perhaps we ought to think
23 about that and make some suggestions there.

24 I want to call our attention to the fact

1 that we have not done much. We've got a lot of things
2 on the table, but to put it in the order that is
3 advertised, perhaps we may do that.

4 Well, we've been going back and forth for
5 a good portion of the morning, and I think that we
6 ought to give each member of the Advisory Board an
7 opportunity to make some kind of final wrap-up
8 statement on the issues.

9 Where's Angela?

10 MS. WINSTON: I hope she will return
11 shortly. Her computer says she shortly will return.

12 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Robert, do you want to
13 start? Any final statements you want to make?

14 MR. THOMAS: Yes, I'd be happy to. Would
15 you like to limit the comments to the assessment of
16 this meeting?

17 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: No, no.

18 MR. THOMAS: Well, maybe you'd like me to
19 tell you about my summer vacation. No.

20 (Laughter.)

21 MR. THOMAS: My thoughts go from this
22 meeting to the summation of our efforts in the form of
23 recommendations to the President, and I think that
24 we've done a lot of good work in exploring and

1 exposing some of these important areas, and we've got
2 the germs of some good ideas in here.

3 And I think that between now and the next
4 meeting, you know, we can play out with the Initiative
5 staff and the consultants -- they've really put some
6 good work towards maybe tracking some of those and
7 coming up with a list of priorities that maybe we can
8 talk about next time.

9 I believe that there's a lot of
10 expectation for what we'd come out with as people have
11 talked to us individually about where we're going. I
12 think there's a great deal of expectation, but I think
13 in many ways perhaps when it's all said and done, I
14 think we can meet a lot of the expectations.

15 So I remain that our form of
16 recommendations will yet address a lot of the issues,
17 and our priorities will yet focus in on some of the
18 key things that the President can bring up to society,
19 the American people.

20 So I would just state that probably my
21 overriding comment here would just be in the face of
22 a very strong reality that there are problems and
23 issue out there, that I think we can participate in
24 the great movement forward on those issues.

1 REV. DR. COOK: I think that this has been
2 great. The expectations have been high in terms of
3 what is expected, but I think that one of the
4 highlights for me was going to Oxford, Mississippi,
5 where years ago African American students could not
6 cross the common areas, and to see an entire community
7 working together and saying, "We want to live
8 together, we want to work together."

9 So I think what our Initiative has done is
10 pique the consciousness of American. The promises and
11 practices that we've seen have heightened my hope to
12 show that America is more hopeful than not.

13 But it would be a shame for the year that
14 we've had to not be preserved, all of the experiences,
15 all of the activities we've participated in. We need
16 to not just pique the consciousness. We need to go
17 forward.

18 And so I just hope that we'll have a
19 larger discussion on the formation of the
20 recommendation to the President on appointing a
21 council because I think it's going to be important to
22 go beyond what we've done and to continue the
23 discussion and the solutions to, you know, really
24 making America one America in the 21st Century.

1 MS. CHAVEZ-THOMPSON: I share both the
2 same optimism, the same views that Suzan and, I think,
3 the rest of the Board, and Robert share.

4 I end by saying very much what I started
5 out in saying a year ago, and that is that economic
6 opportunities for workers to work themselves out of
7 poverty, to work their children into an education and
8 provide a level of prosperity for their families
9 depends on their economic conditions.

10 Having spent the last year talking and
11 looking at the opinions of so many Americans, whether
12 it's on the issue of poverty or stereotyping or
13 education, work place discrimination, and hearing the
14 stories as we traveled across the country has made me
15 a bigger advocate of having a continuance of our
16 dialogue.

17 This Advisory Board having been formed and
18 ending its job on September 30th has absolutely
19 nothing to do with what we continue to do as
20 individuals, whether we represent organizations or
21 whether we represent ethnic minorities or whoever we
22 represent. This dialogue has to continue. This
23 conversation needs to continue.

24 We need to do our part whether it's at the

1 educational level in creating a conscience for America
2 that we must deal with the issue of race in this
3 country, and we must provide the better tomorrow that
4 we all hope to have for our children, and most
5 especially in the future generations, of our
6 grandchildren.

7 So I feel very optimistic that we've done
8 the beginning, and I've always said that this is Phase
9 1. What ultimately will be Phase 2 and Phase 3 is up
10 to the people, not just perhaps the people in this
11 room representing their organizations, but the people
12 across America representing their interests and their
13 generation in what happens in America tomorrow.

14 GOVERNOR KEAN: I think as we start to
15 wrap up our work, we've got to remember where we
16 began. I used to say -- well, as Dr. Franklin used to
17 say, this is a problem that has affected America
18 since, I think, the Constitution, and he has educated
19 me that it was a problem in this country 100 years
20 before that.

21 So I now say quite accurate it's been a
22 300 year experience, the problem of race and ethnicity
23 in this country, and it has been the one stain going
24 across an otherwise glorious history.

1 We have made a start. We have talked to
2 a number of people, visited with a number of people
3 individually and collectively, tried to get a
4 national conversation started in a number of areas.

5 We've covered a number of the problems
6 that we know have been around this problem of racism,
7 from discrimination in housing to education, to law
8 enforcement. We have not covered one that I think the
9 Commission agrees with me that we ought to cover
10 before we adjourn, and that's the problem of the media

11 Almost every group we've gone to has said
12 the media is a problem that has to be addressed.
13 Children get more information from the media
14 unfortunately than they do from schools. So how they
15 treat the problem of race is very, very important, and
16 I think we must address that before we give our report
17 to the President.

18 But to me what's vital here is the
19 following. We are simply at the beginning. In fact,
20 if I can quote Churchill, this is not the beginning of
21 the end, but should be properly the end of the
22 beginning.

23 That is where we should be right now, and
24 all of us are going to be writing and helping on the

1 report, but not only is there a strong follow-up by
2 the President and the administration, that the
3 Congress becomes involved in the debate, and that it's
4 going to take that kind of a massive effort if a 300
5 year problem is going to start to be put under
6 control.

7 So my wish, hope and, I guess being an
8 optimist, expectation is that following the work of
9 this commission there will be a major follow-up work
10 at all levels of the government.

11 MS. OH: I want to make my closing remarks
12 first to acknowledge the very hard work of our staff,
13 who I think we assembled -- Judy, you assembled an
14 extraordinarily talented group of people to come
15 together from all disciplines and walks of life, who
16 under an enormous amount of pressure had to perform in
17 ways that I think none of us could predict when this
18 started, and it's been really a pleasure working with
19 them.

20 They've been professional; they've been
21 dedicated; they've been committed. They have hung in
22 with us during periods of real doubt at least in my
23 mind that there was even a point at which I thought
24 what am I even doing here; maybe I should depart, and

1 that's how rough I think it has been.

2 And I also want to thank the rest of you
3 on the Advisory Board because, you know, yesterday
4 really was the first time in many months that we had
5 the chance to talk to one another in a substantive
6 way, and I'm sorry Governor Winter isn't here because
7 throughout I think he and I have traveled the most
8 together in doing the outreach to the public, and it's
9 been a really growing experience for me.

10 I came to this task with a very serious
11 mind about I believe -- you know, Sun Tzu wrote a book
12 thousands of years ago that people who do a lot of
13 organizing in the community have read. It's called
14 The Art of War, and it is truly an art.

15 I think we are in a war, you know, against
16 racism in this country. I take it very seriously.
17 When I was a young person, you know, I did all kinds
18 of things which my parents, who were immigrants and
19 who really believed in the promise of America,
20 couldn't understand at all. I mean I stepped so far
21 out of bounds I went so far as to even find myself
22 being arrested for public protest and refusing to
23 enter a plea and forcing the D.A. and the county to
24 take us to trial because what was it about? It was

1 about, you know, the investment of our funds at the
2 University of California in the government of South
3 Africa.

4 And as a lawyer I've tried, you know, when
5 I first started out to be very committed to
6 understanding my craft and my responsibility to the
7 system, this government, our Constitution, my clients
8 in the first instance, but I always felt strongly that
9 we had a role as attorneys in this society to bridge
10 a gap to the community.

11 And as a person who sits on this Advisory
12 Board, I can't say it's been a pleasure. It's only
13 been a pleasure knowing you and getting to know the
14 staff that we work with, but the media, I think, is
15 cruel. I think they're full of doubt and derision and
16 distrust, partly cultivated, I think, by the political
17 climate here in what you call "the Beltway."

18 It's plenty for me to come here and see it
19 once a month and experience it, you know, once a
20 month, but I have learned that there is this huge not
21 just racial divide, but there are regional divides.
22 I've always understood the class divides, and yet I
23 feel like I belong to this country, and I have an
24 important role to play as a second generation woman of

1 Korean descent to articulate the stories from people
2 that look like me, but know that she's as American as
3 anybody sitting in this audience.

4 And some of the things I say are perceived
5 to be outrageous. They're not outrageous. I'm
6 exploring possibilities with people.

7 John Hope Franklin and I -- this is a man
8 who's twice my age, lived twice my life, and had ten
9 times the experiences that I will ever encounter, I
10 think, in the area of race and racism in this country,
11 and I was so hurt to see that the very first headline
12 about our meeting was that there's a divide.

13 Nobody ever asked me what was going
14 through my mind when John Hope pointed out that in the
15 late 1600s there was a case, and we learned about this
16 disparate treatment even then, and I have to tell you
17 that in my mind I really perceived it not as an
18 African American man speaking to an ethnic Korean
19 woman, but as an elder reminding a youngster -- I
20 think I'm one of the youngest. Maybe Suzan and I are
21 about the same -- to say, you know, "Don't forget,
22 child, where you're coming from and what this country
23 is about."

24 And I've actually kept that in my heart as

1 I've gone from place to place to place. I do believe
2 we're engaged in a task that's about reaching the
3 hearts, not just the minds, of America, and when we
4 started, I think we've started.

5 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Thank you.

6 I think that our Executive Director has
7 some comments that she would like to make.

8 MS. WINSTON: I would. Thank you very
9 much.

10 I thank you all for your comments,
11 especially your comments about the work of the staff,
12 which has been extraordinary. It's a wonderful staff.

13 We're not finished yet. We have some
14 distance to go. This has been a very important
15 meeting to begin to collect your thoughts, your
16 preliminary recommendations which we will be working
17 with you on this summary as you compile your
18 recommendations and your report to the President to
19 complete your advice giving responsibilities.

20 I think that we all are now even more
21 chastened than we began with understanding how huge an
22 issue we've taken on, you've taken on certainly, and
23 you all have done it in addition to all of your other
24 responsibilities in life, and I think that that is

1 very important for everyone to understand that you took on
2 essentially at least two or three additional jobs to
3 the one that you came to this Advisory Board with in
4 which you continue to occupy.

5 The one thing that I think is important to
6 say, as well, is that this is an educational process.
7 It has been an educational process for everyone, and
8 we've all done a lot of learning, and I think that
9 will be reflected at the end of this as we do come to
10 the end of the beginning and learn how this effort
11 will be taken forward.

12 I do want to say there is some interest in
13 knowing what is next. This meeting we have been
14 calling the last regular meeting of the Board in that
15 we have planned over the next several weeks some
16 special engagements for you in which there will be an
17 opportunity, I think, for you at least in some
18 groupings to talk about, to continue to talk about
19 these issues.

20 The President, of course, is going to be
21 participating in a round table discussion on race on
22 July 8th on PBS as part of the Lehrer New Hour, and
23 members of the Board have been invited to participate
24 in a discussion of race and health issues, which the

1 Department of Health and Human Services is going to be
2 hosting in Boston on July 10th. That will provide an
3 opportunity for some continued discussion.

4 July 13th, the Carnegie Endowment is
5 hosting a meeting for this Board to discuss the
6 immigrant experience, which will, of course, provide
7 an opportunity to continue to learn about and to
8 discuss some of the very issues we started out this
9 meeting with.

10 The corporate business community will meet
11 again on -- I think the new date we're looking at is
12 July 23rd in St. Louis to discuss, again, a number of
13 the issues that have been mentioned here.

14 There will also be a meeting of the Board,
15 a culminating event, in September -- the date is still
16 to be determined -- which will provide perhaps the
17 last opportunity to continue this discussion before
18 the charter of the Advisory Board ends.

19 So I just wanted to make clear that there
20 will be other opportunities, perhaps not in this
21 particular kind of configuration, and I wanted to take
22 this opportunity again to -- a point of personal
23 privilege -- to thank you for being so accessible.

24 We have, I think, helped to run you

1 ragged, but I also have to say that each of you has
2 indicated at some point that as tired as you are from
3 your travels, that you've found them quite rewarding
4 and understanding that there is a high level of common
5 hopes and dreams among people of all races,
6 ethnicities, classes, et cetera, in this country, and
7 the question we have to figure out is how to harness
8 those hopes in a way that makes it clear that we need
9 to move as one towards fulfilling the promise of
10 America.

11 Dr. Franklin, thank you for this
12 opportunity, and let me turn this back to you.

13 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Well, thank you very
14 much.

15 Let me say, first of all, that since we
16 perhaps will not be meeting again in this setting, I
17 want first to extend -- yes?

18 MS. WINSTON: I'm sorry. There is one
19 thing --

20 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Please.

21 MS. WINSTON: -- I did forget to say that
22 is very important for me to remind this audience and
23 this group, and that is that we are also pleased to
24 say that the American Indian community is going to be

1 participating on August the 5th and 6th in a White
2 House conference on economic development I will not
3 be able to speak to the details.

4 It is a conference that is the result of
5 a collaboration between many agencies within the
6 federal government and Indian Country. That does, I
7 think, require also a statement to the effect that
8 this Initiative, the President's Initiative, has been
9 very concerned about making sure that and discussing
10 inclusion, and in working towards inclusion we have
11 reached out to Indian Country, and members of this
12 Board have traveled to Indian Country and have
13 participated in several meetings with tribal leaders.

14 Angela Oh will be participating tomorrow
15 in a discussion with the American Indian journalists
16 in Phoenix, Arizona.

17 The challenge that we have faced is to
18 recognize the unique status of American Indians in
19 this country and the special sovereignty relationship
20 with the federal government, at the same time
21 recognizing that American Indians, like other
22 communities of color, have faced racism and are as
23 concerned about the way in which their status had been
24 affected by racism in this country.

1 That discussion will continue as well, and
2 I just thought it was important to make that as clear
3 as possible particularly since Laura Harris, who is
4 our senior consultant, was unable to be with us today,
5 and I think that she would have wanted to make a
6 statement. This is certainly no substitute for a
7 statement that she would have made, but I think it was
8 important to raise it.

9 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Thank you. Thank you
10 very much.

11 First of all, since perhaps we will not be
12 meeting in this setting again, I want to thank the
13 Executive Director without whom I could not have
14 functioned as effectively, if that's the word you use,
15 as I have been able to, and I certainly would want you
16 to know that I'm deeply grateful, first, for your
17 giving up your position temporarily with the
18 Department of Education to come to lead us, and the
19 leadership you've provided.

20 And similarly, I would say that with the
21 great staff that we have had, without whom we couldn't
22 have worked, they've called me at nine o'clock some
23 evenings and given me a new assignment, and I've said,
24 "Well, where are you?"

1 "We're in the office."

2 And they sometimes ask for my assistance,
3 and I say, "Sure, from nine to five."

4 (Laughter.)

5 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: She's fortunate, I
6 guess.

7 (Laughter.)

8 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: But you have been so
9 generous with your time and your effort to import your
10 resources and your great talents that I could not have
11 functioned without you.

12 Now, this meeting today has taken on a
13 slightly different form from some of our other
14 meetings, but this has been important, particularly
15 for those of us who are members of the Advisory Board
16 to have the opportunity to exchange our views, ideas,
17 and notions about where we go from here.

18 We haven't had these opportunities very
19 often. Some of them say we haven't really had this
20 opportunity since we sat around the fish tank in San
21 Diego last June, but we hope that this won't be the
22 last time.

23 We also hope that this has stimulated the
24 members of the Board so that the suggestions now that

1 they've made will be taking shape so that we can enjoy
2 your contributions to the final report that we'll be
3 making to the President.

4 I think this meeting presented challenges
5 that we as a Board and as individual members need to
6 continue to work over the next few months in order to
7 bring about the kind of conclusions and
8 recommendations that we need to make.

9 I think it's quite clear -- certainly it's
10 clear to me and I think clear to my colleagues on the
11 Board -- that in these last 12 months we have been
12 able to stimulate discussion, to urge rather
13 successfully in some instances, for the nation to look
14 at the problems of race and the related persistent
15 problems of education and economic disparities, and to
16 think of the ways in which we might tackle these
17 problems and make some recommendations to the
18 President for a continued effort to resolve them.

19 The President himself has taken a very
20 great leadership in this areas in this period of time,
21 this last 12 months, particularly in addressing
22 matters of education, matters of economic opportunity.
23 I'd like to remind ourselves that each month I have
24 written to the President and talked about the problems

1 that we face, reported to him about the results, made
2 recommendations and suggestions to him, and that each
3 and every month he has responded and has put in place
4 suggestions that were made, whether they had to do
5 with problems of housing, problems with enforcement,
6 legislation, whatever. He has acceded to our
7 requests, accepted our recommendations, responded
8 generously, and has carried forward the
9 recommendations that we have given him.

10 We should be giving more extensive
11 recommendations as we draw up our report to him, and
12 I have no doubt that these will be received in the
13 same spirit and the same manner that he has received
14 our periodic recommendations.

15 I believe that this year we have succeeded
16 in some of the efforts, not all of them, but some of
17 the efforts that we have made to bring about an
18 awareness of the problem to the nation and to various
19 parts of institutions.

20 I hope that we can persuade the country
21 and certainly the President that this effort must be
22 carried on. It must be institutionalized in some way
23 so that it will continue long after those of us who
24 have been participating the last few months have

1 passed off the scene.

2 We know that there are several important
3 directions that we must go, and we will articulate to
4 the President directions that we think we ought to go
5 or the country ought to go.

6 There are on miraculous solutions to these
7 problems. As an historian, I am quite aware of the
8 way in which the long stretch of history shows change
9 even when it's not discernable to the naked eye.
10 There are changes, and there will be changes from here
11 on out, and I believe that if we work diligently and
12 hard in the next few months and weeks, we can bring
13 about some recommendations and some suggestions that
14 will make the things that we have seen this year
15 flower into really important and significant changes.

16 So I want to thank all of you for your
17 cooperation. I want to thank the audience for its
18 cooperation and its goodness. I want to thank all of
19 you for your forbearance.

20 GOVERNOR KEAN: Mr. Chairman, let me just
21 say one thing before we --

22 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: Yes.

23 GOVERNOR KEAN: Your leadership is
24 extraordinary because you have taught us that you can

1 have great passion for a subject and nevertheless
2 exhibit grace and tolerance and civility, and that
3 should carry through more of our public debate.

4 Thank you, sir.

5 (Applause.)

6 CHAIRMAN FRANKLIN: The meeting is
7 adjourned.

8 (Whereupon, at 11:56 a.m., the Advisory
9 Board meeting was concluded.)

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18